#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS BROWNSVILLE DIVISION

STATE OF TEXAS, et al.,	
Plaintiffs,	) )
v.	Case No. 1:18-CV-68
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,	, )
Defendants,	) )
KARLA PEREZ, et al.,	, )
Defendant-Intervenors, and	) ) )
STATE OF NEW JERSEY,	) )
Defendant-Intervenor.	)

#### **APPENDIX**

#### **VOLUME III: EXHIBITS 21-22**

Pursuant to this Court's Civil Procedures, Rule 9, Defendant-Intervenor State of New Jersey hereby provides the Court with the following table of contents and copies of the documents and authorities cited in its Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment:

Ex.	Description	Page
	VOLUME I	
1.	Memo. from Chad Wolf, Acting Sec'y of Homeland Sec., to Mark	NJAPP001
	Morgan, Senior Official Performing Duties of Comm'r, U.S. Customs &	
	Border Prot., et al. (July 28, 2020)	
2.	Memo. from Joseph Edlow, USCIS Associate Director, to Associate	NJAPP010
	Directors and Program Office Chiefs (Aug. 21, 2020)	
3.	Excerpts from Federal Defendants' Objections and Responses to	NJAPP021
	Defendant-Intervenors' Fifth and Sixth sets of discovery requests (Sept.	
	30, 2020)	
4.	Federal Defendants' Responses to Interrogatory No. 15 (Sept. 30, 2020)	NJAPP030

5.	Email from Victoria Palmer, USCIS Media Affairs Division, and attached Response to Query guidance document (Aug. 24, 2020)	NJAPP037
6.	Email from Brandon Robinson, USCIS Adjudications Officer (Policy), "Re: DACA Filings After 9/5/17 – No Prior Grant of DACA"	NJAPP047
7.	Email from Brandon Robinson, USCIS Adjudications Officer (Policy), "DACA Filings After 9/5/17 – No Prior Grant of DACA" (Apr. 26, 2019)	NJAPP049
8.	Email from Victoria Umoru, USCIS Adjudications Officer (Policy), "Implementing the DACA Memo issued by USCIS Deputy Director for Policy Joseph Edlow" (Aug. 22, 2020)	NJAPP052
9.	Excerpt from Brief of the National Education Association and National PTA as amici curiae in support of Respondents in <i>DHS v. Regents</i>	NJAPP056
10.	Excerpts from Brief of Former Service Secretaries, Modern Military Association of American, and military and veteran advocacy organizations as amici curiae in support of Respondents in <i>DHS v. Regents</i>	NJAPP075
11.	Excerpt from Brief of Teach for America, Inc., as amicus curiae in support of Respondents in <i>DHS v. Regents</i>	NJAPP094
	VOLUME II	
12.	Excerpts from Brief of Association of American Medical Colleges et. al., as amici curiae in support of Respondents in <i>DHS v. Regents</i>	NJAPP104
13.	Excerpt from Brief of Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law, the Anti-Defamation League, the Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights, and 42 other social justice organizations as amici curiae in support of Respondents in <i>DHS v. Regents</i>	NJAPP125
14.	Excerpt from Brief of 143 U.S. business associations and companies as amici curiae in support of respondents in <i>DHS v. Regents</i>	NJAPP133
15.	Excerpt from Brief of 127 religious organizations as amici curiae in support of respondents in <i>DHS v. Regents</i>	NJAPP142
16.	Nikko Trading of Am. Corp. v. Wastemasters, Inc., No. 98-48, 2000 WL 284190 (N.D. Tex. Mar. 14, 2000)	NJAPP150
17.	Declaration of Khristina Gonzalez	NJAPP154
18.	Declaration of Jack C. Chen	NJAPP166
19.	Declaration of Maria Hernandez	NJAPP181
20.	Declaration of Elzbieta Wojtylo	NJAPP186
	VOLUME III	
21.	Declaration of James "Ike" Brannon	NJAPP192
22.	Declaration of Meg Wiehe	NJAPP340

Dated: November 6, 2020

#### GURBIR S. GREWAL ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEW JERSEY

By: /s/ Mayur P. Saxena

Assistant Attorney General (admitted pro hac vice) 124 Halsey St., 5<sup>th</sup> Floor Newark, New Jersey 07101 PO Box 45029-5029

Phone: (973) 648-3283 Fax: (973) 648-4887

Mayur.Saxena@law.njoag.gov

Melissa Medoway, Deputy Attorney General (admitted pro hac vice)
Eric Apar, Deputy Attorney General (admitted pro hac vice)
Elspeth Hans, Deputy Attorney General (admitted pro hac vice)
Tim Sheehan (admitted pro hac vice)
Attorneys for Defendant-Intervenor State of New Jersey

# Exhibit 21

#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS BROWNSVILLE DIVISION

STATE OF TEXAS, et al.,	)
Plaintiffs,	)
v.	) Case No. 1:18-CV-68
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,	) )
Defendants,	) )
KARLA PEREZ, et al.,	) )
Defendant-Intervenors, and	) ) )
STATE OF NEW JERSEY,	) )
Defendant-Intervenor.	) ) )

#### **DECLARATION OF IKE BRANNON**

- I, James Isaac (Ike) Brannon, declare as follows:
- I am currently an economist and president of the consulting firm Capital Policy
   Analytics. I also have an affiliation with the Jack Kemp Foundation.
  - 2. I received my MA and Ph.D. in Economics from Indiana University.
- 3. I was an economics professor in the University of Wisconsin System from 1994 to 2002. In 2001 I was granted tenure and promoted to associate professor.
- 4. Since then I have worked in Washington D.C., for the Office of Management and Budget (2001-2002), the Congressional Joint Economic Committee (2002-2005), the Senate Finance Committee (2005-2007), the U.S. Treasury (2007-2008), the Republican Policy

Committee of the U.S. Senate (2009), and the House Energy and Commerce Committee (2009-2011).

- 5. In 2008, I was chief economist for the John McCain for President campaign.
- 6. I have co-authored, along with Logan Albright and M. Kevin McGee, several studies on the economic consequences of the termination of Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA).
- 7. In 2011, Albright received his master's degree in economics from Georgia State University, and he has worked as a policy analyst in Washington, DC for the last five years, including in positions at think tanks and policy organizations such as the American Action Forum, FreedomWorks, and Free the People. From 1982-2016, McGee was a professor of economics at the University of Wisconsin Oshkosh. He is now retired.
- 8. Albright, McGee, and I investigated the economic and fiscal costs that terminating DACA would impose on the federal government, and on the economy as a whole. We published that research in January 2017. The report is available at <a href="https://www.cato.org/blog/economic-fiscal-impact-repealing-daca">https://www.cato.org/blog/economic-fiscal-impact-repealing-daca</a>.
- 9. In February 2018, McGee and I published a study entitled "A New Estimate of the Cost of Reversing DACA," which appeared as a Cato Institute Working Paper. The report is available at <a href="https://object.cato.org/sites/cato.org/files/pubs/pdf/working-paper-49.pdf">https://object.cato.org/sites/cato.org/files/pubs/pdf/working-paper-49.pdf</a>, and a true and correct copy of that study is attached as Exhibit A.
- 10. In July 2019, McGee and I published a study entitled "Estimating the Economic Impacts of DACA." The report is available at <a href="https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\_id=3420511">https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\_id=3420511</a>, and a true and correct copy of that study is attached as Exhibit B.

- 11. In the 2018 and 2019 studies, we estimated the educational attainment, earnings, and state and federal tax payments of the DACA-eligible population. To estimate the impact of DACA, we first estimated these values assuming that DACA is made permanent. We then estimated the same values assuming DACA is terminated. Our estimated impacts are the difference between these two estimates.
- 12. We estimated the high school graduation rates of the DACA-eligible population, based on Census data for Hispanics and on studies that show that illegal status reduces graduation rates about 10%.
- 13. The Census data for Hispanics is a reasonable proxy for the DACA population as a whole because, according to USCIS, about 93% of DACA recipients come from Mexico, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, Peru, Ecuador, Columbia, Argentina, Venezuela, Uruguay, Bolivia, Costa Rica, Chile, Nicaragua, or Panama. 88% come from Mexico, El Salvador, Guatemala, or Honduras.
- 14. We also estimated college enrollment rates and college graduation rates, based on Department of Education data and on studies that show that illegal status reduces college enrollment rates.
- 15. By 2027, all DACA-eligible residents will have earned a high school degree or equivalent. This is a requirement for continued DACA eligibility.
- 16. In our 2019 study, we estimated that if DACA continues, by 2033 about 55% of the DACA-eligible population will have attended college, and 24% of the DACA-eligible population will have college degrees.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The DACA-eligible population refers here to the population eligible for DACA under the Department of Homeland Security memorandum entitled "Exercising Prosecutorial Discretion with Respect to Individuals Who Came to the United States as Children," dated June 15, 2012.

- 17. This is a very conservative estimate, since the Census department estimated in 2017 that by the age of 34, 36.4% of all Hispanics who graduate from high school will have earned college degrees.
- 18. We used Bureau of Labor Statistics data on Hispanic employment to estimate the employment/population ratio for this DACA-eligible population over the next ten years, available at <a href="https://www.bls.gov/charts/employment-situation/employment-population-ratio.htm">https://www.bls.gov/charts/employment-situation/employment-population-ratio.htm</a>. We used estimated age-earnings profiles to project forward average earnings profiles for each of these DACA-eligible groups—*i.e.*, DACA-eligible residents who only finish high school, DACA residents who attend some college but do not graduate, and DACA-eligible residents with college degrees—should DACA be renewed.
- 19. Our estimated earnings profiles for DACA high school graduates and for DACAeligible residents with some college were based on Department of Education estimates of
  Hispanic earnings by education, and by studies estimating age earnings profiles by educational
  attainment.
- 20. To estimate starting salaries for DACA recipients with college degrees, we received data from Thedream.us on its population of approximately 3,000 scholarship recipients. Thedream.us is a nonprofit that provides financial and other support to DACA recipients attending college. We used the information on their choice of major and institution and expected graduation date to project an average starting income for each student, using income data from the financial technology company payscale.com, which surveyed 2.3 million graduates at over 2,700 colleges to calculate the average starting income for a student based on the student's major and the institution the student attended.

- 21. We averaged these individual starting incomes to estimate the average starting income for DACA recipients who graduate from college. This is in Table 1 of our 2018 paper on page 9.
- 22. In our 2019 paper, we adjusted this estimate downward to align it more closely with Department of Education estimates of average earnings for Hispanics with college degrees, while taking into account that DACA recipients attend universities in states with a median household income 5.28% higher than in the country as a whole.
- 23. We re-estimated all of these age-earnings profiles should DACA be terminated, based on studies that show that illegal status reduces employment rates by about six percentage points, and reduces the returns to education by nearly half.
- 24. From this, we estimated that, if DACA continues, the DACA-eligible population will earn \$437 billion from 2020 until 2029 and that they will pay \$102 billion in federal taxes, which includes payroll taxes. This data can be found in table 14 on page 29 of our 2019 report.
- 25. However, we estimated that if DACA is terminated, the DACA-eligible population will earn only \$316 billion from 2020 until 2029 and that they will pay \$30 billion in federal taxes, which includes payroll taxes. This data can be found in table 14 on page 29 of our 2019 report.
- 26. This disparity mostly reflects the increased productivity and earnings of the DACA college graduates who would continue to have legal employment status. People without legal work status in the U.S. are mainly limited to low-skill, off-the-books work arrangements in food preparation and construction, which pay much less than employment available to college-educated workers.

- 27. Our 2018 study used a somewhat different methodology, but its findings were broadly consistent with the 2019 paper: under DACA, this population will acquire more educational capital, be more productive, earn more income, and pay more taxes than if DACA were eliminated.
- 28. We use our 2019 numbers to estimate the impact that rescinding DACA would have on aggregate income for state residents and on state tax revenues in New Jersey and Texas.
- 29. To do so, we multiply the reduced national income resulting from DACA's rescission by the share of the DACA recipients in each state.
- 30. We use the Migration Policy Institute's ("MPI") 2018 estimates of the total DACA-eligible population in each state, available at <a href="https://www.migrationpolicy.org/sites/default/datahub/State-County-DACA-Estimates">https://www.migrationpolicy.org/sites/default/datahub/State-County-DACA-Estimates of DACA-Eligible Population\_2018.xlsx. MPI estimated that in 2018 New Jersey had 65,000 DACA-eligible residents (3.77% of the total DACA-eligible population) and Texas had 254,000 DACA-eligible residents (14.73% of the total DACA-eligible population).
  - 31. We also adjusted for the relative income of workers in each state.
- 32. Median household income in the U.S. was \$60,366 in 2017, the last year for which data had been released when we published our 2019 study.
- 33. In 2017, New Jersey's median household income was \$80,088, 24% above the national median, and Texas's median household income was \$59,206, 8% below the national median. This data comes from the U.S. Census Bureau's American Community Service Brief titled Household Income 2017: <a href="https://www.census.gov/library/publications/2018/acs/acsbr17-01.html">https://www.census.gov/library/publications/2018/acs/acsbr17-01.html</a>. It was the most recently available data at the time that we published our 2019 study.

- 34. Consistent with this data, our analysis assumes that a DACA-eligible person in New Jersey or Texas would earn 24% more and 8% less, respectively, than the average corresponding DACA-eligible resident in the U.S. This would apply to college graduates as well as to those with less education.
- 35. Given these assumptions, we estimate that the loss of income to Texas residents from rescinding the DACA policy would be \$16.32 billion over the next decade, and for New Jersey residents it would be \$5.66 billion over the next decade. These estimates assume that the DACA-eligible population would be employed only as undocumented workers and would not have work authorization if DACA were terminated. These numbers are in Table 15 on page 30 of our 2019 report.
  - 36. We also estimated the lost tax revenue to each state from ending DACA.
- 37. To do this we computed the ratio of additional aggregate income projected to be earned by DACA-eligible residents in both New Jersey and Texas over the next decade provided DACA continues, to the aggregate personal income of each state's residents. We applied that ratio to state property, sales and income tax revenues for 2015, the most recent data available at the time of our study.
- 38. The result would be \$623 million in reduced property taxes and \$712 million in lost sales taxes for Texas over the 10-year period from 2020 to 2029 (Texas has no income tax), for total tax losses of \$1.335 billion over the next decade, assuming DACA-eligible residents remain in Texas and work illegally. This data is in Table 15 on page 30 of our 2019 report.
- 39. Applying the same standard to New Jersey, we estimate it would lose \$285 million in property taxes, \$136 million in sales taxes, and \$335 million in state income tax revenue for a total loss of revenue of approximately \$756 million over the next ten years if

DACA-eligible residents remain in New Jersey and work illegally. This data is contained in Table 15 on page 30 of our report.

- 40. What's more, foreign-born workers are, statistically, more mobile than workers born in the U.S., which means they are more likely to relocate in communities where there is a genuine shortage of workers. This undermines the notion that their jobs could easily be filled by native born workers.<sup>2</sup>
- 41. In summary, the rescinding or rollback of the DACA program would have a significant negative fiscal and economic impact on the country, and would disproportionately affect the states in which DACA recipients are most prevalent, including Texas and New Jersey.
- 42. Attached as Exhibit C is a list of my publications over the past decade and a list of all other cases over the past four years in which I have testified as an expert at trial or by deposition. This list is current as of July 15, 2019.
- 43. I am to be paid \$300 per hour for this declaration and \$300 per hour if I am to give a deposition.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and complete to the best of my knowledge.

James Isaac Brannon, Ph.D.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See, for example: "Immigrants Equilibrate Labor Markets: Evidence from the Great Recession," <a href="https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4991313/">https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4991313/</a>

## Exhibit A

## A New Estimate of the Cost of Reversing DACA

By Logan Albright Ike Brannon M. Kevin McGee

February 15, 2018

#### CATO WORKING PAPER

No. 49



Cato Working Papers are intended to circulate research in progress for comment and discussion.

Available at <a href="https://www.cato.org/workingpapers">www.cato.org/workingpapers</a>.

#### A New Estimate of the Cost of Reversing DACA

Logan Albright<sup>1</sup>
Ike Brannon<sup>2</sup>
M. Kevin McGee<sup>3</sup>

February 15, 2018

#### **Abstract**

We obtained data on the age and educational outcomes of nearly 3,000 college students who are DACA recipients—Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals—and used it to forecast their income in the ensuing decade. We then used this data, along with the income we forecast for DACA recipients not in college, to estimate the total economic and fiscal impact over the next decade of allowing this cohort to remain in the country and legally pursue employment. We estimate that reversing DACA would cost the U.S. economy \$351 billion from 2019 to 2028 in lost income and that the U.S. Treasury would lose \$92.9 billion in tax revenue.

#### Background

As of our publication date, the status of the recipients of the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals—or DACA—has yet to be resolved. DACA provides work authorization and protections from deportations for individuals who were transported to the United States as children and who have since proven themselves to be productive members of society by meeting education benchmarks and having refrained from criminal activity. In October, President Trump announced that he was suspending the program—which was originally provided via an executive order from President Obama—but that he would delay its termination by six months to give Congress sufficient time to pass legislation to replace the executive order. Such legislation has proven elusive.

One argument put forth by those opposed to any renewal is that allowing these immigrants to remain in the country would impose a cost on U.S. taxpayers; a CBO study published in December 2017 estimates that legislation reinstating the legal status of the estimated 800,000 DACA immigrants would cost the federal government \$26 billion over the next ten years.<sup>4</sup>

These results were at odds with our own research published in early 2017.<sup>5</sup> In that research, we stated that our *a priori* perspective was that cancelling DACA would make it nearly impossible for this cohort to obtain lawful employment and result in a reduction in tax revenues and economic activity in the domestic economy.

We estimated the economic and fiscal impact by extrapolating from related research that estimated the impact of expanding the pool of H-1B visa holders on economic activity. We compared the demographic characteristics of the H-1B population and the DACA population—in general DACA recipients are younger and a sizeable fraction will likely not complete college. The result is that their income is quite a bit lower than for H-1B holders but it grows at a faster rate. We then estimated income and tax revenue by using the estimates for the H-1B population and adjusting those numbers by the income path and population differences.

We determined that reversing the policy would cost the U.S. economy \$280 billion over a ten-year period, and that the resulting loss of government revenue would amount to roughly \$60 billion in that decade.

#### A Brief History of DACA

President Barack Obama first established DACA visa executive action in 2012. From 2012 to 2017, roughly 800,000 people received DACA status. While this population could attend most colleges despite their lack of a legal status, the program gave them a temporary work permit and a Social Security number, which allowed them to work as well.

During his presidential campaign, Donald Trump promised to rescind DACA early in his presidency, and in September of 2017, the Attorney General announced that the program was, in fact, being suspended, with DACA recipients given up to a six-month grace period to get their affairs in order. The president challenged Congress to pass its own legislation to protect the status of DACA recipients, and at various times indicated that he felt some empathy for their plight and wanted a humane and reasonable solution of the issue.

This announcement was met with multiple legal challenges from state governments and individuals alike. The U.S. District Court of the Northern District of California has ruled that the reversal of DACA was unlawful, and has ordered the government to continue the program until further notice.

One proposed bill under consideration is the DREAM Act of 2017. The Congressional Budget Office estimated that it would increase budget deficits by approximately \$26 billion over the next decade.<sup>7</sup> The rationale given for this result is that immigrants without work permits pay certain taxes, most notably payroll taxes, but cannot claim benefits. By granting them legal status these workers become eligible for various benefit programs and Social Security but without paying much more in federal income taxes.

#### The DACA Population

To understand the economic impact of reversing DACA it helps to understand what distinguishes DACA recipients from other cohorts of legal and illegal immigrants. Since the DACA population grew up in the United States, they more closely resemble native-born Americans and second-generation immigrants more than first-generation immigrants. Having experienced the American school system and a peer group comprised mainly of Americans, the difficulties presented by language barriers, culture shock, and other obstacles to assimilation have dissipated, thus affording DACA recipients more opportunities for economic success than immigrants as a whole.

Moreover, DACA recipients must necessarily be free from criminal activity, as well as have the ability to enroll and remain in some sort of post-secondary education in order to qualify for the program, leaving us with a cohort that has largely performed well in school and stayed out of trouble.

Analysis done by the Center for American Progress found that DACA recipients tend to perform well in post-secondary education and have lower attrition rates than their peers. A primary reason for this is that the opportunity cost for a DACA student to leave school before completion is higher than for a native student: it is more difficult for DACA students to procure financial aid or scholarships and it becomes nearly impossible to do such a thing if a student leaves school for a spell.

The Migration Policy Institute (MPI) estimated that in 2014 nearly half of the DACA-eligible population who have completed a high school degree had no further education, with an additional 29 percent enrolled in college, 16 percent having completed some post-secondary education, and only 7 percent with college degrees. Since DACA enrollment only began in

2012, this paucity of college graduates is understandable; more impressive is the surge in college enrollment. For the rest of the U.S. population, approximately 60 percent of high school graduates attended some sort of post-secondary institution and one third of the population eventually obtained a college degree.

These numbers would presumably have been even higher had MPI been able to look only at DACA enrollees. They estimated that in 2016, only 68 percent of the DACA-eligible population enrolled in the program. Clearly, those with at least some post-secondary education have a greater incentive to apply for DACA status than the average DACA-eligible person, since that status opens up legal employment opportunities that substantially increase with education. Therefore, we conclude that those with DACA *status* have a higher college enrollment rate as compared to the entire population of DACA-eligible unlawful immigrants. <sup>10</sup> From that, we assume that the college-enrollment rate among DACA enrollees is around 40 percent in 2014, about a third higher than for all DACA-eligibles, which would in turn suggest that by 2019 the current DACA-enrolled population will be--roughly--evenly divided between those with only a high school degree, those with some post-secondary education, those currently in college, and those with college degrees. <sup>11</sup>

#### Methodology

Estimating the economic production and tax revenues that DACA enrollees are likely to generate over the next decade entails three steps. First, we needed to generate a profile of the DACA-eligible population over time, as its members move from high school either directly into the workforce, or through post-secondary education and then into the workforce. That profile needs to include reasonable transition probabilities that would estimate both high school and college drop out rates that are consistent with the patterns observed in the data.

Second, we needed to estimate reasonable age-earnings profiles for three groups of DACA-eligible individuals: those projected to have only high school degrees, those projected to have some college or other post-secondary education but no degree, and those projected to complete college. Finally, we needed to estimate how many of those DACA-eligible individuals would in fact apply for and be approved for DACA status.

#### DACA-eligible Workforce Entry

We used Migration Policy Institute research on the characteristics and numbers of the DACA-eligible population to estimate the distribution of educational attainment for this population. Using the Hispanic dropout rates in the Census Department's CPS Historical Time Series Tables on School Enrollment, we generated a plausible pattern of DACA-eligible high school enrollment, which gradually tapered from 98,000 freshmen in 2012 to 8,000 freshmen in 2023. We then assumed that 35 percent of these high school graduates would move directly into the workforce. MPI estimated that there were 396,000 DACA-eligible high school graduates in 2014 who were not pursuing additional education, which would then imply that 309,000 DACA-eligible, unlawful immigrants had already graduated from high school by 2011.

The remaining high school graduates were divided between college enrollment (50 percent) and other post-secondary enrollment (15 percent). Even those numbers were insufficient to generate MPI's estimate of 241,000 DACA-eligible college enrollees in 2014; so we assumed a surge of over 95,000 college enrollees in 2013, from among the population that had previously graduated from high school. Our estimates imply that by 2033, 36.35 percent of the DACA-eligible population will have college degrees, in line with Census department's 2017 estimate that by the age of 34, 36.4 percent of Hispanics who graduate from high school have gone on to earn college degrees.<sup>14</sup>

We assumed that college enrollees have an 81 percent graduation rate, consistent both with the rates observed by the dream.us, an organization that provides scholarship money for DACA students to help cover the cost of college. This is above the national 6-year graduation rates for full-time college students; we attribute this to the fact that a substantial proportion of our sample obtained an associate's degree, which is a common step for this cohort seeking post-college education. We assumed that enrollees in other post-secondary programs had a 50 percent annual attrition rate, either from dropping out or from completion of their program. This gave a flow of DACA-eligibles into the workforce that includes about 44,000 college graduates per year between 2017 and 2023.

We then had to reduce this workforce-entry flow for two reasons. First, not all high school graduates are in the labor force, and not all labor force participants are employed as the population includes those who are unemployed but looking for work. The Bureau of Labor

Statistics (BLS) reports a 75.3 percent employment-population ratio among Hispanics age 25 to 34, so we reduced our estimates of labor force entrants accordingly.<sup>15</sup>

Secondly, not all DACA-eligible unlawful immigrants apply for, or are granted, DACA status. MPI estimated that 68 percent of DACA-eligibles have applied for that status with an acceptance rate above 95 percent. We reasoned that since the benefits of DACA status are greater the greater one's earnings potential, we ascribed DACA status to all of the DACA-eligibles with some college or a college degree, but to only one-third of those with only high school degrees. Those assumptions imply that DACA status will slowly rise to 68.8 percent of the eligible population by 2028. If DACA is not just reinstated as a temporary, 2-year renewable status, but is legally enshrined in a permanent status, we would expect DACA participation to rise and the revenue impacts of DACA will increase accordingly.

#### DACA-eligible Age-earnings Profiles

The estimated age-earnings profiles of DACA-eligibles with only high school or some college are based on the corresponding median 2017 weekly earnings for Hispanics as reported by the BLS.<sup>17</sup> For individuals with high school degrees only, median earnings were \$33,852 a year; using Thornton and his coauthor's research, real earnings rise by about 1 percent a year until about age 40, and are flat thereafter.<sup>18</sup> The resulting pattern begins at about \$27,500 at age 19, when these individuals are assumed to enter the workforce, and rises to the median wage by age 40.

For individuals with some college, median earnings were \$38,324 a year. According to Tamborini and his coauthors, median earnings for these workers are 5.6 percent higher than their high school-only counterparts for those aged 20-29, and 12.6 percent higher for those aged 30-39. The resulting estimated real earnings profile consistent with these values rises from \$28,000 at age 21 to \$39,300 at age 40.

We assigned the starting median salary to all employed DACA-participating individuals at the beginning of their work careers and assumed that their real incomes would rise with age according to the rates above. In reality, some individuals will earn more than those median earnings, and others less. The progressivity of the tax code implies that our revenue estimates for these workers will understate the true revenue impacts, although probably not my much, since

most of these individuals will remain in a relatively low tax bracket regardless of how much they vary from the median. Their estimated taxes were based on the tax rates adopted in December 2017 for single individuals. For years after 2018, nominal tax payments were inflated using an annual 2 percent inflation rate. Per CBO custom, we do not discount the income or tax revenues of future years.

To estimate the earnings of the DACA college graduates, we obtained data from thedream.us. Just under 3,000 students have received financial assistance from thedream.us. For these individuals, we have data on the college in which they are currently enrolled, their expected graduation, their choice of major, previous post-secondary education (a substantial proportion have already earned an associates degree), and their city and state of residence. While we do not have data on their academic performance, a student's area of study is much more relevant to post-college income.

We paired the educational data with income data we obtained from the financial technology company payscale.com, which has an estimated starting salary for college students based on degree, school, and major using reported salary data.<sup>20</sup> Our data set had 2,563 usable observations with sufficient data to assign an estimated starting salary. To generate an age-earnings profile, we used estimates from Thornton and his coauthors that found that salaries initially grow at a 4 percent real annual rate, gradually tapering to a 3 percent real annual rate after 10 years.

To account for the fact that most college students begin their employment careers midyear, we reduced first-year salaries by 60 percent. With this group as well, our tax estimates were based on the tax rates adopted in December 2017 for single individuals. We calculated estimated taxes for each individual for each year in their earnings profile, and then averaged over our entire sample, giving us a profile of average tax payments per college graduate that does account for earnings variability. As with the other two groups, we ascribed these average tax payments to each individual college graduate, beginning in the year they enter the labor force. Once again, we reduce the number of entrants to 75.6 percent of all graduates to reflect employment rates, and inflate nominal payments by a 2 percent inflation rate.

Three Possible Scenarios

The estimate derived above assumes that current DACA recipients are offered a legal way to stay in the country, attend university, and obtain productive employment. From a fiscal standpoint, this would be the most preferred outcome but two others are also possible. The second scenario is that DACA ends and the immigrants currently in the country under its protection will be deported to their countries of origin. Under this scenario, the U.S. government does not only fail to gain any tax revenue from current DACA recipients, but also has to locate and deport 800,000 individuals, a task that would cost over \$10 billion if it were feasible.<sup>21</sup>

The more likely scenario if Congress fails to reach a deal and current DACA recipients lose their legal status is that the vast majority remain in the country illegally and work largely in jobs that require little skill but can be done on a cash basis, allowing them to receive their wages under the table. A proportion might be able to obtain employment by using another person's Social Security Number, a common ruse, which would force them to pay income and payroll taxes, albeit without any ability to collect Social Security or other benefits. Of course, as residents and consumers, they would also continue to pay sales and excise taxes. Given that this activity would happen outside of the law, it is impossible to estimate the revenue impact beyond saying that it would fall somewhere between the first two scenarios.

#### Estimating the Income and Tax Impacts of Repealing DACA

From the above analysis, we projected the number of DACA recipients in each of the four educational attainment categories for each year and then assigned them an income based on their experience and educational attainment by education (Table 1). For the college graduates we estimated a starting salary based on school and choice of major. The average DACA recipient will earn a salary of approximately \$73,921 per year for the 10-year period from 2019 to 2028. These earnings represent an equivalent gain to U.S. gross domestic product. Factoring in the 75.6 percent employment rate cited above and multiplying by the total number of DACA recipients, we estimate the ten-year GDP impact to be \$351 billion.

Table 1
DACA Recipients by Educational Category

1	2019	2021	2023	2025	2027
Number	2017	2021	2023	2023	2021
HS degree only	184,767	199,719	209,687	216,031	218,749
Enrolled in College	193,389	165,564	122,726	81,945	47,128
Some college	190,547	208,521	221,908	231,164	236,846
College degrees	245,305	311,468	376,693	430,371	467,533
Total	814,008	885,272	931,014	959,511	970,256
					-
Percentages					
HS degree only	22.7%	22.6%	22.5%	22.5%	22.5%
Enrolled in College	23.8%	18.7%	13.2%	8.5%	4.9%
Some college	23.4%	23.6%	23.8%	24.1%	24.4%
College degrees	30.1%	35.2%	40.5%	44.9%	48.2%
	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%
<b>Average Earnings</b>					
HS degree only	\$30,332	\$32,019	\$33,844	\$35,816	\$37,959
Enrolled in College	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Some college	\$32,736	\$34,878	\$37,211	\$39,764	\$42,564
College degrees	\$63,216	\$69,963	\$76,810	\$84,671	\$93,383
Total	\$33,598	\$40,054	\$47,569	\$55,621	\$63,946

Note: "Some college" includes those with more than a high school and less than a college degree who are not currently enrolled in college.

Applying the appropriate tax rates, we also determined that government would gain \$39.2 billion in revenue from DACA recipients over the next ten years. Additionally, we can expect a FICA tax rate of 15.3 percent, resulting in payroll tax revenue of \$53.7 billion over the next ten years. Therefore, the total tax revenue impact would be \$92.9 billion.<sup>22</sup> The imputed tax revenue adds up to 25 percent of projected income, the majority of which is driven by FICA.

We projected out an additional year and found that, from the ten-year period comprising 2020 through 2029, the GDP impact would be \$384 billion, and the revenue impact would be \$43.6 billion. If we include the FICA tax (both the employer and employee share), we add an additional \$58.8 billion, for a total tax impact of \$102.4 billion.

It should be noted that salary estimates are based on data that are a few years old and may understate current incomes, and there is reason to believe that incomes will grow faster than

during the previous decade. These estimates do not include the cost of actually tracking down and physically removing all 690,000 DACA recipients from the country, a significant expenditure in itself that would increase the fiscal costs of DACA.

#### **Comparisons with Other Estimates**

The above-mentioned Congressional Budget Office score the DREAM Act finds significantly lower revenue gains from DACA recipients than we do here. There are several reasons for this. The first is that CBO regards the income of DACA recipients as merely switching over from "underground" to legal status, and does not believe that this would result in much of a gain in income for those workers, an assumption that we think is without merit. What's more, the legislation would make these people become eligible for a large number of federal government welfare programs, which it believes would outweigh any tax revenue boost from their newfound legality.

CBO's methodology essentially assumes the formal employment of DACA recipients merely transfers income from the employer (who would have been taxed on that income had the employee not been hired) to the employee (who is then taxed on the transferred income). The CBO's estimate also contains offsets for health insurance premium support offered through the Affordable Care Act. However, our analysis suggests that DACA recipients who complete college--a significant proportion of the cohort--become significantly less likely to qualify for premium support soon after completing college.

Finally, CBO makes no allowance for the effects of education and specialization, conducted in a legal environment, on income. DACA recipients who complete college have the potential for considerable income growth, which would result in higher tax obligations and more revenue to the federal government. For these reasons, we estimate that the revenue cost to the federal government of reversing DACA would be substantially higher than the estimate implicitly contained in the DREAM Act.

It should also be noted that our cost estimates look only at the cost of fully reversing the current DACA program, whereas the DREAM Act contains other provisions providing a path to citizenship for immigrants beyond the status quo. A full scoring of the DREAM Act is beyond

the scope of this paper, and the differences found in this somewhat apples-to-oranges comparison are to be expected.

#### **Conclusion**

Our revised findings from data of DACA recipients currently matriculating are consistent with our previous analysis and suggest that ending the deferred arrivals program would represent a significant cost to the United States Treasury and the broader economy. We estimate that reversing DACA would cost the U.S. economy \$351 billion from 2019 to 2028 in lost income, and that the U.S. Treasury would lose \$92.9 billion in revenue, including payroll taxes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Director of Research at Free the People, <u>labright@freethepeople.org</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Visiting fellow at the Cato Institute, ike.brannon@gmail.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Professor emeritus at the University of Wisconsin Oshkosh, mcgee@uwosh.edu

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "S. 1615, Dream Act of 2017," Congressional Budget Office Cost Estimate, December 15, 2017, https://www.cbo.gov/system/files/115th-congress-2017-2018/costestimate/s1615.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Ike Brannon and Logan Albright, "The Economic and Fiscal Impact of Repealing DACA," Cato-At-Liberty, January 18, 2017, https://www.cato.org/blog/economic-fiscal-impact-repealing-daca.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Thomas V. Church, "Estimating the Economic and Budgetary Effects of New H-1B Visas in the Senate Gang of Eight's Proposed Immigration Bill," Hoover Institution (Stanford: Hoover, May 7, 2013), <a href="http://www.hoover.org/sites/default/files/uploads/aafs/2013/05/Estimating-the-Economic-and-Budgetary-Effects-of-H-1B-Reform-In-S-744 pdf">http://www.hoover.org/sites/default/files/uploads/aafs/2013/05/Estimating-the-Economic-and-Budgetary-Effects-of-H-1B-Reform-In-S-744 pdf</a>

H-1B-Reform-In-S.744.pdf.

7 "S. 1615, Dream Act of 2017," Congressional Budget Office Cost Estimate, December 15, 2017, https://www.cbo.gov/system/files/115th-congress-2017-2018/costestimate/s1615.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Tom K Wong, "Results of Tom K. Wong, National Immigration Law Center, and Center for American Progress national survey National Immigrant Law Center," <u>Center for American Progress Memo</u>, June 2015.

Randy Capps, Michael Fix, and Jie Zong, "The Education and Work Profiles of the DACA Population," Migration Policy Institute, August 2017, <a href="https://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/education-and-work-profiles-daca-population">https://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/education-and-work-profiles-daca-population</a>, p. 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Ibid.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> "CPS Historical Time Series Tables on School Enrollment," U.S. Census, August 23, 2017, https://www.census.gov/data/tables/time-series/demo/school-enrollment/cps-historical-time-series.html.

<sup>14</sup> Educational Attainment in the United States: 2017, U.S.," U.S. Census, December 14, 2017, https://www.census.gov/data/tables/2017/demo/education-attainment/cps-detailed-tables.html, Table 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Labor Force Statistics from the Current Population Survey," Bureau of Labor Statistics, January 19, 2018, <a href="https://www.bls.gov/cps/cpsaat04.htm">https://www.bls.gov/cps/cpsaat04.htm</a>.

Release, January 17, 2018, https://www.bls.gov/news.release/pdf/wkyeng.pdf.

<sup>20</sup> Paysale.com, About Us Page, https://www.payscale.com/about

 $<sup>^{16}</sup>$ Randy Capps, Michael Fix, and Jie Zong, "The Education and Work Profiles of the DACA Population," Migration Policy Institute, August 2017, https://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/education-and-work-profiles-dacapopulation, p. 3. <sup>17</sup> "Usual Weekly Earnings of Wage and Salary Workers, Fourth Quarter 2017," Bureau of Labor Statistics, News

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Robert Thornton, James Rogers and Michael Brookshire, "On the Interpretation of Age-Earnings Profiles," Journal of Labor Research 18(2) 1997, Table 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Christopher R. Tamborini, ChangHwan Kim and Arthur Sakamoto, "Education and Lifetime Earnings in the United States," Demography 52 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> John Hudak and Elaine Kamarck, "The Mind-Boggling Cost of DACA Repeal," Brookings Institution, September 7, 2017, <a href="https://www.brookings.edu/blog/fixgov/2017/09/07/the-mind-boggling-cost-of-daca-repeal/">https://www.brookings.edu/blog/fixgov/2017/09/07/the-mind-boggling-cost-of-daca-repeal/</a>.
<sup>22</sup> We assume that the personal tax rates will not change and ignore the fact that current law repeals them in 2026.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> "S. 1615, Dream Act of 2017," Congressional Budget Office Cost Estimate, December 15, 2017, https://www.cbo.gov/system/files/115th-congress-2017-2018/costestimate/s1615.pdf.

## **Exhibit B**

#### Estimating the Economic Impacts of DACA

Ike Brannon
Senior Fellow, Jack Kemp Foundation

M. Kevin McGee
Professor Emeritus, UW Oshkosh

July 5, 2019

#### **Abstract**

This paper estimates the economic impacts of DACA, on the educational attainment, earnings and federal tax payments of the DACA population, on state and local tax revenues, on the broader American workforce, and on the U.S. economy as a whole. We construct two models of the DACA population and its economic behaviors, the first assuming DACA is made permanent, and the second assuming DACA is terminated at the end of 2019.

We find that eliminating DACA is lose-lose. The DACA population would lose about \$120 billion in income, the federal government would lose roughly \$72 billion in tax revenue, and states and local governments would lose about \$15 billion in tax revenue over the 2020-29 decade.

Those losses would come without any offsetting gains. Eliminating DACA would be, in effect, throwing away some of our nation's human capital resources, dramatically reducing the returns to education for the DACA population, and channeling them into jobs where legal status is ignored, and that do not allow them to take full advantage of their human capital.

This failure to employ all of our human capital would hurt low-to-moderate income workers. Eliminating DACA would merely increase the competition for the kinds of jobs that tend to have an excess supply of workers, while reducing the supply of employable skilled workers in the areas where we have the most acute labor shortages. Overall, we find that eliminating DACA would benefit virtually no one while hurting pretty much everyone.

The Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) was first established in 2012 via an executive order of President Barack Obama. DACA protects from deportation individuals who were transported to the United States as children and who have since proven themselves to be productive members of society, both by maintaining strong educational attainment and not engaging in any criminal activities. From 2012 to 2017 roughly 800,000 people claimed DACA status. While this population could prior to DACA attend most colleges despite their lack of a legal status, the program gave them temporary work permits and access to Social Security numbers, which allowed them to work as well.

During his presidential campaign, Donald Trump promised to rescind DACA. Following up on that promise, in September 2017 Attorney General Jeff Sessions announced that the program was, in fact, being suspended, with DACA recipients given six months grace to get their affairs in order. Four months later, the U.S. District Court of the Northern District of California ruled that the reversal of DACA was unconstitutional, and ordered the government to continue to accept DACA renewals until further notice. A similar injunction was issued by the U.S. District Court of the Eastern District of New York in February 2018. In November 2018, the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals affirmed the Northern District of California injunction. In May 2019, the Fourth Circuit Court of Appeals vacated the DACA rescission as "arbitrary and capricious." As we write, DACA renewals are currently being accepted and processed, but new applications are not being accepted, and the U.S. Supreme Court has agreed to hear the administration's appeal of the Ninth Circuit Court's decision in the fall.

In July 2017, Sens. Graham, Durbin, Flake, and Schumer introduced the DREAM Act of 2017, S. 1615. The Act would have granted permanent residential status to most DACA recipients. In its analysis of the Act, the Congressional Budget Office (CBO) estimated that the Act would cost the government approximately \$24 billion in lost tax revenue over the following decade. It provided a similar \$26 billion estimate for the DREAM Act of 2019, H.R 2820. CBO's rationale was that immigrants without work

permits pay certain taxes, most notably payroll taxes, typically by procuring another person's Social Security number, but cannot claim benefits. By granting them legal status these workers would become eligible for various benefit programs and Social Security benefits without paying much more in federal income taxes.

This paper explores the issue of DACA's economic impacts on the educational attainment, earnings and federal tax payments of the DACA population, state and local tax revenues, the broader American workforce, and the U.S. economy as a whole. We find that the biggest impact of ending DACA would be to dramatically reduce the returns to education for the DACA population, channeling them into jobs where legal status is ignored, and that do not allow them to take full advantage of their human capital.

Eliminating DACA would be, in effect, throwing away some of our nation's capital resources. We estimated that its elimination would cost the DACA population about \$120 billion in reduced income, with a somewhat greater total loss of economic output that would be even greater. We also estimated that its elimination would cost the federal government roughly \$72 billion in lost tax revenue over the 2020-29 decade, consisting of \$26 billion in foregone income taxes and \$46 billion in foregone payroll taxes. State and local governments would lose another \$15 billion during that decade.

Those losses would come without any offsetting gains. Human capital and physical capital are complements, so the failure to employ all of our human capital would hurt the suppliers of physical capital, low-to-moderate income workers. Eliminating DACA would merely increase the competition for the kinds of jobs that tend to have an excess supply of workers, while reducing the supply of employable skilled workers in the areas where we have the most acute labor shortages. Overall, we find that eliminating DACA is lose-lose-lose, benefiting virtually no one while hurting pretty much everyone.

To more accurately estimate DACA's impacts we construct two models of the DACA population and its economic behaviors. The first model estimates their behavior should DACA be made permanent. Under that scenario, the DACA population can be expected

to behave very much like the rest of the legal-status Hispanic population, with similar high school and college completion rates, along with similar post-graduation earnings.<sup>1</sup> Our first model estimates their educational attainment, earnings profiles, and tax payments using the corresponding estimates for the Hispanic population as a whole.<sup>2</sup>

The second model estimates their behavior assuming DACA is terminated at the end of 2019. Under that scenario, the DACA population can be expected to behave very much like the rest of the undocumented Hispanic population, albeit with the higher levels of education that much of this population would have attained prior to its termination. We assume that the roughly 30% of the DACA population that had not yet completed its education by that point would revert to undocumented education rates, and the employment and earnings of the DACA population reflect their lack of legal status following DACA's termination.<sup>3</sup>

#### 1 Economic Outcomes if DACA Is Made Permanent

Estimating the economic production and tax revenues that DACA enrollees are likely to generate over the next decade, should DACA be made permanent, involves three steps. First, we need to generate a profile of the DACA-eligible population over time, as its members move from high school either directly into the workforce, or through post-secondary education into the workforce. That profile needs to include estimates of both high school and college drop out rates consistent with the patterns observed in the data.

Second, we need to estimate age-earnings profiles for three groups of DACA-eligible individuals: those projected to have only high school degrees, those projected to have some college or other post-secondary education but no Bachelor's degree, and those

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>According to the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (2017), 93.8% of the DACA population are Hispanic.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Since many measures of the Hispanic population do not distinguish between those with legal status and those without, our estimates of the DACA population's economic outcomes in this model are probably biased downward. If so, our paper will understate the true economic impacts of DACA.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>A third potential scenario would be to model the DACA population as being deported to their countries of origin. Under this scenario, the U.S. government would not only fail to gain any revenues at all from current DACA recipients, but would also have to locate and deport 800,000 individuals, a task that would cost over ten billion dollars if it were feasible, either from a practical or political perspective. See Hudak and Kamarck (2017).

projected to complete college. Finally, we need to estimate the taxes that these incomes would generate.

#### 1.1 DACA population profile

To understand the economic impact of reversing DACA it helps to understand what distinguishes DACA recipients from other cohorts of legal and illegal immigrants. To be eligible to apply for DACA, immigrants had to be younger than 31 on June 15, 2012, must have come to the U.S. when they were younger than 16, and must have lived in the U.S. since 2007. Since the DACA population grew up in the United States, they more closely resemble native-born Americans and second-generation immigrants more than first-generation immigrants. Having experienced the American school system and a peer group comprised mainly of Americans, the difficulties presented by language barriers, culture shock, and other obstacles to assimilation have dissipated, thus affording DACA recipients more opportunities for economic success than immigrants as a whole.

Table 1: MPI DACA-eligible Population Estimates

Year		
2014	Enrolled in Secondary School	365,000
	Completed High School, not in Higher Ed.	396,000
	Enrolled in Higher Education	241,000
	Completed Some College	134,000
	Completed a B.A. or B.S.	57,000
	Total	1,193,000
2016	Enrolled in or completed Secondary School	1,300,000
	Under Age 15	228,000
	Total	1,528,000

Moreover, DACA recipients must necessarily be free from criminal activity, as well as have the ability to enroll and remain in some sort of post-secondary education in order to qualify for the program. They are, therefore, a cohort that has largely performed well in school and remained out of trouble.

To generate a reasonable age profile for these immigrants, we began with the Migration Policy Institute's (MPI) 2014 estimates of educational attainment and school enrollment for the DACA-eligible population, and their 2016 estimates of the DACA-eligible population.<sup>4</sup> They estimated a 2014 DACA-eligible population of 1.19 million, roughly equally divided between those still in high school, those in or having some college education, and those who had completed high school but had no post-secondary education (Table 1). They also estimated a 2016 DACA-eligible (in high school or high school degree) population of 1.3 million, with an additional 228,000 children below the age of 15 that could eventually become DACA-eligible.<sup>5</sup>

Using these estimates, we generated a time profile of DACA-eligible high school enrollment that gradually tapered from 98,000 freshmen starting high school in 2012 to 8,000 freshmen starting high school in 2023 (Table 2). This pattern fits the constraints of (a) the MPI's estimate of roughly 365,000 high school students in 2014, (b) the MPI's estimate of roughly 228,000 children below the age of 15 in 2016, and (c) the DACA-eligibility requirement that the person be foreign born, but a U. S. resident prior to 2007.

We then used the Hispanic dropout rates from the Census Department's CPS Historical Time Series Tables on School Enrollment to generate a profile of high school graduates from this population. The assumed dropout rate after 2017 of 5.6% is the average of the observed rates from 2012 to 2017. These dropout rates are for students in grades 10 to 12, so we applied them only to students in those three grades.<sup>6</sup>

Our DACA-eligible age profile suggests that by September 2019, the number of DACA-eligibles with high school degrees or better will have risen to 1.3 million, with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Capps, Fix, Zong (2017).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>They also estimated that in 2016, there were another 398,000 potential eligibles who did not have the required high school diploma, but could meet that requirement with adult education. Throughout our study, we make the conservative assumption that no poentially-DACA-eligible high school dropouts acquire a high school equivalent degree. Thus, our economic impact estimates likely underestimate the true impact.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>A 5.6% dropout rate over three years implies an 84% graduation rate, which aligns with the 84% post-2012 graduation rate estimated by Kuka et al (2018).

an additional 209,000 enrolled in high school and 80,000 enrolled in elementary school.

Table 2: DACA-eligible Age Profile

Year	dropout rate	begin HS-9	HS-10	HS-11	HS-12	HS total	HS grads
pre-2012							580,356
2012	5.09%	98,000	97,858	93,000	88,000	376,858	82,500
2013	5.26%	96,000	98,000	92,710	88,107	374,817	83,370
2014	7.19%	92,000	96,000	90,955	86,045	365,000	81,773
2015	5.69%	84,000	92,000	90,533	85,776	352,309	81,145
2016	4.30%	72,000	84,000	88,048	86,644	330,692	82,091
2017	6.08%	60,000	72,000	78,892	82,694	293,587	81,376
2018	5.60%	48,000	60,000	67,966	74,473	250,439	78,062
2019	5.60%	40,000	48,000	56,638	64,159	208,797	70,301
2020	5.60%	32,000	40,000	45,311	53,465	170,777	60,564
2021	5.60%	24,000	32,000	37,759	42,772	136,531	50,470
2022	5.60%	16,000	24,000	30,207	35,643	105,851	40,376
2023	5.60%	8,000	16,000	22,655	28,515	75,170	33,647
2024	5.60%	0	8,000	15,103	21,386	44,490	26,917
2025	5.60%	0	0	7,552	14,258	21,809	20,188
2026	5.60%	0	0	0	7,129	7,129	13,459
2027	5.60%	0	0	0	0	0	6,729

Note: The numbers progress diagonally: 98,000 freshmen in 2012 become 98,000 sophomores in 2013, 90,955 juniors in 2014, 85,776 seniors in 2015, and 82,091 graduates in 2016.

#### 1.2 DACA college graduates

Estimating the number of DACA-eligibles with high school degrees who would proceed into post-secondary education was straightforward. The U. S. Department of Education, National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 302.20) reports the percentage of recent high school completers enrolled in college, by race and ethnicity. From 2011 to 2016 the 3-year moving average for Hispanic high school completers enrolled in college has ranged from 64.7% and 70.6%; it averaged 67.1% over that 6-year period. Therefore we assumed that 67.1% of DACA-eligibles with high school degrees would enroll in college.

Estimating the number of DACA-eligibles who complete college with a Bachelor's degree is more complicated. The NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 326.10) reports the graduation rates for first-time, full-time bachelor's degree-seeking students from the 4-year postsecondary institutions they started at. For Hispanics, this graduation rate has steadily risen from 45.5% after 6 years for the 1996 starting cohort to 55.0% for the 2011 starting cohort. However, this measure may understate the true graduation rate, as it omits students who graduated from a different 4-year institution after transferring. It may also overstate the true graduation rate, since it omits students who began their postsecondary career at a 2-year institution, which have significantly lower first-year retention rates.<sup>7</sup> And over half of all Hispanics begin their postsecondary careers at a 2-year institution, a far higher percentage than any other ethnic group.<sup>8</sup>

Table 3: Estimated Hispanic College Graduation Rates

Year	18 year-olds	HS grads	% Coll.	Coll. Enroll	Year	Coll. Grds.	Grad. Rate
2010	950,102	799,257	59.7%	477,120	2015	218,098	45.7%
2011	954,441	802,907	66.6%	534,663	2016	235,190	44.0%
2012	949,696	798,915	70.3%	561,591	2017	252,166	44.9%

To overcome this hurdle, we began with the total numbers of Hispanic 18-year-olds reported annually by the U.S. Census Department's *Annual Estimates*, shown in the second column of Table 3. We reduce these population estimates to high school graduate estimates in the third column, using the 5.60% annual attrition rate used in Table 2. We then convert these graduate estimates to college enrollment estimates in the fourth column, using the annual 3-year moving averages for Hispanic high school completers enrolled in college from the NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 302.20). We obtained the number of Hispanic Bachelor's degrees earned for the 2014-15, 2015-16, and 2016-17 academic years from the NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 302.20).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>First-year retention rates are from the NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 326.30). However, the differences in retention may just reflect a much higher likelihood to transfer to a different (probably 4-year) institution after one year at a 2-year college.

<sup>8</sup>NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 306.40)

We then compared total Bachelor's degrees to estimated enrollees from 5 years earlier to derive estimated graduation rates, which average 44.8% over the three years.

Table 4 shows our initial estimates of post-secondary educational enrollment for the DACA-eligible population. The first column reports the estimated high school graduations from Table 2. The next two columns divide these graduates into the 67.1% who pursue further education and the 32.9% who move directly into the workforce.

Table 4: DACA Post-secondary Education

Year	HS grads	HS only	College	Coll Enr	Some Coll	BA/BS
2012	82,500	27,142	55,358	55,358	0	0
2013	83,370	27,429	55,941	94,692	16,607	0
2014	81,773	26,903	54,870	125,030	41,139	0
2015	81,145	26,697	54,448	148,985	71,632	0
2016	82,091	27,008	55,083	161,387	101,913	12,401
2017	81,376	26,773	54,603	163,865	132,206	34,233
2018	78,062	25,682	52,380	161,265	162,397	59,022
2019	70,301	23,129	47,172	154,363	191,924	83,570
2020	60,565	19,926	40,639	142,842	219,525	108,130
2021	50,471	16,605	33,866	127,511	244,188	132,664
2022	40,377	13,284	27,093	109,481	265,320	156,655
2023	33,647	11,070	22,577	92,213	282,741	179,080
2024	26,918	8,856	18,062	75,955	297,100	199,041
2025	20,188	6,642	13,546	60,832	308,714	216,096
2026	13,459	4,428	9,031	46,707	317,836	230,131
2027	6,729	2,214	4,515	33,088	324,464	241,637
2028				19,598	328,600	250,993
2029				10,622	330,244	258,327
2030				4,805	330,750	263,638
2031				1,518	330,750	266,926
2032				253	330,750	268,191
2033					330,750	268,444

The last three columns describe the aggregate DACA-eligible college population. To achieve the estimated 44.8% graduation rate, we assume that 30% of all college en-

rollees leave after one year, either because they completed some certification program or because they dropped out; that 20% of all remaining enrollees leave after their second year; that another 20% of all remaining enrollees leave after their third year; and that all the remaining enrollees graduate, half after four years, another three-eights after five years, and the remaining one-eighth after six years.<sup>9</sup>

Table 5: Adjusted DACA Post-secondary Education

Year	HS grads	HS only	College	Backlog	Coll Enr	Some Coll	BA/BS
Pre-2012	580,356	314,526	265,830		59,760	16,940	30,120
2012	82,500	27,142	55,358	90,000	185,118	27,981	39,080
2013	83,370	27,429	55,941	60,000	243,452	76,628	48,040
2014	81,773	26,903	54,870	9,010	241,000	134,000	57,000
2015	81,145	26,697	54,448		234,812	185,676	65,960
2016	82,091	27,008	55,083		214,593	223,938	103,001
2017	81,376	26,773	54,603		186,381	255,241	154,513
2018	78,062	25,682	52,380		166,643	285,432	196,440
2019	70,301	23,129	47,172		154,867	314,959	225,862
2020	60,565	19,926	40,639		142,842	342,560	250,926
2021	50,471	16,605	33,866		127,511	367,223	275,460
2022	40,377	13,284	27,093		109,481	388,355	299,451
2023	33,647	11,070	22,577		92,213	405,776	321,876
2024	26,918	8,856	18,062		75,955	420,135	341,837
2025	20,188	6,642	13,546		60,832	431,749	358,892
2026	13,459	4,428	9,031		46,707	440,871	372,927
2027	6,729	2,214	4,515		33,088	447,499	384,433
2028					19,598	451,635	393,824
2029					10,622	453,279	401,123
2030					4,805	453,785	406,434
2031					1,518	453,785	409,722
2032					253	453,785	410,987
2033					0	453,785	411,240

Table 4's estimates fall well short of the MPI's 2014 DACA-eligible college enrollment and college completion numbers, reported in Table 1. The MPI estimated that in 2014, 241,000 DACA-eligibles were enrolled in higher education, 134,000 had com-

 $<sup>^9\</sup>mbox{Multiplying }70\%$  x 80% x 80% gives a 44.8% graduation rate.

pleted some college, and 57,000 had completed a B.A. or B.S. Our model shows only 125,030 enrollees in 2014, 41,139 DACA-eligibles with some college, and no bachelor's degrees. Clearly, two things must have occurred. First, some small percentage of this population had been enrolling in post-secondary education before DACA was created, despite their lack of legal status. Second, some fraction of this population that had graduated from high school prior to 2012 had chosen to enroll in post-secondary education shortly after DACA gave them at least temporary legal status.

To capture these effects, we added estimated values for pre-DACA enrollments and backlog first-time enrollments in 2012 and 2013 to the model. We chose the numbers to bring our totals up to the MPI estimates while remaining consistent with our estimated attrition rates. The results are in Table 5. Our estimates imply that by now, not quite half of the DACA-eligibles who had graduated from high school prior to DACA will have enrolled in post-secondary education, significantly lower than the 67.1% rate observed in the overall Hispanic population.<sup>10</sup> Our estimates also imply that by 2033, 27.91% of the DACA-eligible population will have college degrees. This falls short of the Census department's 2017 estimate that by the age of 34, 36.4% of all Hispanics who graduate from high school have earned college degrees, suggesting that our methodology may be overly conservative.<sup>11</sup>

Our estimates in Table 5 allow us to project three streams of workforce entrants from the DACA-eligible population: those with high school degrees only, those with some college, and those with Bachelor's Degrees.<sup>12</sup> To account for the facts that not all high school graduates are in the labor force, and not all labor force participants are employed, we reduced all three entry streams to reflect the average 2011 through 2018 employment rates for each level of educational attainment.<sup>13</sup> The resulting projections, in Table 6,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup>The 265,830 pre-2012 high school graduates who are projected to have enrolled in college include the 106,820 who were enrolled or had some degree of college completion in 2011, plus the 159,010 "backlog" enrollees in 2012-14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>Our calculation, based on U.S. Census Bureau, "Educational Attainment in the United States: 2017," Table 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup>Although it is extremely likely that some share of those earning Bachelor's Degrees will continue on into Graduate School, we did not attempt to incorporate that into our model.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup>NCES Digest for Education Statistics (table 501.50)

allow us to subsequently project the economic impacts of DACA in the next subsection.

Table 6: DACA Workforce Entry

	HS only	Some Coll	BA/BS
% Empl	69.94%	75.96%	84.89%
Pre-2012	219,979	12,868	25,569
2012	18,983	8,386	7,606
2013	19,184	36,952	7,606
2014	18,816	43,580	7,606
2015	18,672	39,253	7,606
2016	18,889	29,064	31,444
2017	18,725	23,778	43,729
2018	17,962	22,933	35,592
2019	16,176	22,429	24,976
2020	13,936	20,966	21,277
2021	11,614	18,734	20,827
2022	9,291	16,052	20,366
2023	7,742	13,233	19,037
2024	6,194	10,907	16,945
2025	4,645	8,822	14,478
2026	3,097	6,929	11,914
2027	1,548	5,035	9,767
2028	0	3,142	7,942
2029	0	1,249	6,226
2030	0	384	4,509
2031	0	0	2,791
2032	0	0	1,074
2033	0	0	215
Totals	425,453	344,696	349,102

#### 1.3 DACA age-earnings profiles

Earnings change with age, and the rate at which earnings rise with age differ systematically by educational attainment. To reasonably estimate the effects of DACA on the future earnings of the DACA-eligible population, we need to take the various age-earnings profiles into account.

We began by estimating an age-earnings profile for DACA-eligibles with no schooling beyond high school. Median annual earnings for Hispanics age 25 to 34 years old with only high school degrees averaged \$30,354 a year from 2010 through 2017.<sup>14</sup> According to Thornton et al. (1997, Table 4), real earnings for workers with high school degrees only rise by about 1% a year until about age 40, and remain flat thereafter. To match this pattern, we assumed that this cohort would initially earn about \$27,300 (in 2017 dollars) at age 19, when we assume these individuals enter the workforce, attain the median of \$30,354 a year at age 29 and one half, and top off at about \$33,700 at age 40 (Table 7).

For Hispanics age 25 to 34 years old with some college but no degree, median earnings averaged \$33,499 a year from 2010 through 2017; for those with associate's degrees, median earnings averaged \$35,761 a year. According to Tamborini et al. (2015, Tables 2 and 3), median earnings for these workers are 5.6% higher for men and 11.3% higher for women at ages 20-29; at ages 30-39 earnings are 11.9% higher for men and 16.7% higher for women than their high-school-only counterparts. Since we have no estimate of the breakdown between those with some-college-but-no-degree and those with associate's degrees within the DACA-eligible population, nor of the gender breakdown among those who entered post-secondary education but did not earn a Bachelor's degree, we keep our age-earnings profile reasonably consistent with all of these values. It starts at \$29,700 at age 21, rising by 1.53% a year thereafter. The resulting earnings at age 24 are 8.2% higher than those with high school degrees only, at age 29 are about \$33,500, and at age 34 are 14% higher than those with high school degrees only – all generally fitting the given values (Table 7).

To estimate the earnings of the DACA college graduates, we obtained data from dreamers.us, an organization that provides scholarship money for DACA students to help cover the cost of college. Just under 3,000 students received financial assistance from dreamers.us. For these individuals, we have data on their current college, expected

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup>NCES Digest for Education Statistics (table 502.30).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup>NCES Digest for Education Statistics (table 502.30).

Table 7: DACA Age-Earnings Profiles and Taxes, by Education

Age	HS only		Some	Coll	BA/BS	
	Income	Taxes	Income	Taxes	Income	Taxes
19	\$27,343	\$1,647				
20	\$27,616	\$1,680				
21	\$27,892	\$1,713	\$29,700	\$1,930		
22	\$28,171	\$1,747	\$30,154	\$1,984		
23	\$28,453	\$1,780	\$30,615	\$2,040	\$41,487	\$3,344
24	\$28,738	\$1,815	\$31,083	\$2,096	\$43,146	\$3,544
25	\$29,025	\$1,849	\$31,559	\$2,153	\$44,829	\$3,745
26	\$29,315	\$1,884	\$32,042	\$2,211	\$46,533	\$3,950
27	\$29,608	\$1,919	\$32,532	\$2,270	\$48,255	\$4,157
28	\$29,904	\$1,954	\$33,030	\$2,330	\$49,992	\$4,365
29	\$30,203	\$1,990	\$33,535	\$2,390	\$51,742	\$4,679
30	\$30,505	\$2,027	\$34,048	\$2,452	\$53,501	\$5,066
31	\$30,810	\$2,063	\$34,569	\$2,514	\$55,267	\$5,455
32	\$31,118	\$2,100	\$35,098	\$2,578	\$57,036	\$5,844
33	\$31,429	\$2,137	\$35,635	\$2,642	\$58,804	\$6,233
34	\$31,743	\$2,175	\$36,180	\$2,708	\$60,568	\$6,621
35	\$32,060	\$2,213	\$36,734	\$2,774	\$62,324	\$7,007
36	\$32,381	\$2,252	\$37,296	\$2,842	\$64,069	\$7,391
37	\$32,705	\$2,291	\$37,867	\$2,910	\$65,799	\$7,772
38	\$33,032	\$2,330	\$38,446	\$2,980	\$67,510	\$8,148
39	\$33,362	\$2,369	\$39,034	\$3,050	\$69,198	\$8,520
40	\$33,696	\$2,410	\$39,631	\$3,122	\$70,859	\$8,885
41	\$33,696	\$2,410	\$40,237	\$3,194	\$72,489	\$9,244
42	\$33,696	\$2,410	\$40,853	\$3,268	\$74,084	\$9,594
43	\$33,696	\$2,410	\$41,478	\$3,343	\$75,640	\$9,937
44	\$33,696	\$2,410	\$42,113	\$3,420	\$77,153	\$10,270
45	\$33,696	\$2,410	\$42,757	\$3,497	\$78,619	\$10,592

graduation date, their choice of major, previous post-secondary education (a substantial proportion have already earned an associates degree), and their city and state of residence. We have no data on college performance.

We paired the educational data with income data we obtained from the fintech company payscale.com, which has an estimated starting salary for college students based on degree, school, and major using reported salary data. Our data set had 2,563 usable

observations, with a median expected starting salary of \$59,875.<sup>16</sup> This is probably too high an estimate, as it is well above the \$46,443 median annual earnings for 25 to 34 year old Hispanics with a Bachelor's degree, or even the \$50,858 median annual earnings for all 25 to 34 year olds a Bachelor's degree, as reported in the NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 502.30; average of 2010 to 2017, in 2017 dollars). However, our data set shows that the DACA college students attend universities in states with a median household income 5.28% higher than in the country as a whole, suggesting that a 2017 median salary of \$53,500 at age 30 would be a reasonable estimate.

Table 8: Aggregate DACA Income and Taxes, by Education (\$B)

Year	HS only		Some	Some Coll		BS
	Income	Taxes	Income	Taxes	Income	Taxes
2019	\$10.905	\$0.696	\$6.901	\$0.467	\$9.135	\$0.792
2020	\$11.631	\$0.747	\$7.839	\$0.534	\$10.578	\$0.931
2021	\$12.319	\$0.797	\$8.779	\$0.602	\$12.096	\$1.080
2022	\$12.966	\$0.845	\$9.694	\$0.670	\$13.690	\$1.242
2023	\$13.591	\$0.891	\$10.565	\$0.736	\$15.322	\$1.417
2024	\$14.192	\$0.937	\$11.384	\$0.799	\$16.954	\$1.604
2025	\$14.767	\$0.982	\$12.162	\$0.860	\$18.563	\$1.798
2026	\$15.312	\$1.026	\$12.902	\$0.920	\$20.134	\$1.997
2027	\$15.825	\$1.068	\$13.607	\$0.979	\$21.680	\$2.163
2028	\$16.303	\$1.109	\$14.274	\$1.036	\$23.206	\$2.339
2029	\$16.795	\$1.151	\$14.898	\$1.091	\$24.712	\$2.526
2030	\$17.302	\$1.195	\$15.429	\$1.141	\$26.190	\$2.722
2031	\$17.825	\$1.240	\$15.978	\$1.192	\$27.631	\$2.927
2032	\$18.363	\$1.286	\$16.547	\$1.246	\$28.968	\$3.142
2033	\$18.818	\$1.323	\$17.136	\$1.302	\$30.341	\$3.363

To generate an age-earnings profile for college graduates, we assumed those salaries, per Thornton et al. (1997), would initially grow at a 4% real annual rate, gradually tapering to a 3% real annual rate after 10 years, and a 2% real annual rate after another decade. That gave us an average starting salary of \$41,487.

For all three of these groups, we assigned the age-profile starting salaries to all em-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup>The mean was virtually the same, \$59,640.

ployed DACA-participating individuals at the beginning of their work careers, with their real incomes rising with age. In reality, some individuals will earn more than those median earnings, and others less. The progressivity of the tax code implies that our revenue estimates for these workers will understate the true revenue impacts, although probably not by much, since most of these individuals will remain in a relatively low tax bracket for the next decade, regardless of how much their income varies from the median.

Table 9: Aggregate DACA Income and Taxes (\$B)

Year	Income	Inc. Taxes	FICA Taxes
2019	\$26.941	\$1.955	\$4.122
2020	\$30.048	\$2.212	\$4.597
2021	\$33.194	\$2.479	\$5.079
2022	\$36.350	\$2.757	\$5.562
2023	\$39.478	\$3.044	\$6.040
2024	\$42.530	\$3.340	\$6.507
2025	\$45.492	\$3.640	\$6.960
2026	\$48.348	\$3.943	\$7.397
2027	\$51.112	\$4.210	\$7.820
2028	\$53.783	\$4.484	\$8.229
2029	\$56.405	\$4.768	\$8.630
2030	\$58.921	\$5.058	\$9.015
2031	\$61.434	\$5.359	\$9.399
2032	\$63.878	\$5.674	\$9.773
2033	\$66.295	\$5.988	\$10.143
2020-29	\$436.740	\$34.877	\$66.821
2021-30	\$465.613	\$37.723	\$71.239

Their estimated income taxes were based on the tax rates adopted in December 2017 for single individuals. FICA taxes are 15.3% of income, which includes both the employer's and employee's share. For years after 2018, nominal income and tax payments were inflated using an annual 2% inflation rate. Per CBO custom we do not discount the income or tax revenues of future years.

Table 8 reports the annual estimated aggregate nominal income and income tax payments of the three DACA-eligible education groups for the years 2019-2033, in billions of

dollars. Table 9 aggregates these income and income tax estimates by year, and reports the corresponding FICA taxes. Overall, we estimate that if DACA were continued, for the decade 2020-2029 the DACA-eligible population would have an aggregate income of \$437 billion, pay \$35 billion in income taxes, and generate \$67 billion in FICA taxes.

As we will show below, those numbers are all substantially greater than our estimated income and tax payments for the DACA-eligible population, if DACA is eliminated.

#### 2 Economic Outcomes if DACA Ends

The elimination of DACA would profoundly affect this population. The 440,000 DACA-eligibles who are still in school would have a reduced incentive to continue their education, since DACA's elimination would severely restrict their future employment opportunities. And many of the 1.06 million DACA-eligibles currently in the workforce would be forced to leave their current employment, migrating to the typically less rewarding and less productive jobs that can be done without legal employment status.

To estimate the economic impacts of eliminating DACA, we estimate the effect that would have on educational outcomes, earnings, and labor force participation. Those estimates in turn provide us with estimated aggregate income and tax payments for the DACA-eligible population, which can be compared to the corresponding estimates from a continued DACA in the previous section.

#### 2.1 Educational attainment without DACA

To estimate how educational outcomes in the DACA population would change if DACA ended, we begin by estimating how its creation affected those outcomes. The clearest impact has been on high school graduation, since its effect is unambiguous. DACA provides benefits, both pecuniary (principally greater post-graduation employment opportunities) and non-pecuniary (primarily a temporary reduction in deportation risk) only

if high school graduation is attained. Three studies have explored how legal status affects high school graduation, all concluding that DACA has increased the high school graduation rate significantly in the DACA population.

In an analysis that pre-dated DACA, Passel and Cohn (2009) estimated a high school completion rate of only 72% among undocumented immigrants who arrived in the United States before the age of 14 years, 10% lower than native-born Americans. Similarly, using (2000 to 2011) pre-DACA data on teenagers aged 13 to 17, Liscow and Woolston (2018) found that undocumented siblings of Mexican heritage were roughly twice as likely to not be enrolled in school as their U.S.-born siblings. Since Passel and Cohn reported a better than 2-to-1 ratio of U.S.-born to foreign-born children in undocumented immigrant families, and the overall Hispanic dropout rate averaged 5.8% over that 12 year period, Liscow and Woolston's "double likelihood" estimate suggests annual dropout rates of 4.3% and 8.8%, and high school graduation rates of 88% and 76%, among Hispanic U.S.-born versus foreign-born children.

Using data than spanned the creation of DACA, Kuka et al (2018) compared the educational attainment of potentially DACA-eligible Hispanics to that of foreign-born citizens with the same age and year of arrival profiles. They found that DACA increased high school completion of 19 to 22 year olds by 5.9 percentage points, to about an 84% graduation rate. Merging these three studies suggests that the high school graduation rate with legal status is the 84% we used in our estimate of the economic outcomes under DACA, and without legal status would be roughly 76%.<sup>17</sup>

However, DACA's effect on college enrollment is not unambiguous. It increases the benefits of higher education by opening up future employment opportunities that would not be accessible without legal status. But it also raises the opportunity cost of higher education, by increasing the current income that must be foregone in pursuing that higher education. We would expect that the former effect would predominate if DACA recipients

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup>This would imply an annual dropout rate of 8.7% for each of the last three years of high school.

perceive DACA as being likely to provide permanent legal status, but that the latter effect would predominate if DACA recipients saw the program as only a temporary opportunity to work legally.

It is therefore not surprising that the evidence on DACA's effect on college enrollment is mixed. Hsin and Ortega (2018) estimated the effects of DACA on DACA-eligibles who were already enrolled in college when DACA was first announced. They note that the DACA college-enrolled population was already positively selected compared to immigrants with legal status, with higher average high school GPAs and lower pre-DACA dropout rates, indicating that the lack of legal status had deterred college enrollment. They found that DACA increased the college dropout rate by 7.3 percentage points among students at four-year colleges, while decreasing the full-time enrollment rate at community colleges by 5.5 percentage points. Their results suggest that not quite one-tenth of already-enrolled DACA recipients reacted as if the program would be only temporary. Of course, since they were only studying DACA-eligibles already enrolled in college, they could not possibly have found any enrollment increase.

Pope (2016) compared DACA participants who barely met the qualifications (by being just below the age of 16 when they entered the country, or just below the age of 30 when DACA was announced) to their peers who barely missed qualifying for DACA, and found DACA had no effect on education. And Kuka et al (2018), using data comparing potentially DACA-eligible Hispanics to foreign-born citizens, found that DACA increased college attendance by only around 3 percentage points. However, we suspect that this result may be strongly affected by the significant differences in family educational backgrounds between DACA-eligible Hispanics and foreign-born citizens.

In strong contrast to these results, Kaushal (2008) reported that for the 1997-2005 period only about 29% of the young noncitizen adults of Mexican origin age 23-28 with high school degrees had any college attendance, as compared to 43% of young noncit-

izen non-Mexican Latinos and 75% of young noncitizen non-Latinos.<sup>18</sup> According to the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (2017), 79.4% of the DACA population are of Mexican origin, and another 14.4% are of other Latin American origin. Applying these 1997-2005 college attendance rates to the immediately pre-DACA period suggests that about only 38% of DACA-eligibles who graduated from high school prior to 2012 would have attended college before DACA, well shy of the 67.1% of Hispanic high school completers enrolled in college reported by the NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 302.20).

Cortes (2013) reaches similar conclusions by comparing the educational attainment of young immigrants legalized by the 1986 Immigration Reform and Control Act (IRCA) to other undocumented immigrant youth. She found that legal status in 2000 increased college enrollment in that population by 15 percentage points, at a time when overall Hispanic college enrollment was only around 50%. Similarly, Wong et al (2016, 2017, 2018) found, in a series of on-line surveys of DACA recipients, that 64% of the respondents reported having "pursued educational opportunities that I previously could not," principally, post-secondary education.

Recall that, to make sense of the MPI's 2014 DACA-eligible college enrollment and college completion numbers, as reported in Table 1, we had to incorporate into Table 6 estimated values for pre-DACA college enrollments and for backlog first-time enrollments in 2012 and 2013. Our numbers suggest that prior to DACA, only about 18% of the future-DACA-eligible high school graduates enrolled in college, but that the aggregate college enrollment among these pre-2012 high school graduates jumped to 45% by 2014. We then used the NCES *Digest for Education Statistics'* estimated 67.1% college enrollment rate for Hispanic high school completers for the high school cohorts who graduated after DACA was established.<sup>19</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup>These differences are probably due to the fact that many non-Mexican undocumented immigrants arrived in the U.S. on student visas, and subsequently overstayed those visas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup>In a report on a 2013 survey of DACA participants, a year after DACA began, Gonzales, Terriquez and Ruszczyk (2014) found that 22% had already obtained a bachelor's degree, another 69% either had or were attending a 4-year or community college. Our simulation numbers are generally in line with their findings.

Overall, we believe that it is reasonable to estimate that if DACA ended, the college enrollment rate would drop back down to only about 40% of high school completers.<sup>20</sup>

Table 10 reflects these changes, and recalculates the numbers from Table 6 beginning in 2020. The annual high school dropout rate has risen to 8.7%, only 40% of high school completers enroll in college, and the college dropout rates for those who were enrolled when DACA expired has risen to 40% after one year and 30% after the second and third year, reflecting the likelihood that many DACA-eligibles who enrolled in college under the promise of DACA would become discouraged by its elimination. As we did in Table 6, we applied employment rates to each level of educational attainment from the NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 501.50), adding the corresponding employment rate for those with less than high school completion. We further adjusted those employment rates to reflect the lower likelihood of employment when a worker is undocumented, which we will address more fully in the the next subsection.<sup>21</sup>

Table 10 shows 52 more high-school-only DACA-eligible workforce entrants, 45,466 fewer workforce entrants with some college, and 63,966 fewer college graduates in the workforce than in Table 6. There are also 9,575 additional high school dropouts from this population in the workforce. These changes primarily reflect the impacts of eliminating DACA on employment rather than on education. The estimated changes in educational attainment are in fact relatively moderate, primarily because we estimate that 71% of the Table 6's population had completed its education and entered the workforce before DACA's termination.<sup>22</sup>

Amuedo-Dorantes and Antman (2016) found that DACA decreased education among DACA-eligibles relative to DACA-ineligible undocumented immigrants. However, their small DACA-eligible sample sizes and the high level of post-secondary education in their DACA-eligible group prior to DACA lead us to discount their results.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup>Our overall results are not very sensitive to this estimate, since in our model about 83% of the DACA population has already completed high school by the time DACA is assumed to end.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>The high school dropouts reported in the table are our estimated net increase in dropouts due to the elimination of DACA. Undocumented immigrants who would already have dropped out had DACA continued would be unaffected by the policy change.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup>Technically, the elimination of DACA, modeled as occurring at the end of 2019, would not affect workforce entry prior to 2020. However, it would reduce the employment of those earlier workforce cohorts thereafter. Reducing the workforce entry numbers for the years before 2020 simplifies the calculation of the economic affects after DACA is eliminated.

Table 10: No-DACA Workforce Entry

	HS dropout	HS only	Some Coll	BA/BS
% Empl (DACA)	57.18%	69.94%	75.96%	84.89%
% Empl (No DACA)	51.18%	63.94%	69.96%	78.89%
Pre-2012	0	201,108	11,852	23,762
2012	0	17,355	7,724	7,069
2013	0	17,538	34,033	7,069
2014	0	17,202	40,137	7,069
2015	0	17,070	36,153	7,069
2016	0	17,269	26,767	29,222
2017	0	17,119	21,900	40,638
2018	0	16,421	21,122	33,076
2019	0	14,789	20,656	23,211
2020	2,676	22,472	27,313	19,773
2021	2,056	18,112	16,244	18,149
2022	1,606	14,014	10,416	15,853
2023	1,278	11,679	6,753	12,896
2024	950	9,343	5,466	10,016
2025	622	7,007	4,382	7,812
2026	294	4,671	3,442	6,120
2027	93	2,336	2,500	4,924
2028	0	0	1,560	3,981
2029	0	0	619	3,121
2030	0	0	191	2,260
2031	0	0	0	1,399
2032	0	0	0	539
2033	0	0	0	108
Totals	9,575	425,505	299,230	285,136

### 2.2 Employment without DACA

There are two reasons to expect that the termination of DACA would reduce, but not eliminate, employment in the DACA population. The first, already captured in the previous section, is the reduced educational attainment. As the NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 501.50) reports, employment rates are higher, the higher the level of education, so less educational attainment means fewer employed workers. That effect

is already reflected into the numbers in Table 10.

Secondly, the loss of legal status will itself prove a hindrance to obtaining employment. Pope (2016), comparing the labor market outcomes of DACA participants to their peers who barely missed qualifying for DACA, found that DACA increased labor force participation and decreased unemployment among DACA participants, increasing the likelihood than an individual was employed by between 4.8 and 7.7 percentage points. Since Pope found no effect of DACA on education in his study, this employment effect must be independent of the effects of education.

In Table 10, the employment rates have all been reduced by 6 percentage points to reflect Pope's estimates. However, when the employment rate is only 69.94%, a 6 percentage point decline in employment reduces the employment rate to 63.94%, which is a nearly 9% reduction.<sup>23</sup>

#### 2.3 Earnings without DACA

It would be surprising if legal status did not impact the financial rewards to employment. Being able to work legally opens up a wide array of job opportunities that would otherwise be unavailable to the worker, almost certainly leading to an increase in earnings.

Two studies of the effects of the Immigration Reform and Control Act (IRCA) of 1986 on the earnings of previously undocumented Mexican immigrants found exactly that. Rivera-Batiz (1999) compared the earnings of undocumented Mexican immigrants surveyed in 1987-8 with their earnings in 1992, after gaining legal status through IRCA. The majority of his sample were poorly educated, with nine or fewer years of education. He found, after accounting for changes in education, language proficiency, employment sector, and employment experience that had occurred during the intervening period, that legal status increased men's earnings by about 8% and women's earnings by nearly 13%.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup>0.6394/0.6994 = 91.4%.

Kossoudji and Cobb-Clark (2002) compared the same population of Mexican immigrant men who gained legal status under IRCA with a sample of (primarily U.S.-born) Latino man who entered the job market at about the same time. Similar to Rivera-Batiz, they concluded that prior to IRCA, the lack of legal status had reduced the men's earnings by 14% to 22%. They also found that prior to gaining legal status, there was only a small, statistically insignificant wage premium for education among the Mexican immigrants, which increased dramatically after legal status was obtained.

Pope (2016) looked at the effects of DACA on earnings, and found that DACA increased incomes in the bottom half of those working by 5% to 20%, but had little effect on those in the top of income distribution. This latter result is surprising, since Borjas (2017, Table 3) estimated than the returns to education for undocumented workers were only slightly more than half those of native-born workers.<sup>24</sup> He also found that the overall wage penalty to undocumented immigrants who had been in the U.S. for over a decade declined from around 12% prior to 2007 to around 8% in 2011-14.

Two sets of surveys report earnings gains for DACA recipients. Gonzales, Terriquez and Ruszczyk (2014) surveyed 2,381 DACA recipients in 2013, shortly after the program was implemented. 59% of those surveyed reported having obtained a new job, and 45% reported increased job earnings. Both positive outcomes were significantly more likely for those who had earned college degrees. Wong et al (2016, 2017, 2018), in three surveys with a total of 5,421 DACA respondents, reported that 64% of those surveyed reported having obtained a better paying job, 51% reported having obtained a job that better fit their education, and 68% reported increased job earnings. Their average earnings rose 65% for the full sample, and 88% for those 25 and older in the 2017 or 2018 surveys.

Since the acquisition of legal status clearly raised DACA recipients' incomes, the loss of that status would reduce those incomes. We model the impact of ending DACA as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup>His education coefficients (in regressions of log income on various demographic measures) for native-born Americans averaged 0.118; they averaged 0.064 for undocumented immigrants.

reducing the earnings of all the DACA-eligibles of the previous section, but especially of those with the highest education. We began by assuming that otherwise-DACA-eligibles who dropped out of high school earn \$21,800 a year in 2017 dollars, with only an inflationary increase over time; that is, with no increasing age-earnings profile. The \$21,800 roughly equals the \$20,000 that DACA respondents reported earning on average prior to DACA in Wong's 2017 and 2018 surveys, adjusted for inflation. It also represents a 15% wage penalty relative to the median income for all Hispanics with less than a high school education, \$25,520 a year in 2017 dollars.<sup>25</sup>

In Table 11 we have adjusted downward the age-earnings profiles from Table 7, relative to that \$21,800 figure. For those with high school degrees or some college, our without-DACA incomes are 55% of the difference between the with-DACA incomes and the \$21,800 base. For those with college degrees, without-DACA incomes are 40% of the difference between the with-DACA incomes and the \$21,800 base. This reflects the fact that many of the highest paying jobs open to college graduates with legal status – such as Chemical Engineer or Systems Analyst – would be totally inaccessible once that status is removed. These adjustments capture Borjas' (2017) estimate that lack of legal status cuts the returns to education roughly in half, and are consistent with Kossoudji and Cobb-Clark's (2002) finding that legal status dramatically increased the education wage premium.

#### 2.4 Income and Taxes without DACA

Combining the adjusted age-earnings profiles in Table 11 with the streams of workforce entrants in Table 10 gives income streams and aggregate income tax payments for each of the four education levels, which we present in Table 12. Note that the 2019 numbers are identical to those in Table 8, since we are modeling the policy change as occurring

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup>NCES *Digest for Education Statistics* (table 502.30)

 $<sup>^{26}</sup>$ Thus, a 25 year-old with some college who would have earned \$31,559 under DACA would now earn {\$21,800 +0.55(\$31,559-\$21,800)} = \$27,167.

Table 11: No-DACA Age-Earnings Profiles, by Education

Age	HS dropout	HS only	Some Coll	BA/BS
19	\$21,800	\$24,849		
20	\$21,800	\$24,999		
21	\$21,800	\$25,151	\$26,145	
22	\$21,800	\$25,304	\$26,395	
23	\$21,800	\$25,459	\$26,648	\$29,675
24	\$21,800	\$25,616	\$26,906	\$30,338
25	\$21,800	\$25,774	\$27,167	\$31,012
26	\$21,800	\$25,933	\$27,433	\$31,693
27	\$21,800	\$26,094	\$27,703	\$32,382
28	\$21,800	\$26,257	\$27,977	\$33,077
29	\$21,800	\$26,422	\$28,254	\$33,777
30	\$21,800	\$26,588	\$28,536	\$34,480
31	\$21,800	\$26,756	\$28,823	\$35,187
32	\$21,800	\$26,925	\$29,114	\$35,894
33	\$21,800	\$27,096	\$29,409	\$36,602
34	\$21,800	\$27,269	\$29,709	\$37,307
35	\$21,800	\$27,443	\$30,014	\$38,010
36	\$21,800	\$27,620	\$30,323	\$38,708
37	\$21,800	\$27,798	\$30,637	\$39,400
38	\$21,800	\$27,978	\$30,955	\$40,084
39	\$21,800	\$28,159	\$31,279	\$40,759
40	\$21,800	\$28,343	\$31,607	\$41,424
41	\$21,800	\$28,343	\$31,940	\$42,076
42	\$21,800	\$28,343	\$32,279	\$42,714
43	\$21,800	\$28,343	\$32,623	\$43,336
44	\$21,800	\$28,343	\$32,972	\$43,941
45	\$21,800	\$28,343	\$33,326	\$44,528

at the end of 2019.

We again aggregate these income and income tax estimates by year and report the corresponding FICA taxes in Table 13. The results suggest that if DACA were terminated, for the decade 2020-2029 the formerly DACA-eligible population would have an aggregate income of only \$316 billion, pay only \$20 billion in income taxes, and generate only \$48 billion in FICA taxes.

Table 12: No-DACA Aggregate Income and Taxes, by Education (\$B)

Year	HS dr	dropout HS only		Some	Coll	BA/	BA/BS	
	Income	Taxes	Income	Taxes	Income	Taxes	Income	Taxes
2019			\$10.905	\$0.696	\$6.901	\$0.467	\$9.135	\$0.792
2020	\$0.061	\$0.003	\$9.658	\$0.550	\$7.024	\$0.379	\$6.626	\$0.459
2021	\$0.109	\$0.005	\$10.390	\$0.594	\$7.685	\$0.439	\$7.475	\$0.522
2022	\$0.150	\$0.007	\$11.041	\$0.634	\$8.210	\$0.483	\$8.295	\$0.585
2023	\$0.183	\$0.008	\$11.652	\$0.673	\$8.652	\$0.520	\$9.061	\$0.646
2024	\$0.210	\$0.009	\$12.221	\$0.709	\$9.074	\$0.552	\$9.769	\$0.703
2025	\$0.230	\$0.010	\$12.744	\$0.744	\$9.479	\$0.584	\$10.435	\$0.759
2026	\$0.242	\$0.011	\$13.216	\$0.776	\$9.871	\$0.615	\$11.071	\$0.814
2027	\$0.249	\$0.011	\$13.635	\$0.805	\$10.248	\$0.645	\$11.691	\$0.857
2028	\$0.254	\$0.011	\$13.996	\$0.832	\$10.608	\$0.676	\$12.301	\$0.902
2029	\$0.260	\$0.012	\$14.367	\$0.860	\$10.930	\$0.705	\$12.902	\$0.947
2030	\$0.265	\$0.012	\$14.748	\$0.888	\$11.262	\$0.733	\$13.492	\$0.995
2031	\$0.270	\$0.012	\$15.139	\$0.917	\$11.605	\$0.762	\$14.067	\$1.043
2032	\$0.275	\$0.012	\$15.541	\$0.948	\$11.959	\$0.792	\$14.604	\$1.093
2033	\$0.281	\$0.013	\$15.904	\$0.973	\$12.325	\$0.823	\$15.154	\$1.144

However, those numbers assume that this population would, despite the loss of legal status, fully comply with the tax laws and pay all of their required tax liabilities. A far more reasonable assumption would be that a considerable fraction of these taxes would go unpaid. Social Security's Office of Chief Actuary (Goss et al 2013) has estimated that only about 44% of undocumented workers paid Social Security taxes in 2010.<sup>27</sup> Since we cannot imagine why an underground worker who is not paying Social Security taxes would then pay income taxes, we apply this 44% compliance rate to both sets of taxes. Under this assumption, the formerly DACA-eligible population would again have an aggregate 2020-2029 income of \$316 billion, but pay just \$9 billion in income taxes, and generate just \$21 billion in FICA taxes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup>They estimated that there were about 7 million unauthorized workers that year, of whom 3.9 million were identified as working in the underground economy, and thus not paying taxes, with the remaining 3.1 million unauthorized workers tax compliant.

Table 13: No-DACA Aggregate Income and Taxes (\$B)

Year	Income	Inc. Taxes	FICA Taxes
2019	\$26.941	\$1.955	\$4.122
2020	\$23.369	\$1.391	\$3.575
2021	\$25.659	\$1.560	\$3.926
2022	\$27.696	\$1.709	\$4.237
2023	\$29.548	\$1.847	\$4.521
2024	\$31.274	\$1.973	\$4.785
2025	\$32.888	\$2.097	\$5.032
2026	\$34.400	\$2.216	\$5.263
2027	\$35.823	\$2.318	\$5.481
2028	\$37.159	\$2.421	\$5.685
2029	\$38.459	\$2.524	\$5.884
2030	\$39.767	\$2.628	\$6.084
2031	\$41.081	\$2.734	\$6.285
2032	\$42.379	\$2.845	\$6.484
2033	\$43.664	\$2.953	\$6.681
A	ssuming Full	•	nce
2019-28	\$304.757	\$19.487	\$46.627
2020-29	\$316.275	\$20.056	\$48.389
2021-30	\$332.673	\$21.293	\$50.898
Assumi	ng 44% Tax (	Compliance a	after 2019
2019-28	\$304.757	\$9.669	\$22.824
2020-29	\$316.275	\$8.825	\$21.291
2021-30	\$332.673	\$9.369	\$22.395

## 3 Consequences of Ending DACA

As the previous two sections show, ending DACA would have significant economic consequences, summarized in Table 14. The DACA population would face a 28% decline in earnings, primarily through a loss in the return to education. Ending DACA would be, in effect, a 50% tax on their return to investment in human capital, an investment made in good faith when the promise of legal status was held out to them. Ending DACA would also result in a roughly \$72 billion loss in tax revenue to the federal government over the 2020-29 decade.

Ending DACA would also affect state and local government tax revenues, the earnings

Table 14: Consequences of Ending DACA (\$B)

2020-29	Income	Inc. Taxes	FICA Taxes
Under DACA	\$436.740	\$34.877	\$66.821
DACA Terminated	\$316.275	\$8.825	\$21.291
Difference	\$120.465	\$26.052	\$45.530
% Difference	27.58%	74.70%	68.14%

of American citizens, and the U.S. economy as a whole. We address each of those changes in the subsections below.

#### 3.1 The Impact on State and Local Governments

Ending DACA would reduce state and local government tax revenues by reducing the incomes and resulting consumer spending that those governments tax. To estimate those revenue affects, we calculated each state's share of the total DACA population, based on the Migration Policy Institute (2018) estimated distribution.<sup>28</sup> These shares were then weighted by states' 2017 median household incomes to estimate the share of total DACA income to attribute to each state.

State and local tax revenues as a percent of state personal income were downloaded from the Urban Institute-Brookings Institution Tax Policy Center. Our estimated changes in property tax revenue and in sales and gross receipts tax revenue for each state are the products of our estimated change in DACA income times the state's weighted income share, multiplied by that tax's revenue as a percent of state personal income. We calculate estimated changes in income tax revenue similarly, but assume that only 44% of the DACA population's income would be reported if DACA were eliminated.

Table 15 reports these tax revenue losses for the 10 states with the largest income shares and for the nation as a whole, in million of dollars. Overall, the 50 states, Washington D.C., and their local tax jurisdictions would lose about \$15 billion during the 2020-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup>The MPI's estimates include 40 states, covering 98.9% of the DACA-eligible population.

Table 15: 2020-29 State/Local Tax Revenue Cost of Ending DACA (\$M)

State	Share	Inc Loss	Prop Tax	Sales Tax	Inc Tax	Tax Loss
California	33.57%	\$40,442	\$1,096	\$1,290	\$3,567	\$5,953
Texas	13.55%	\$16,320	\$623	\$712		\$1,335
New York	5.90%	\$7,113	\$325	\$255	\$845	\$1,425
Illinois	4.82%	\$5,811	\$235	\$208	\$294	\$737
New Jersey	4.69%	\$5,649	\$285	\$136	\$335	\$756
Florida	4.55%	\$5,479	\$150	\$209		\$359
Georgia	3.09%	\$3,719	\$101	\$112	\$218	\$431
North Carolina	2.52%	\$3,034	\$69	\$101	\$208	\$378
Arizona	2.34%	\$2,824	\$74	\$120	\$98	\$292
Washington	2.17%	\$2,619	\$68	\$147		\$215
Total	98.9%	\$119,139	\$3,751	\$4,138	\$7,168	\$15,057

29 decade.

#### 3.2 The Impact on American Workers

One of the ironies of the proposal to end DACA is that it would convert a population with a substantial fraction of high-skilled workers into a population of at best moderate-to-low skilled workers. A high-school-only DACA-eligible worker currently employed in retail sales would face a comparatively small loss in income if he lost that job when his DACA work authorization ended, since there are undoubtedly many small retailers willing to hire him to do the same job, albeit off the books at a somewhat lower wage. But a DACA-eligible worker with a degree in structural engineering would be unlikely to find an employer willing to hire her without work authorization, forcing her to compete in that same market for retail jobs.

The economics literature shows that skilled immigrant workers have a beneficial impact on the employment of both skilled and unskilled American citizens. One reason for this is that skilled immigrants have a relatively small substitution effect on skilled domestic workers, because those skilled immigrants are relatively mobile and go where there

are many available jobs. In contrast, the U.S. labor force is less flexible: geographic mobility has gradually diminished in the U.S. since the 1950s, and has fallen by 10% in just the last few years.<sup>29</sup> The chief reason for this trend is the rise in two-income households, which increases the cost of moving for one spouse's job.

Skilled immigrants also have a positive impact on domestic employment because they create what economists call a "scale effect": skilled immigrants boost overall economic activity, creating more opportunities and jobs for both skilled and unskilled domestic workers. This scale effect outweighs their small substitution effect for skilled domestic workers. For example, Peri et. al. (2014a) showed that reducing the number of skilled foreign workers coming to a community significantly reduced the wages of college-educated U.S.-born workers in those communities who work with computers.<sup>30</sup>

Skilled immigrants have an unambiguously positive effect on unskilled U.S. born workers. Skilled workers and unskilled workers are, in general, complementary, just as skilled workers and capital are complementary – that is, an increase in the quantity of one increases the demand and price for the other (Chiswick 2011). Hence, an increase in the supply of skilled immigrants increases the amount of capital in the economy and – along with it – the demand for unskilled workers. This results in higher wage and employment levels for unskilled workers, even without the scale effect (Kiley 1999).

Highly-skilled immigrants are also more likely to create new businesses than U.S. citizens with similar skills and education. Immigrants in the U.S. are 30% more likely to start a new business than a native worker, and 25% of all startups in Silicon Valley have been founded by immigrants (Wolla 2014).

In addition, highly-skilled, well-educated workers, both foreign-born and domestic, have high employment levels, are less likely to avail themselves of public services such as food stamps or welfare, and are more likely to be in occupations that are hard to fill. As a result, they boost U.S. tax revenues while having little impact on government

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup>Feintzeig and Weber (2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup>See also Peri, Shih, and Sparber (2014b).

spending.31

Ending DACA would reduce the supply of high skilled workers while increasing the supply of low skilled workers in the economy.<sup>32</sup> The increased competition for low-skilled jobs would hurt low skilled domestic workers; the DACA population's loss of income would create a negative scale effect, reducing the demand for high and low skill workers alike.

Thus, any belief that ending DACA would be a boon for low skilled American workers is therefore sadly out on line with the facts.

#### 4 Conclusion

DACA provides legal status, and legal work authorization, to over a million young people who came to this country as children, and who, except for their currently tenuous legal status, mostly identify as Americans. As the Congressional Budget Office (CBO) implicitly and we believe correctly assumed when they scored S. 1615, these young people are highly likely to remain in the U.S., and in the U.S. workforce, regardless of whether DACA is discontinued. The primary impact of ending DACA would therefore be to channel them into jobs where legal status is ignored, and therefore for the most part into jobs that do not allow them to take full advantage of their human capital.

Eliminating DACA would be, in effect, throwing away some of our nation's capital resources. We estimated that its elimination would cost the DACA population about \$120 billion in reduced income (Table 14). But workers rarely capture all of their productivity in wage income, so the total loss of economic output would be even greater. As a result, the losses in tax revenue at both the federal and state/local level will likely exceed our

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> For a literature review on this topic see Brannon and Albright (2016).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup>The Congressional Budget Office (CBO) score for S. 1615 effectively assumed that DACA merely switches the DACA population from underground to legal status, without having any effect on their income. While we find this latter assumption implausible, we would note that they do *not* assume that DACA has any significant impact on these workers' willingness to be employed. Hence the CBO's scoring of S. 1615 implicitly agrees with our assessment that ending DACA would not remove a large number of low-skilled workers from the workforce.

estimates in the previous sections.

Since human capital and physical capital are complements, the failure to employ all of our human capital would hurt the suppliers of physical capital, low-to-moderate income workers. Opponents of DACA, displaying a tragic lack of understanding of how the economy works, argue that its elimination would "open up jobs for Americans." But as section 3.2 showed, its elimination would merely increase the competition for the kinds of jobs that tend to have an excess supply of workers, while reducing the supply of employable skilled workers in the areas where we have the most acute labor shortages. Overall, we find that eliminating DACA would be a lose-lose-lose economic policy, hurting these young immigrants, federal, state, and local government treasuries, the aggregate economy, and the incomes of low-to-moderate income workers.

#### References

- [1] Amuedo-Dorantes, Catalina, and Francisca Antman, 2017. "Schooling and labor market effects of temporary authorization: Evidence from DACA," *Journal of Population Economics* 30: 339-373.
- [2] Borjas, George J., 2017. "The Earnings of Undocumented Immigrants," NBER Working Paper 23236. Available at: http://www.nber.org/papers/w23236.
- [3] Brannon, Ike and Logan Albright, "Immigration's Impact on the Texas Economy," Texas Public Policy Institute, March 2016.
- [4] Capps, Randy, Michael Fix, and Jie Zong, 2017. "The Education and Work Profiles of the DACA Population," Washington, DC: Migration Policy Institute.
- [5] Chiswick, Barry, 2011. "Immigration: High-skilled vs Low-skilled Labor," IZA: Institute for the Study of Labor, Policy Paper 28.
- [6] Cortes, Kalena E. 2013. "Achieving the DREAM: The Effect of IRCA on Immigrant Youth Postsecondary Educational Access." *American Economic Review*, 103(3): 428-432.
- [7] Feintzeig, Lauren and Lauren Weber, "Fewer Americans Uproot Themselves for a New Job," *The Wall Street Journal*, 20 August 2018.
- [8] Gonzales, Roberto G., Veronica Terriquez and Stephen P. Ruszczyk, 2014. "Becoming DACAmented: Assessing the Short-Term Benefits of Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA)," American Behavioral Scientist: 1-21.
- [9] Goss, Stephen, Alice Wade, J. Patrick Skirvin, et al, 2013. "Effects of Unauthorized Immigration on the Actuarial Status of the Social Security Trust Funds," Social Security Administration, Actuarial Note, 151. Available at: https://www.ssa.gov/oact/NOTES/pdf\_notes/note151.pdf.

- [10] Hsin, Amy and Francesc Ortega, 2018. "The Effects of Deferred Action for Child-hood Arrivals on the Educational Outcomes of Undocumented Students," *Demography* 55: 1487-1506.
- [11] Hudak, John and Elaine Kamarck, 2017. "The Mind-boggling Cost of DACA Repeal." Washington DC: The Brookings Institute. Available at: https://www.brookings.edu/blog/fixgov/2017/09/07/the-mind-boggling-cost-of-daca-repeal/
- [12] Kaushal, Neeraj. 2008. "In-State Tuition for the Undocumented: Education Effects on Mexican Young Adults." *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management* 27(4): 771-92.
- [13] Kiley, Michael T, 1999. "The Supply of Skilled Labor and Skills-biased Technological Progress," *Economics Journal*.
- [14] Kossoudji, Sherrie A, and Deborah A Cobb-Clark, 2002. "Coming out of the shadows: Learning about legal status and wages from the legalized population." *Journal of Labor Economics*, 20(3): 598-628.
- [15] Kuka, Elira, Na'ama Shenhav, and Kevin Shih. 2018. "Do Human Capital Decisions Respond to the Returns to Education? Evidence from DACA," NBER Working Paper, 24315.
- [16] Liscow, Zachary and William Gui Woolston, 2018. "Does Legal Status Matter for Educational Choices? Evidence from Immigrant Teenagers" *American Law and Economics Review* 20: 318-381.
- [17] Migration Policy Institute, 2018. "National and State Estimates of Immigrant Populations Eligible for the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) Program, 2018."
  Available at: https://www.migrationpolicy.org/sites/default/files/datahub/State-County-DACA-Estimates of DACA-Eligible Population\_2018.xlsx.

- [18] Passel, Jeffrey and D'Vera Cohn. 2009. "A Portrait of Unauthorized Immigrants in the United States," Washington, DC: Pew Hispanic Center Report.
- [19] Peri, Giovanni, Kevin Shih, Chad Sparber, and Angie Marek-Zeitlin, 2014a. "Closing Economic Windows: How H-1B Visa Denials Cost U.S.-born Tech Workers Jobs and Wages during the Great Recession," *The Partnership for a New American Economy*,.
- [20] Peri, Giovanni, Kevin Shih, and Chad Sparber, 2014b. "Foreign Scientists and Engineers and Economic Growth," *Cato Papers on Public Policy* 3: 107-184.
- [21] Pope, Nolan G., 2016. "The Effects of DACAmentation: The Impact of Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals on Unauthorized Immigrants," *Journal of Public Economics* 143: 98-114.
- [22] Rivera-Batiz, Francisco L. 1999. "Undocumented workers in the labor market: An analysis of the earnings of legal and illegal Mexican immigrants in the United States." *Journal of Population Economics* 12(1): 91-116.
- [23] Tamborini, Christopher R., ChangHwan Kim and Arthur Sakamoto, 2015. "Education and Lifetime Earnings in the United States," *Demography* 52: 1383-1407.
- [24] Thornton, Robert, James Rogers and Michael Brookshire, 1997. "On the Interpretation of Age-Earnings Profiles," *Journal of Labor Research* 18(2): 351-365.
- [25] U.S. Census Bureau, "Table H-8. Median Household Income by State: 1984 to 2017." Available at: https://www2.census.gov/programs-surveys/cps/tables/time-series/historical-income-households/h08.xls.
- [26] U.S. Census Bureau, "Annual Estimates of the Resident Population by Sex, Single Year of Age, Race Alone or in Combination, and Hispanic Origin for the United States: April 1, 2010 to July 1, 2017." Available at: https://www.census.gov/newsroom/press-kits/2018/estimates-characteristics.html.

- [27] U.S. Census Bureau, "CPS Historical Time Series Tables on School Enrollment." Available at: https://www.census.gov/data/tables/time-series/demo/schoolenrollment/cps-historical-time-series.html, Table A-4.
- [28] U.S. Census Bureau, "Educational Attainment in the United States: 2017." Available at: https://www.census.gov/data/tables/2017/demo/education-attainment/cps-detailed-tables.html.
- [29] U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, 2017. "Approximate Active DACA Recipients: Country of Birth." Available at: https://www.uscis.gov/sites/default/files/USCIS/Resources/Reports and Studies/Immigration Forms Data/All FormTypes/DACA/daca\_population\_data.pdf
- [30] U. S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Statistics, *Digest for Education Statistics*. https://nces.ed.gov/programs/ digest/.
- [31] The Urban Institute-Brookings Institution Tax Policy Center, State & Local Government Finance Data Query System. Available at: http://www.taxpolicycenter.org/slf-dqs/pages.cfm.
- [32] Wolla, Scott, 2014. "The Economics of Immigration," The Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis.
- [33] Wong, Tom K., Greisa Martinez Rosas, Adrian Reyna, Ignacia Rodriquez. Patrick OShea. Tom Jawetz, and Philip E. Wolgin, 2016. New Study of DACA Beneficiaries Shows Positive Economic and Educational Outcomes, Washington D.C.: Center for American Progress. Available at: https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/news/ 2016/10/18/146290/new-study-of-daca-beneficiaries-shows-positive-economicand-educational-outcomes/.

- [34] Wong, Tom K., Greisa Martinez Rosas, Adam Luna, Henry Manning, Adrian Reyna, Patrick OShea, Tom Jawetz, and Philip E. Wolgin, 2017, DACA Recipients Economic and Educational Gains Continue to Grow, Washington D.C.: Center for American Progress. Available at: https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/news/2017/08/28/437956/daca-recipients-economic-educational-gains-continue-grow/.
- [35] Wong, Tom K., Sanaa Abrar, Tom Jawetz, Ignacia Rodriguez Kmec, Patrick O'Shea, Greisa Martinez Rosas, and Philip E. Wolgin, 2018, Amid Legal and Political Uncertainty, DACA Remains More Important Than Ever, Washington D.C.: Center for American Progress. Available at: https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/news/2018/08/15/454731/amid-legal-political-uncertainty-daca-remains-important-ever/.

# **Exhibit C**

**IKE BRANNON, PH.D** 2012 Wyoming Ave NW #301, Washington DC 20009 ◆(202) 309-0893 ◆ <u>Ike.Brannon@gmail.com</u>

Attributes: Ph.D. Economist with a background in academia and public service with a focus on tax and financial market issues.

CurrentPositions	
<ul> <li>Capital Policy Analytics Group, President</li> <li>Consulting firm focused on providing objective analyses of public policy and political analysis concerning taxes, regulatory policy, and health care for a variety of clients inside and outside of Washington.</li> </ul>	2012-
<ul> <li>The Jack Kemp Foundation, Senior Fellow</li> <li>Write and edit research on public policy issues</li> </ul>	2018-
<ul> <li>The Savings and Retirement Foundation, Founder/Director</li> <li>The Foundation organizes a monthly seminar for researchers and Congressional staff. It also has a blog and hosts regular events on Capitol Hill.</li> </ul>	2012-
Forbes, Columnist	2017-
Regulation, Contributing Editor	2013-
Previous Experience	
<ul> <li>The Weekly Standard, Contributing Editor</li> <li>Over 100 articles published in the magazine</li> </ul>	2015-2018
The Cato Institute, Nonresident Senior Fellow  ● Wrote studies, blog posts, and opinion articles	2015-2018
<ul> <li>The American Action Forum, Director of Economic Policy &amp; Gov't Relations</li> <li>Oversaw Forum's research agenda on tax, trade, &amp; entitlement reform</li> <li>Coordinated Forum's outreach to Congressional Members &amp; staff</li> </ul>	2011-2012
<ul> <li>Committee on Energy and Commerce, Chief Economist</li> <li>Directed research on health care, energy &amp; environmental analysis</li> <li>Liaised with Congressional Budget Office &amp; JCT</li> </ul>	2009-2011
<ul> <li>Republican Policy Committee, Senate Leadership, Chief Economist</li> <li>Advised party leadership and conference on savings, pension, &amp; tax issues</li> <li>Wrote memos and advised Senate staff</li> </ul>	2008-2009
<ul> <li>John McCain 2008, Senior Policy Adviser/Chief Economist</li> <li>Represented campaign via talks, interviews, and media appearances</li> </ul>	2008

<ul> <li>Recruited, organized, &amp; managed network of external economic advisers</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>United States Treasury, Senior Adviser for Tax Policy</li> <li>Co-author &amp; co-editor of 2007 studies on corporate tax reform</li> <li>Contributed to Treasury's response to subprime crisis &amp; fiscal stimulus</li> </ul>	2007-2008
<ul> <li>Senate Finance Committee, Orrin Hatch, Principal Economic adviser</li> <li>Prepared legislation &amp; counseled Senator on savings and taxation issues</li> </ul>	2005-2007
The Joint Economic Committee of Congress, Chief Economist  Senior Economist  Supervised staff of 15 with a research focus on tax, budget, & entitlements	2004-2005 2002-2004
<ul> <li>Office of Management and Budget, Senior Economist, OIRA</li> <li>Analyzed major regulations promulgated by federal agencies</li> </ul>	2001-2002
<ul> <li>Department of Economics, University of Wisconsin, Oshkosh, WI</li> <li>Promoted to Associate Professor and granted tenure in 2000</li> <li>Teaching award in the College of Letters and Sciences, 2000</li> <li>Research Associate with the Wisconsin Policy Research Institute, 1998-2001</li> </ul>	1994-2001
<ul> <li>Department of Finance, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN</li> <li>Visiting Associate Professor</li> </ul>	1998
Education	
<ul> <li>Ph.D., M.A., Economics, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>B.A., Math, Economics, Spanish, Augustana College, Rock Island, IL</li> <li>O Augustana College Young Alumni Of The Year, 2004.</li> </ul>	1993 1988
<ul> <li>B.A., Math, Economics, Spanish, Augustana College, Rock Island, IL         <ul> <li>Augustana College Young Alumni Of The Year, 2004.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Other Activities</li> </ul>	1988
<ul> <li>B.A., Math, Economics, Spanish, Augustana College, Rock Island, IL         <ul> <li>Augustana College Young Alumni Of The Year, 2004.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Other Activities         <ul> <li>Director of the Prosperity Caucus</li> <li>A DC policy forum with a membership of over 250 dedicated to issues related to economic growth, investment, and prosperity</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>B.A., Math, Economics, Spanish, Augustana College, Rock Island, IL         <ul> <li>Augustana College Young Alumni Of The Year, 2004.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Other Activities         <ul> <li>Director of the Prosperity Caucus</li> <li>A DC policy forum with a membership of over 250 dedicated to issues related to economic growth, investment, and prosperity</li> </ul> </li> <li>Director of the Tax Economists' Forum</li> </ul>	1988
<ul> <li>B.A., Math, Economics, Spanish, Augustana College, Rock Island, IL         <ul> <li>Augustana College Young Alumni Of The Year, 2004.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Other Activities         <ul> <li>Director of the Prosperity Caucus</li> <li>A DC policy forum with a membership of over 250 dedicated to issues related to economic growth, investment, and prosperity</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	2004-
<ul> <li>B.A., Math, Economics, Spanish, Augustana College, Rock Island, IL         <ul> <li>Augustana College Young Alumni Of The Year, 2004.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Other Activities         <ul> <li>Director of the Prosperity Caucus</li> <li>A DC policy forum with a membership of over 250 dedicated to issues related to economic growth, investment, and prosperity</li> </ul> </li> <li>Director of the Tax Economists' Forum         <ul> <li>Biweekly, bipartisan seminar for tax economists</li> </ul> </li> <li>Lecturer, NATO Orientation Program, National Defense University</li> </ul>	2004- 2006-

Publication	Date	Type of Piece	Co-Authors	Links	General Subject Matter	Title	Notes
Forbes Online	7/16/19	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/07/16/the- increased-politicization- of-proxy- votes/#5d568adb63b6	Proxy Votes	"The Increased Politicization Of Proxy Votes"	
Forbes Online	7/11/19	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/07/11/diminishing- the-power-of-proxy- advisory- firms/#6e84a631452c	Proxy Advisory Firms	"Diminishing the Power of Proxy Advisory Firms"	
SSRN	7/11/19	Policy Analysis		https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract_id=3417313	Healthcare- Suprise Billing	"The Potential Pitfalls from Methods to End Surprise Billing in Healthcare"	
Bloomberg Law	7/9/19	Article		https://news.bloomber glaw.com/us-law- week/insight-gene- therapy-price-controls- would-be-short-sighted- deter-innovation-3	Price Controls	"Gene Therapy Price Controls Would Be Short-Sighted, Deter Innovation"	
Forbes Online	7/8/19	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/07/08/increasing- the-passenger-facilities- charge-makes-little- sense		"Increasing the Passenger Facility Charge Makes Little Sense"	
The Hill	7/8/19	Op-Ed		https://thehill.com/opi nion/healthcare/45134 0-revealing-negotiated- prices-wont-reduce- health-care-costs	Health Care Costs	"Revealing negotiated prices won't reduce health care costs"	
SSRN	7/5/19	Policy Analysis	M. Kevin McGee	https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract_id=3420511	DACA	"Estimating the Economic Impacts of DACA"	

The Southern Illinoisan	6/26/19	Op-Ed		https://thesouthern.com/opinion/columnists/opinion-ike-brannon-real-time-payments-are-here-for-the/article_0ed3d741-d0b4-5f27-a2f4-b36dc9404b7e.html	Real-Time Payments	"Ike Brannon: Real- time payments are here for the US"	
Forbes Online	6/7/19	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/06/07/the- government-must-tred- lightly-with-industry- consolidation-in-the- shrinking-print- industry/#4c7d585b5f5 2	Printing Company Mergers	"The Government Must Tred Lightly With Industry Consolidation In The Shrinking Print Industry"	
SSRN	6/7/19	Policy Analysis	Robert H. Jennings	https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract_id=3391834	Equity Exchange Fees	"Equity Exchange Fees and Revenues"	
The Washington Times	6/6/19	Op-Ed		https://www.washingto ntimes.com/news/2019 /jun/6/dc-circulator- bus-time-to-say-good- riddance-to-the/	D.C. Buses	"Good riddance to the 'free' D.C. Circulator bus"	
Forbes Online	6/4/19	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/06/04/amid-irs- overreach-congress-has- a-real-opportunity-to- reform-conservation- easement- legislation/#91b7d5739 fc9	Conservation Easement	"Amid IRS Overreach, Congress Has A Real Opportunity to Reform Conservation Easement Legislation"	

The Washington Times	5/19/19	Op-Ed	https://www.washingto ntimes.com/news/2019 /may/19/havana- ruined-impoverished- by-60-years-of-statism/		"Nothing Changes in Havana"	
Wispolitics	5/18/19	Op-Ed	https://www.wispolitic s.com/2019/ike- brannon-a-new- approach-for-economic- development-in- wisconsin/	Desirable to Live	"A new approach for economic development in Wisconsin"	
SSRN	5/8/19	Policy Analysis	https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract_id=3373135	Gene Replacement Therapy	"Properly Valuing Investment in the Development of Gene Replacement Therapy"	
The Washington Times	5/8/19	Op-Ed	https://www.washingto ntimes.com/news/2019 /may/8/dc-has-an- awful-parking-policy/	D.C. Parking	"Parking in the nation's capital is a giveaway to the rich"	
Forbes Online	4/30/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/04/30/drug-prices- should-reflect- efficacy/#3d9a6bcb4ec 4	Drug Prices	"Drug Prices Should Reflect Efficacy"	
Forbes Online	4/29/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/04/29/titanium- productions-perilous-u- s- future/#3d5887686a72	Titanium Sponge (lack of domestic producers)	"Titanium Production's Perilous U.S. Future"	
The Washington Times	4/24/19	Op-Ed	https://www.washingto ntimes.com/news/2019 /apr/24/peru-faced- down-terrorism- insurgencies-and- prevail/		"A Peruvian president's ignominious end"	

Forbes Online	4/22/19	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/04/22/ending-drug- rebates-will-not-reduce- drug- prices/#d772d7d20098	Drug Rebates	"Ending Drug Rebates Will Not Reduce Drug Prices"	
Forbes Online	4/9/19	Op-Ed			Intellectual Property	"Intellectual Property Disputes Threaten To Spread To New Venue"	
Forbes Online	4/5/19	Op-Ed			Debit Card Price Controls	"Imposing More Price Controls On Debit Cards May Not Help Consumers"	
SSRN	4/2/19	Policy Analysis	M. Kevin McG	https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract_id=3349786	H-4 Visa Work Authorization	"Repealing H-4 Visa Work Authorization: A Cost-Benefit Analysis"	
The Washington Post	3/27/19	Article	Kevin McGee	https://www.washingto npost.com/outlook/201 9/03/27/trump-says-he- wants-skilled- immigrants-hes-about- stop- working/?utm_term=.b 893a68ac608		"Trump says he wants skilled immigrants. He's about to stop 70,000 from working."	
Forbes Online	3/19/19	Op-Ed		' ''	Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac Need More Capital	"Fannie And Freddie Need More Capital"	

Forbes Online	3/18/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/03/18/the-folly-of- having-the-u-s- government-build-a-5g- network/#6abf3a893af 6	5G Network	"The Folly of Having The U.S. Government Build A 5G Network"	
Forbes Online	3/15/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/03/15/coming-to- grips-with-the-potential- benefits-of-gene- therapy/#11cbf96b517 2	Gene Therapy	"Coming to Grips with The Potential Benefits Of Gene Therapy"	
Forbes Online	3/14/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/03/14/stable-value- cryptocurrencies-need- regulatory- clarity/#2e4a5fee672b	Cryptocurrency Regulation	"Stable Value Cryptocurrencies Need Regulatory Clarity"	
The Washington Times	3/13/19	Op-Ed	https://www.washingto ntimes.com/news/2019 /mar/13/dc-metrobus- app-and-reality-out-of- sync/		"D.C. Metrobus app and reality out of sync"	
Forbes Online	3/5/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/03/05/at-what-cost- assessing-the-high-cost- of-removing-h-4-visa- holders-from-the- american-workforce/	H-4 Visa Holders	"At What Cost: Assessing the High Cost of Removing H-4 Visa Holders from the American Workforce"	

Forbes Online	2/28/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/02/28/the-real-time- payments-market-does- not-need-government- competition/#fd6678c4 b4e0		"The Real Time Payments Market Does Not Need Government Competition"	
Forbes Online	2/27/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/02/27/credit-card- revenue-increased- solely-because-we-use- credit-cards- more/#5883841a2b28	Credit Interchange Fees	"Credit Card Revenue Increased Solely Because We Use Credit Cards More"	
Wispolitics	2/22/19	Op-Ed	https://www.wispolitic s.com/2019/ike- brannon-abolishing- unfair-sales-act-would- help-mitigate-impact-of- gas-tax-hike/	Unfair Sales Act	"Abolishing Unfair Sales Act would help mitigate impact of gas tax hike"	
The Washington Times	2/17/19	Op-Ed	https://www.washingto ntimes.com/news/2019 /feb/17/encourage- metrobus-ridership/		"How to encourage people to take the bus"	
Peoria Journal Sta	2/15/19	Op-Ed	https://www.pjstar.co m/opinion/20190215/s potlight-minimum- wage-increase-bad-for- downstate	Illinois Minimum Wage	"Spotlight: Minimum wage increase bad for downstate"	
Forbes Online	2/8/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/02/08/putting- profits-before-politics- at-u-s-corporations/	Proxy Advisory Firms Investing due to Politics, not Profit seeking	"Putting Profits Before Politics At U.S. Corporations"	

Forbes Online	2/5/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/02/05/the-post-get- squishy-on-a- progressive-tax-code- when-it-comes-to- upper-class-incentives- for- housing/#5ecb40f4f23f	Eliminating state and local tax deducations	"The Post get Squishy on a Progressive Tax Code When it comes to Upper-Class Incentives for Housing"	
Forbes Online	2/1/19	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 19/02/01/the-facile- game-of-blaming- pharmacy-benefit- managers-for-high-drug- prices/#780a497468e2	Pharmacy Benefit Managers	"The Facile Game Of Blaming Pharmacy Benefit Managers For High Drug Prices"	
The Washington Post	12/28/18	Op-Ed	https://www.washingto npost.com/opinions/th e-government-should- pay-living-kidney- donors/2018/12/28/3f 61ef1e-056b-11e9-958c 0a601226ff6b_story.ht ml?noredirect=on&utm _term=.b9e4deade7fb	Donors	"The government should pay living kidney donors"	
The Hill	12/26/18	Op-Ed	https://thehill.com/opi nion/finance/421523- having-the-fed- compete-in-real-time- payment-services- makes-no-sense	Real-time payment services	"Having the Fed compete in real-time payment services makes no sense"	

The Weekly Standard	12/6/18	Article	https://www.weeklysta ndard.com/ike- brannon/a- conservative-case-for-a- carbon-tax-no-seriously		"A Conservative Case for a Carbon Tax. No, Seriously."	
RealClear Markets	12/6/18	Article	https://www.realclear markets.com/articles/2 018/12/06/jack_bogle_ has_discovered_a_dow nside_to_low_index_fe es_103526.html	Index Fees	"Jack Bogle Has Discovered a Downside to Low Index Fees"	
Forbes Online	11/27/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/11/27/legislative- clarity-on-utility-tokens- will-lead-to-greater- investor- confidence/#66662992 78c0	Utility Token Regulation	"Legislative Clarity On Utility Tokens Will Lead To Greater Investor Confidence"	
Forbes Online	11/13/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/11/13/who- ultimately-regulates- blockchain-and- cryptocurrencies-does- matter/#6b92b95b390	Cryptocurrency Regulation	"Who Ultimately Regulates Blockchain and Cryptocurrencies Does Matter"	
The Weekly Standard	11/12/18	Article	https://www.weeklysta ndard.com/ike- brannon/how-to-the- government-can-save-2- billion-in-prescription- drug-costs-with-eye- droppers	Prescription Drugs Costs	"How the Government Can Save \$2 Billion with Eye Droppers"	

The Weekly Standard	11/1/18	Article	https://www.weeklysta ndard.com/ike- brannon/is- cybersecurity-a-good- reason-to-subsidize- coal-and-nuclear- energy	Coal and Nuclear Energy Subsidies	-	
Forbes Online	10/31/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/10/31/department- of-transportations- deregulatory-actions- begin-to-bear- fruit/#65de3a3a7f9d	DOT De- Regulation	"Department Of Transportation's Deregulatory Actions Begin To Bear Fruit"	
Forbes Online	10/18/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/10/18/kill-the-proxy- zombies/#3db6d91727 27	Zombie Proposals	"Kill The Proxy Zombies"	
The Weekly Standard	10/15/18	Article	https://www.weeklysta ndard.com/ike- brannon/governments- want-access-to-your- data	Data Localization	"Governments Want Access To Your Data"	
Forbes Online	10/5/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/10/05/rethinking- the-mandate-that- investment-funds-vote- their- proxies/#1961ef7d6af6	Proxy Voting (Investment Managers)	"Rethinking The Mandate That Investment Funds Vote Their Proxies"	

Forbes Online	9/26/18	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/09/26/abolishing- drug-rebates-may-push- consumer-drug-costs- higher/#15a514d14488	Drug Rebates	"Abolishing Drug Rebates May Push Consumer Drug Costs Higher"	
The Weekly Standard	9/20/18	Article	Jared Whitley	https://www.weeklysta ndard.com/ike- brannon/how-to- protect-our-elections	Protecting Elections	"Here's How To Protect Our Elections"	
Badger Institute	9/6/18	Article	Andrew Hanson	https://www.badgerins titute.org/News/2017- 2018/A-Blueprint-for- Finding-More- Wisconsin- Workers.htm	Increasing Wisconsin Labor Force Participation Rate	"Drawing sidelined Wisconsin workers back to the labor force"	
SSRN	8/20/18	Policy Analysis	Jared Whitley	https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract_id=3224511	Proxy Advisory Firms	"Corporate Governance Oversight and Proxy Advisory Firms"	
Forbes Online	8/6/18	Op-Ed		m/sites/ikebrannon/20	Data possessed by Social Media Companies	Our Internet Data Behemoths Won't Swallow The World	
Forbes Online	7/26/18	Op-Ed		m/sites/ikebrannon/20	China's Unfair Treatment of American Companies	"Put Chinese And American Payment Companies On An Even Playing Field"	

Forbes Online	7/2/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/07/02/steel-tariffs- are-not-creating- american-jobs-at-least- not-in- missouri/#db54db5457 b2	Steel Tariffs	"Steel Tariffs Are Not Creating American JobsAt Least Not In Missouri"	
Forbes Online	6/11/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/06/11/bad-rules-can- cost-money-even- before-being- implemented/#685a3e 764be3	Beryllium Regulations	"Bad Rules Can Cost Money Even Before Being Implemented"	
SSRN	6/8/18	Policy Analysis	https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract_id=3186918	Drug Rebates	"Drug Rebates Do Not Increase Costs to Consumers"	
Forbes Online	6/6/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/06/06/pharmacy- benefit-managers-are- not-the-cause-of-high- prescription-drug- prices/#377634326b9a	Pharmacy Benefit Managers/High Cost of Prescription Drugs	"Pharmacy Benefit Managers Are Not The Cause Of High Prescription Drug Prices"	
The Weekly Standard	6/1/18	Article	https://www.weeklysta ndard.com/ike- brannon/remembering- longtime-congressional- gop-staffer-roger- mahan		"My Dinners with Roger"	

# Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 80 of 160

Forbes Online	5/31/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/05/31/financing- broadband-access- should-not-entail- taxing-broadband- access/#d26978596340	Financing Broadband	"Financing Broadband Access Should Not Entail Taxing Broadband Access"	
Forbes Online	5/28/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/06/28/a-better- eyedrop-may-save- billions-and-improve- americans- health/#151223e13503	Reducing Prescription Drugs Costs	"A Better Eyedrop May Save Billions and Improve Americans' Health"	
Forbes Online	5/25/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/05/25/if- employment-guide- immigration-policy- repealing-international- entrepreneur-visa- makes-no- sense/#76fb194e16bf	International Entreprenuer Visa	"If Employment Guide Immigration Policy, Repealing International Entrepreneur Visa Makes No Sense"	
Forbes Online	5/23/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/05/23/injecting- common-sense-into- financial- markets/#3dff822e1e8 3	_	"Injecting Common Sense Into Financial Markets"	

Forbes Online	5/17/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/05/17/a-tipped- minimum-wage-for-dc- waiters-is-opposed-by- dc-waiters-for-good- reason/#4c8c7a0a2b58	D.C. Restaurant worker minimum wage	"A Tipped Minimum Wage for DC Waiters Is Opposed by DC WaitersFor Good Reason"	
Forbes Online	5/3/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/#3 9290d684645	Airline Fees	"Airline Fees And Common Sense: Prohibiting Ancillary Charges Would Not Benefit Passengers"	
Forbes Online	5/1/18	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/05/01/end-the-food- truck-lottery-auctioning- spaces-benefits- consumers-and-the- city/#1e9150d94417		"End The Food Truck Lottery: Auctioning Spaces Would Benefit Consumers And The City"	
Cato at Liberty	4/26/18	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/blog/department-labor-determines-esg-efforts-are-not-fiduciary-best-interests-investors		"The Department of Labor Determines that ESG Efforts are not in the Fiduciary Best Interests of Investors"	
The Weekly Standard	4/16/18	Article	https://www.weeklysta ndard.com/ike- brannon/will-an- upcoming-supreme- court-decision-hurt-the- economy		"Will An Upcoming Supreme Court Decision Hurt the Economy?"	

			I	l 11	<u> </u>	In. =	
The Weekly Standard	4/9/18	Article		https://www.weeklysta ndard.com/ike- brannon/is-puerto-rico- serious-about- reforming	Puerto Rico Fiscal Reform	"Is Puerto Rico Serious About Reforming?"	
SSRN	3/20/18	Policy Anal	Michelle Han	https://papers.ssrn.com	Internet Sales Tax	"Internet Sales Taxes and the Discriminatory Burden on Remote Retailers – An Economic Analysis"	
The Weekly Standard	3/19/18	Article		https://www.weeklysta ndard.com/ike- brannon/marxism-for- our-times	Marxism	"Marxism For Our Times"	
SSRN	3/8/18	Policy Analysis		https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract_id=3133140	DACA	"A New Estimate of the Cost of Reversing DACA"	
Cato at Liberty	3/7/18	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/ blog/californias -pension-woes- exacerbated-politics	California Pension System	"California's Pension Woes Exacerbated by Politics"	
Peoria Journal Star	3/3/18	Op-Ed		https://www.pjstar.co m/opinion/20180303/s potlight-attacking- generics-will-only-hike- drug-prices	Generic Drugs	"Spotlight: Attacking generics will only hike drug prices"	
The Weekly Standard	2/27/18	Article		https://www.weeklysta ndard.com /ike-brannon/puerto- ricos-hurricane -damage-should-not- preclude-real -fiscal-reform	Puerto Rico Fiscal Reform	"Puerto Rico's Hurricane Damage Should Not Preclude Real Fiscal Reform"	

Cato Institute	2/15/18	Policy	Logan	https://www.cato.org/	DACA	"A New Estimate of	
	, , ,	Analysis	Albright, M. Kevin McGee	publications/working- paper/new-estimate- cost-reversing-daca		the Cost of Reversing DACA"	
Forbes Online	2/13/18	Op-Ed	Burchell Wilson	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/02/13/expanding- stock-market-wealth-to- the-middle- class/#2789bf9f2b3f	Shareholder Proposal	"Expanding Stock Market Wealth To The Middle Class	
Washington Examiner	2/6/18	Article	Charles Sauer	http://www.washingto nexaminer.com/will- the-sec-take-on-the- shareholder-proposal- process/article/264827	Shareholder Proposal	"Will the SEC take on the shareholder proposal process?"	
Forbes Online	1/26/18	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 18/01/26/of-user-fees- and-taxes-the- passenger-facility- charge-is-a-user-fee- and-it-shouldnt- become-a- tax/#71e5e0c535c4	Airline Fees	"Of User Fees And Taxes: The Passenger Facility Charge Is A User Fee, And It Shouldn't Become a Tax"	
The Weekly Standard	1/25/18	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/why-ill-be- watching-the-god-awful- pro-bowl-this- weekend/article/20112 85		"Why I'll Be Watching The God-Awful Pro Bowl This Weekend"	
Cato At Liberty	12/26/17	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/blog/fannie-freddie-continue-limbo-while-congress-looks-permanent-fix-housing-finance-market	Mortage Financing Reform	"Fannie and Freddie Continue in Limbo while Congress Looks for a Permanent Fix for the Housing Finance Market"	
L	1	l	İ	I	L	1	

Tax Notes	12/18/17	Article	Gordon Gray	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/arti cles/brannon-taxnotes- 12-18-17.pdf	Tax Reform	"The Incredible Durability of The U.S. Corporate Tax Rate"
Cato At Liberty	12/14/17	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/blog/lower-corporate-tax-rate-much-we-can-while-we-can	Tax Reform	"Lower the Corporate Tax Rate As Much As We Can, While We Can"
RealClearMarket s	12/14/17	Article	Jared Whitley	https://www.realclear markets.com/articles/2 017/12/14/without_ser ious_reforms_us_posta l_service_could_be_ne xt_bailout_recipient_10 3053.html	Postal Service	"Without Serious Reforms, U.S. Postal Service Could Be Next Bailout Recipient"
Forbes Online	12/13/17	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/12/13/exclude- puerto-rico-from-tax- reform/#5503e18370cd	Tax Reform	"Exclude Puerto Rico From Tax Reform"
The Weekly Standard	12/13/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/tax-breaks- for-the-wealthy-make- true-tax-reform-more- difficult/article/201082	Tax Reform	"Tax Breaks for the Wealthy Make True Tax Reform More Difficult"
The Weekly Standard	12/13/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-best- christmas-song-of-the- millennium/article/201 0831	Best Christmas Song	"The Best Christmas Song of the Millennium"
Bloomberg BNA	12/4/17	Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/arti cles/brannon- bloomberg-bna-12-04- 17.pdf		"The Benefits of Integrating the Personal and Corporate Tax Codes"

## Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 85 of 160

Cato Institute	12/1/17	Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 7/12/regulation-v40n4- 5.pdf	Tax Reform	"How to win friends and influence people while working in government: Harry Grubert 1937-2017"
Cato Institute	12/1/2017	Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 6/12/regulation-v39n4- 7 1.pdf#page=5	Antitrust	"When Does Antitrust Activity Stifle Innovation?"
Forbes Online	11/30/17	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/11/30/how-tax- reform-could- accelerate-gse-reform- and-not-necessarily-in- a-good- way/#2c3aab741013	GSE Reform	"How Taw Reform Could Accelerate GSE Reform and Not Necessarily in a Good Way"
The Weekly Standard	11/14/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/should- passive-funds-be- active/article/2010470	Index Funds	"Should Passive Funds Be Active?"
SSRN	11/12/2017	Policy Analysis	Ari Blask	https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract_id=3067573	National Flood Insurance Program	"Reforming the National Flood Insurance Program: Toward Private Flood Insurance"
The Weekly Standard	11/8/2017	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/tax-reform- must-not-keep-tax- breaks-for-real- estate/article/2010388	Tax Reform	"Tax Reform Must Not Keep Tax Breaks for Real Estate"

Forbes Online	11/7/17	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/11/07/hugh-hewitts- phony-budget- accounting-in-defense- of-the-mortgage- interest- deduction/#51f2edf85a c0	Interest	"Hugh Hewitt's Phony Budget Accounting In Defense Of The Mortgage Interest Deduction"	
Forbes Online	11/2/17	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/11/02/how-state- pension-funds-and- 401k-managers- prioritize-politics-over- returns/#2e20facc1e84	State Pension Funds and 401Ks	"How State Pension FundsAnd 401k Managers Prioritize Politics Over Returns"	
Bloomberg BNA	11/1/17	Article	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/arti cles/brannon-bna-11-1- 2017.pdf	Interest	"The Mortgage Interest Deduction Must Go"	
Forbes Online	10/24/17	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/10/24/what-do- manufacturers-want- from-tax-reform-heres- what-they-told- us/#1f465b551ffc	Tax Reform	"What Do Manufacturers Want from Tax Reform? Here's What they Told Us"	
The Weekly Standard	10/6/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/kevin-warsh- candidate-for-federal- reserve-chair-is-not- even-an- economist/article/2009 986	Federal Reserve	"Kevin Warsh, Candidate for Federal Reserve Chair, Is Not Even an Economist"	

Th 144	40/4/4-	A .12.1		h	T. D.C.	III	
The Weekly Standard	10/4/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-we-tax-	тах кетоrm	"How We Tax Employee-Ownership	
Standard							
				employee-ownership-is-		is One Thing our	
				one-thing-our-screwed-		Screwed Up Tax Code	
				up-tax-code-actually-		Actually Gets Right"	
				gets-			
				right/article/2009923			
Forbes Online	9/28/17	Op-Ed	Jared	https://www.forbes.co	South Korean	"A System On Trial:	Forbes op-ed by
			Whitley	m/sites/ikebrannon/20	political reform	South Korean	Ike Brannon and
				17/09/27/a-system-on-		Political Reform	Jared Whitley on
				trial-south-korean-		Requires Evidence,	South Korean
				political-reform-		Not Stagecraft"	political reform:
				requires-evidence-not-			"A System On
				stagecraft/#4b0c0a6a3			Trial: South
				57b			Korean Political
							Reform Requires
							Evidence, Not
							Stagecraft"
Cata At Liberty	0/20/17	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/	Jones Act	"The Dubious	
Cato At Liberty	9/20/1/	biog Post		blog/dubious-defense-	Jones Act	Defense of the Jones	
						Act"	
				jones-act_		ACL	
Tax Notes	9/25/17	Articlo	Michelle	https://object.cato.org/	Tay Poform	"The Equipment	
Tax Notes	3/23/17	Aiticic	Hanlon	sites/cato.org/files/arti	Tax Netolili	Manufacturing	
			Hallion	cles/brannon-taxnotes-		Industry's	
						Perspective on Tax	
				<u>v156n13.pdf</u>		· ·	
						Reform"	
The Mark !!	0/24/47	- امنام		haten //www.	Elandina	Illia Divinavita - Culti-	
The Weekly	9/21/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan	Fiood Insurance		
Standard				dard.com/in-pursuit-of-		Second Best Policy"	
				the-second-best-			
				policy/article/2009758			
Daily Record	9/19/17	Op-ed		http://www.mydailyrec		"Employer Tax Cuts	Weekly Standard
(NC)				ord.com/eedition/empl	cuts	Help Employees"	op-ed by Ike
				oyer-tax-cuts-help-			Brannon on
				employees/			employer tax
							cuts re-printed
							at Daily Record
							(NC): "Employer
							Tax Cuts Help
							Employees"
							Lilipioyees
			<u> </u>				

Cata At Libraria	0/10/17	Dia - Daat		h.t	Curren	IITha Casaa	
Cato At Liberty	9/19/1/	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/	Green	"The Green Investment Pension	
				blog/green-investment- pension-con	investment	Con"	
				pension-con		Con	
Newsweek	9/17/17	Article		http://www.newsweek.	Immigration	"RESCINDING DACA	
				com/rescinding-daca-		WILL COST THE US	
				will-cost-us-economy-		ECONOMY \$200	
				200-billion-666288		BILLION"	
The Weekly	9/13/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan	Tax Reform	"Cutting the	
Standard				dard.com/cutting-the-		Corporate Tax Can	
				corporate-tax-can-help-		Help Workers.	
				workers		Really."	
				really./article/2009647			
Weekly Standard	9/13/17	Op-ed		http://www.weeklystan	Corporate tax	"Cutting the	
				dard.com/cutting-the-	rate	Corporate Tax Can	
				corporate-tax-can-help-		Help Workers.	
				workers		Really."	
				really./article/2009647			
The Weekly	9/7/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan	NFL	"Bring on the	
Standard				dard.com/bring-on-the-		Hurricane Irma	
				hurricane-irma-		Bowl!"	
				bowl/article/2009565			
				2011, 41 110.0, 200000			
The Weekly	9/5/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan	Financial Crisis	"How Not to Fix	
Standard				dard.com/how-not-to-		Fannie Mae and	
				fix-fannie-mae-and-		Freddie Mac"	
				<u>freddie-</u>			
				mac/article/2009542			
Time Magazine	9/5/17	Op-ed	Ari Blask	http://time.com/49278	NFIP	"Hurricane Harvey	Ike Brannon and
				52/hurricane-harvey-		Proved We Need	Ari Blask
				flood-insurance/		More Flood	authored an op-
						Insurance	ed on the NFIP:
						Competition"	"Hurricane
							Harvey Proved
							We Need More
							Flood Insurance
							Competition"
							- Competition
ı		İ	l	I .	1	<u>I</u>	1

Regulation	9/1/17	Journal	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/	Regulatory	"Deregulation	
	5, 2, 27	Article	<b>Sat</b> tinis	sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 7/9/regulation-v40n3- 7 0.pdf#page=3	Reform	through No Regulation?"	
Regulation	9/1/17	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/9/regv36n3- 8n 6.pdf#page=13	Drug Legalization	"Legalizing Marijuana: Money Over Minds"	
Regulation	9/1/17	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 7/9/regulation-v40n3- 6.pdf	Telecommunicat ion Regulation	"The Innocation Won't Be Televised"	
Cato At Liberty	8/31/17	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/ blog/economic- budgetary-cost- repealing-daca-state- level	DACA	"The Economic and Budgetary Cost of Repealing DACA at the State Level"	
Cato At Liberty	8/31/17	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/ blog/will-harvey-reform- flood-insurance	Flood Insurance	"Will Harvey Reform Flood Insurance"	
SSRN	8/30/17	Policy Analysis		https://papers.ssrn.co m/sol3/papers.cfm?abs tract id=3028135	Income Tax	"Corporate Income Taxes and Labor: An Investigation of Empirical Evidence"	
The Weekly Standard	8/25/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-sordid- prosecution-of-aaron- schock/article/2009425	Aaron Schock	"The Sordid Prosecution of Aaron Schock"	
The Weekly Standard	8/21/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/ode-to-a- couch/article/2009234	Garbage	"Ode to a Couch"	

# Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 90 of 160

Badger Institute	8/16/17	Article		https://www.badgerins titute.org/Commentary /Foxconn-deal-There- are-better-ways-to- create-jobs-and- growth.htm	Foxconn Tax Incentives	"Foxconn deal: There are better ways to create jobs and growth"	
Forbes Online	8/14/17	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/08/14/president- moons-anti-corporate- policies-jeopardize- south-koreas- future/#49a0b4091ce3	South Korea's anti-corporate policies	"President Moon's Anti-Corporate Policies Jeopardize South Korea's Future"	
The Weekly Standard	8/9/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/rememberin g-glen- campbell/article/20092 12	Glenn Campbell	"Remembering Glen Campbell"	
Politico	8/8/17	Op-ed	Ari Blask	http://www.politico.co m/agenda/story/2017/ 08/08/hidden-subsidy- rich-flood-insurance- 000495	Federal flood insurance	"The government's hidden housing subsidy for the rich"	Ike Brannon and Ari Blask authored an op- ed on federal flood insurance: "The government's hidden housing subsidy for the rich"
The Weekly Standard	8/4/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/rename-the- rose-fitzgerald- greenway/article/2009 156	Rose Fitzgerald Greenway	"Rename the Rose Fitzgerald Greenway"	
The Weekly Standard	8/3/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-deep- state-takes-on- tillerson/article/200911 Z		"The Deep State Takes on Tillerson"	

## Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 91 of 160

The Weekly	0/2/17	Articlo		http://www.wookbystan	Virginia Elections	"A Tough But Tolling	
The Weekly Standard	8/2/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-tough-but- telling-race-in- virginia/article/200909 9	Virginia Elections	"A Tough But Telling Race in Virginia"	
Forbes Online	7/31/17	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/07/31/puerto-ricos- fuzzy- economics/#5172d451 3f83	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico's Fuzzy Economics"	
The Weekly Standard	7/27/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/still- stupid/article/992197	Economy	"Still Stupid"	
The Weekly Standard	7/27/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/will-illinois- need-a-federal- bailout/article/2008648	crisis	"Will Illinois Need a Federal Bailout?"	
The Hill	7/20/17	Op-Ed	Ari Blask	http://thehill.com/blog s/congress- blog/politics/343031- the-private-alternative- to-the-national-flood- insurance-program	Flood Insurance	"The private alternative to the National Flood Insurance Program "	
The Hill Online	7/20/17	Op-ed	Ari Blask	http://thehill.com/blog s/congress- blog/politics/343031- the-private-alternative- to-the-national-flood- insurance-program	Federal flood insurance	"The private alternative to the National Flood Insurance Program "	Ike Brannon and Ari Blask co- authored an op- ed on federal flood insurance: "The private alternative to the National Flood Insurance Program"

Cato Institute	7/19/17	Policy Analysis	Ari Black	https://www.cato.org/ publications/policy- analysis/reforming- national-flood- insurance-program- toward-private-flood	Flood Insurance	"Reforming the National Flood Insurance Program: Toward Private Flood Insurance"	
Hudson Institute	7/10/17	Policy Analysis	Thomas J. Duesterberg	https://www.hudson.or g/research/13748-tax- reform-and-the- republican- manufacturing-and- growth-agendas	Tax Reform	"Tax Reform and the Republican Manufacturing and Growth Agendas"	
Peoria Journal Star	6/29/17	Op-Ed		http://www.pjstar.com /opinion/20170629/bra nnon-hello-uncle-sam- goodbye-illinois- constitution	Illinois	"Brannon: Hello Uncle Sam, goodbye Illinois Constitution"	
Peoria Journal Star (IL)	6/29/17	Op-ed			Illinois' debt crisis	"Brannon: Hello Uncle Sam, goodbye Illinois Constitution"	Weekly Standard (IL) op-ed by Ike Brannon on the Illinois debt crisis re-printed at Peoria Journal Star (IL): "Brannon: Hello Uncle Sam, goodbye Illinois Constitution"
Weekly Standard	6/27/17	Op-ed		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/will-illinois- need-a-federal- bailout/article/2008648	Whether Illinois will need a federal bailout	"Will Illinois Need a Federal Bailout?"	
Cato At Liberty	6/20/17	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/ blog/towards-private- flood-insurance-market	Private Flood insurance	"Towards a Private Flood Insurance Market"	
Cato At Liberty	6/15/17	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/ blog/impetus-gse- reform	GSE Reform	"The Impetus for GSE Reform"	

# Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 93 of 160

The Weekly Standard	6/9/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-solar- power-market-is-under- threatfrom-one-of-its- own/article/2008413		"The Solar Power Market Is Under ThreatFrom One of Its Own"	
Weekly Standard	6/9/17	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-solar- power-market-is-under- threatfrom-one-of-its- own/article/2008413	The solar power industry	"The Solar Power Market Is Under ThreatFrom One of Its Own"	
The Weekly Standard	6/6/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/david- malpass-treasurys- conservative-standard- bearer/article/2008352	Department of Treasury	"David Malpass, Treasury's Conservative Standard Bearer"	
The Weekly Standard	6/5/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/never-eat- lunch-at-your- desk/article/2008339	Lunch	"Never Eat Lunch at Your Desk"	
Peoria Journal Star	5/29/17	Op-ed	https://www.pjstar.co m/article/20170629/op inion/170629407	Illinois Budget	"Hello Uncle Sam, goodbye Illinois Constitution"	
The Weekly Standard	5/24/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/puerto-ricos- faux-pension- reform/article/2008192	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico's Faux Pension Reform"	
Weekly Standard	5/24/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/puerto-ricos- faux-pension- reform/article/2008192	Pension Plan	"Puerto Rico's Faux Pension Reform"	

Cato At Liberty  Forbes Online	5/24/17	Blog Post	blog/wall-street-journal- declares-creditor- emptor	Puerto Rico  Corporate tax	"The Wall Street Journal Declares "Creditor Emptor""  "How Would	
roines offilire	3/22/17	Ор-Lu	m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/05/22/how-would- corporate-tax-reform- benefit- workers/#2157e0222b9 d	reform	Corporate Tax Reform Benefit Workers?"	
The Weekly Standard	5/22/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/take-a- hike/article/2008164	Government Subsidies	"Take a Hike"	
Investor's Business Daily	5/22/17	Op-ed	http://www.investors.c om/politics/commentar y/the-high-cost-of-not- paying-your-bills- puerto-ricos- bankruptcy-bodes- poorly-for-islands- future/	Puerto Rico	"The High Cost Of Not Paying Your Bills: Puerto Rico's Bankruptcy Bodes Poorly For Its Future"	
Milwaukee Wisconsin Journal Sentinel (WI)	5/21/17			Minimum markup laws	"Flanders, Brannon: Repeal minimum markup law"	Ike Brannon and Will Flanders authored an oped on minimum markup laws: "Flanders, Brannon: Repeal minimum markup law"
The Weekly Standard	5/15/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/no-dems- havent-cracked-the- code-for-winning-over- rural-trump- supporters/article/2008 058		"No, Dems Haven't Cracked the Code for Winning Over Rural Trump Supporters"	

National Review	5/15/17	Book		https://www.nationalre	"IFK and the	"The Ture-Kennedy	
National Review	3/13/17	Review		view.com/magazine/20	Reagan	Blueprint"	
		Iteview		17-05-15-0100/jfk-and-	Revolution: A	Бисринс	
				the-reagan-revolution	Secret History of		
				the reagan revolution	American		
					Prosperity, by		
					Lawrence		
					Kudlow and		
					Brian		
					Domitrovic"		
The Hill Online	5/10/17	On od		http://thehill.com/blog		"Beryllium broadside:	
The fill Offille	3/10/17	Ор-ей		s/pundits-	regulations	Obama's last-minute	
				blog/economy-	regulations	rulemaking will cost	
				budget/332805-		iobs"	
				beryllium-broadside-		Jobs	
				obamas-last-minute-			
				rulemaking-will-cost			
The Hill	5/10/17	الم الم		http://thehill.com/blog	Economy	"Beryllium broadside:	
The Hill	5/10/17	Ор-Ей			Economy	Obama's last-minute	
				s/pundits-			
				blog/economy-		rule-making will cost	
				budget/332805-		jobs"	
				beryllium-broadside-			
				obamas-last-minute-			
				rulemaking-will-cost			
Cata At Libarto	F /0 /47	Dia - Daat		https://www.asta.ast/	O a su a a ti a a a l	"A New Approach for	
Cato At Liberty	5/8/17	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/	Occupational		
				blog/new-approach-	Licensing	Occupational	
				occupational-licensing-		Licensing in	
				<u>wisconsin</u>		Wisconsin"	
Wisconsin	5/1/17	Policy	Will	https://object.cato.org/	Minimum	"A Policy in Search of	
Institute for Law	3/1/1/	Analysis	Flanders	sites/cato.org/files/arti	markup laws	a Problem: A Study of	
& Liberty		Allalysis	rialiuers	cles/brannon-will-may-	markup iaws	the Impact of	
& Liberty				2017.pdf		-	
				<u>2017.pai</u>		Minimum Markup	
						Laws on Small	
						Businesses and Gas	
						Stations"	
The Meddy	1/27/47	Article		http://www.vocaldinates	Economi	"The Wheels of	
The Weekly	4/27/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan	Economy	"The Wheels of	
Standard				dard.com/the-wheels-		Change Turn Slowly"	
				of-change-turn-			
				slowly/article/2007793			

The March	4/40/47	- امنید	http://www.	T D-f- · · ·	lloufana la Committe	
The Weekly Standard	4/18/17	JAT LICIE	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/oxfam-is- opposing-corporate-tax- reform-that-would- actually-be-conducive- to-economic- growth/article/200768 1		"Oxfam Is Opposing Corporate Tax Reform That Would Actually Be Conducive to Economic Growth"	
Weekly Standard	4/18/17	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/oxfam-is- opposing-corporate-tax- reform-that-would- actually-be-conducive- to-economic- growth/article/200768	reform	"Oxfam Is Opposing Corporate Tax Reform That Would Actually Be Conducive to Economic Growth"	
The Weekly Standard	4/10/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/time-to-fix- fannie-and- freddie/article/200746 5	Financial Crisis	"Time to Fix Fannie and Freddie"	
The Weekly Standard	4/6/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-tax- reform-could-hasten- housing-finance- reform/article/2007536	Tax Reform	"How Tax Reform Could Hasten Housing-Finance Reform"	
Cato At Liberty	4/5/17	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/puerto-rico- continues-ignore- congress	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico Continues to Ignore Congress"	
The Weekly Standard	4/5/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/rock-and-roll- hall-of-fame-hoochie- coo/article/2007523		"Rock and Roll Hall of Fame Hoochie Coo"	
Cato At Liberty	4/4/17	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/blog/marketplace-radio-laments-ubers-victims-investment-banks	Investment Banks	"Marketplace Radio Laments Uber's Victims: Investment Banks"	

Wisconsin Interest	4/1/17	Article	Devorah Goldman	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/arti	Opioids	"A Deadly Grip: Wisconsin's opioid
interest			Columbia	cles/brannon-goldman- wisconsin-interest- spring-2017.pdf		scourge: Its origins and possible solutions"
WPRI Special Report	4/1/17	White Paper	Logan Albright	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/arti cles/brannon-wpri- special-report.pdf	Occupational Licensing	"Occupational Licensing in Wisconsin: Who Are We Really Protecting?"
Grassroot Institute of Hawaii	4/1/17	Article	Russ Kasian, Jeff Pagel	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/arti cles/brannon- grassroots-hawaii.pdf	Shipping Regulation	"THE JONES ACT IN PERSPECTIVE: A survey of costs and effects of the 1920 Merchant Marine Act"
Cato At Liberty	3/20/17	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/blog/puerto-ricos-half-hearted-stab-fiscal-reform-threatens-islands-long-term-prospects	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico's Half- Hearted Stab at Fiscal Reform Threatens the Island's Long- Term Prospects"
Forbes Online	3/15/17	Op-Ed		https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/03/15/rushed- beryllium-rule-deserves- a-second- look/#12cbaf095598	Beryllium	"Rushed Beryllium Rule Deserves A Second Look"
Regulation	3/1/17	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 7/3/regulation-v40n1- 8_1.pdf#page=4	Regulatory Reform	"Obama's Record- Setting 'Midnight'"

# Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 98 of 160

Forbes Online	2/27/17	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/02/27/improve- dont-destroy-the-gig- economy/#36d9a2b225 ab	Gig Economy	"Improve, Don't Destroy, The Gig Economy"	
The Weekly Standard	2/24/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-house- tax-reform-plan-is-not- a-fundraising- ploy/article/2006988	Tax Reform	"The House Tax Reform Plan Is Not a Fundraising Ploy"	
Weekly Standard	2/24/17	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-house- tax-reform-plan-is-not- a-fundraising- ploy/article/2006988	Tax reform	"The House Tax Reform Plan Is Not a Fundraising Ploy"	
Weekly Standard	2/23/17	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-one- companys-perfidy- makes-your-cell-phone- more-expensive-than-it- should- be/article/2006927	America	"How One Company's Perfidy Makes Your Cell Phone More Expensive Than It Should Be"	
Weekly Standard	2/23/17	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-one- companys-perfidy- makes-your-cell-phone- more-expensive-than-it- should- be/article/2006927	America	"How One Company's Perfidy Makes Your Cell Phone More Expensive Than It Should Be"	

The Weekly Standard	2/22/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-one- companys-perfidy- makes-your-cell-phone- more-expensive-than-it- should- be/article/2006927	Finances	"How One Company's Perfidy Makes Your Cell Phone More Expensive Than It Should Be"	
Forbes Online	2/21/17	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/02/21/its-more- important-to-get- puerto-rican-pension- reform-right-than-to-do- it-fast/#5850438c4e37	Puerto Rican pension reform	"It's More Important To Get Puerto Rican Pension Reform Right Than To Do It Fast"	
Forbes Online	2/21/17	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/02/21/its-more- important-to-get- puerto-rican-pension- reform-right-than-to-do- it-fast/#6cd5b0b14e37	Puerto Rican pension reform	"It's More Important To Get Puerto Rican Pension Reform Right Than To Do It Fast"	
The Weekly Standard	2/17/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/bob-michel- house-gop-statesman- across-five-decades- dies-at-age- 93/article/2006892	Bob Michael	"Bob Michel, House GOP Statesman Across Five Decades, Dies at Age 93"	
The Weekly Standard	2/14/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/revenge-of- the- nerds/article/2006817	Tax Reform	"Revenge of the Nerds"	
The Weekly Standard	2/13/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/housings- drag-on-the- economy/article/20066 59	Economy	"Housing's Drag on the Economy"	

### Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 100 of 160

The Meakler	2/12/17	Articlo	http://www.wookhist	Infractreture	"Lot's Doost Duildin-"	
The Weekly Standard	2/13/17	IAITICIE	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/lets-boost- building/article/200672 5	inirastrcture	"Let's Boost Building"	
The Weekly Standard	2/1/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-the-nfl- can-make-a-bigger- investment-to-combat- cte/article/2006609	NFL	"How the NFL Can Make a Bigger Investment to Combat CTE"	
The Weekly Standard	1/25/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/what-dow- 20000- means/article/2006484	Economy	"What Dow 20,000 Means"	
The Weekly Standard	1/24/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-pro-bowl- takes-a-step-toward- resembling-a-real-nfl- game/article/2006467		"The Pro Bowl Takes a Step Toward Resembling a Real NFL Game"	
The Weekly Standard	1/23/17	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/liberal- opposition-to-new- housing-reaches-its- reductio-ad- absurdum/article/2006 442	Infrastrcture	"Liberal Opposition to New Housing Reaches its Reductio Ad Absurdum"	
Cato At Liberty	1/18/17	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/economic-fiscal- impact-repealing-daca	DACA	"The Economic and Fiscal Impact of Repealing DACA"	
Forbes Online	1/18/17	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 17/01/18/the-high- costs-of-an-immediate- repeal-of-daca/	Repealing DACA	"The High Costs Of An Immediate Repeal Of DACA"	

### Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 101 of 160

The Weekly Standard	1/16/17	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/puerto-ricos- new-governor-should- be-given-time-to-get- recovery-plan- right/article/2006319	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico's New Governor Should be Given Time to Get Recovery Plan Right"	
The Weekly Standard	12/22/16	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-trump- can-repeal-and-replace- daca/article/2005986	Immigration	"How Trump Can Repeal and Replace DACA"	
Weekly Standard	12/22/16	Op-ed		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-trump- can-repeal-and-replace- daca/article/2005986	Trump repealing DACA	"How Trump Can Repeal and Replace DACA"	
The Weekly Standard	12/20/16	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-fda- finally-sees-the-light-on- chantix/article/200596 2		"The FDAFinally Sees the Light on Chantix"	
The Hill	12/20/16	Op-Ed		http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/finance/311179- will-trump-let-the-eu- kill-a-us-manufacturing- deal	Economy	"Will Trump let the EU kill a US manufacturing deal?"	
The Hill	12/13/16	Op-Ed	Logan Albright	http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/finance/310156- puerto-ricos-path- forward-shouldnt- include-old-advisers	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico's path forward shouldn't include old advisers"	

Peoria Journal	12/9/16	Op-ed	https://www.cato.org/	Cutting	"Cutting corporate
Star (IL)			publications/commenta ry/cutting-corporate- tax-rates-would-help- peoria	corporate taxes	tax rates would help Peoria"
Peoria Journal Star	12/9/16	Op-Ed	http://www.pjstar.com /opinion/20161209/sp otlight-cutting- corporate-tax-rates- would-help-peoria	Tax Reform	"Spotlight: Cutting corporate tax rates would help Peoria"
The Weekly Standard	12/7/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/puerto-rico- is-using-a-phony- pension-crisis-to- sabotage- reform/article/2005715		"Puerto Rico Is Using a Phony Pension Crisis to Sabotage Reform"
Cato At Liberty	12/5/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/problems-paid- family-leave-redux	Family Leave	"Problems with Paid Family Leave Redux"
Desert Sun	12/4/16	Column	http://www.desertsun. com/story/opinion/201 6/12/04/column-heres- how-begin-fixing- colleges/94433774/	Education	"Column: Here's how to begin fixing colleges"
Forbes Online	12/4/16	Op-Ed	https://www.forbes.co m/sites/ikebrannon/20 16/12/04/how-and- why-we-should-fix-the- biodiesel-tax- credit/#7306fb894c57	Tax Credits	"How And Why We Should Fix The Biodiesel Tax Credit"
Regulation	12/1/16	Journal Article	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 6/12/regulation-v39n4- 7 4.pdf#page=10	Interest	"Defending the Indefensible Mortgage Interest Deduction"

Regulation	12/1/16		Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/		"Five Guiding
		Article		sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 6/12/regulation-v39n4- 4.pdf	Reform	Thoughts for Regulatory Reform in the Next Administration"
Cato At Liberty	11/28/16	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/ blog/dcs-paid-family- leave-bucks-trend- economics	Economy	"DC's Paid Family Leave Bucks the Trend—and Economics"
The Weekly Standard	11/18/16	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the- dangerous-ideological- roots-of-climate- disclosure/article/2005 456	Environment	"The Dangerous Ideological Roots of Climate Disclosure"
The Weekly Standard	11/17/16	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/puerto-ricos- oversight-board-may- be-on-the-verge-of-a- misstep/article/200542 2	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico's Oversight Board May Be on the Verge of a Misstep"
Cato At Liberty	11/4/16	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/ blog/washington-dc- progressives-fight- reserve-gas-stations	Gas Stations	"Washington DC Progressives Fight to Preserve Gas Stations"
The Weekly Standard	11/1/16	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-unofficial- gear-of-major-league- baseball/article/200518 1		"The 'Unofficial' Gear of Major League Baseball"
Foundation for Economic Education	10/28/16	Article		https://fee.org/articles/ is-parking-really-free-if- you-cant-find-any/	Transportation	"Is Parking Really "Free" If You Can't Find Any?"
Cato At Liberty	10/27/16	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/ blog/why-dont-we- allow-markets-dictate- parking-policy	Parking Policy	"Why Don't We Allow Markets to Dictate Parking Policy?"

The Weekly	10/24/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan	MLB	"Harry Caray Is My	
Standard			dard.com/harry-caray- is-my- wingman/article/20048 82		Wingman"	
Weekly Standard	10/24/16	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/harry-caray- is-my- wingman/article/20048 82	Harry Caray	"Harry Caray Is My Wingman"	
The Weekly Standard	10/17/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-chicago- cubs-love- story/article/2004913	MLB	"A Chicago Cubs Love Story"	
The Hill	10/13/16	Op-Ed	http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/economy- budget/300836-how- puerto-ricos-oversight- board-can-follow- others-success	Puetro Rico	"How Puerto Rico's oversight board can follow others' success"	
The Weekly Standard	10/10/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/as-goes- puerto-rico-so-go-the- states/article/2004802	MLB	"As Goes Puerto Rico So Go the States?"	
Cato At Liberty	10/7/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/ending-tax-breaks- real-estate	Tax Policy	"Ending the Tax Breaks for Real Estate"	
The Weekly Standard	10/7/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/incompetenc e-is-no-reason-for-a- government-agency- not-to-do-its- job/article/2004766	FDA	"Incompetence Is No Reason for a Government Agency Not To Do Its Job"	
Cato At Liberty	10/4/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/blog/answer-new-government-program-whats-question	Limited Government	"The Answer Is a New Government Program. What's the Question?"	

The Weekly Standard	10/3/16		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the- complicated-dynamics- of-insurance- companies-and-drug- prices/article/2004670		"The Complicated Dynamics of Insurance Companies and Drug Prices"	
Weekly Standard	10/3/16	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the- complicated-dynamics- of-insurance- companies-and-drug- prices/article/2004670	Obamacare	"The Complicated Dynamics of Insurance Companies and Drug Prices"	
Lincoln Times- News (NC)	9/16/16	Op-ed	https://www.cato.org/ blog/reason-why- poverty-rate-fell	Poverty	"The reason why the poverty rate fell"	
Cato At Liberty	9/13/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/reason-why- poverty-rate-fell	Poverty	"The Reason Why the Poverty Rate Fell"	
The Weekly Standard	9/12/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/up-in- smoke/article/2004289	FDA	"Up in Smoke"	
Weekly Standard	9/12/16		smoke/article/2004289	labels and	"Up in Smoke"	Ike Brannon and Devorah Goldman authored an oped on FDA warning labels and smoking: "Up in Smoke"
Cato At Liberty	9/6/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/tentative-steps- away-gas-tax-towards- better-system	Tax Policy	"Tentative Steps Away from the Gas Tax and towards a Better System"	
Regulation	9/1/16	Journal Article	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 6/9/regulation-v39n3- 6.pdf#page=2	Lending Policy	"The Government is Lousy at Lending"	

T	- 1 - 1	I I	<u> </u>	I	In
Cato At Liberty	8/4/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/its-time-end- governments-outsized- role-housing-finance	Finance	"It's Time to End the Government's Outsized Role in Housing Finance"
Cato At Liberty	8/3/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/how-growth-can- impact-spending-why- spending-doesnt- necessarily-drive- growth	Economy	"How Growth Can Impact Spending and Why Spending Doesn't Necessarily Drive Growth"
Cato At Liberty	7/28/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/sales-tax-holidays- make-terrible-tax- policy	Tax Policy	"Sales Tax Holidays Make for Terrible Tax Policy"
Cato At Liberty	7/19/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/tyranny-free- parking	Free Parking	"The Tyranny of Free Parking"
The Hill	7/8/16	Op-ed		Reducing drug deaths through legalization	"Global Warming Alarmist Reveals The Anti-Science Con"
The Hill	7/8/16	Op-Ed	http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/healthcare/28696 5-legalize-marijuana- and-reduce-deaths- from-drug-abuse	Marijuana	"Legalize marijuana and reduce deaths from drug abuse"
The Weekly Standard	6/28/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/puerto-ricos- false- deadline/article/20030 61	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico's False Deadline"
The Weekly Standard	6/24/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/for-whom- the-bridge- tolls/article/2003016	Infrastructure	"For Whom the Bridge Tolls"

The Weekly Standard	6/21/16		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/treasurys-tax- regulations-will- dampen-domestic- investment/article/200 2945	Treasury	"Treasury's Tax Regulations Will Dampen Domestic Investment"	
Weekly Standard	6/21/16	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/treasurys-tax- regulations-will- dampen-domestic- investment/article/200 2945		"Treasury's Tax Regulations Will Dampen Domestic Investment"	
The Weekly Standard	6/13/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/fixing- regulatory- overreach/article/2002 667	Federal Regulation	"Fixing Regulatory Overreach"	
Weekly Standard	6/13/16	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/fixing- regulatory- overreach/article/2002 667	Financial regulatory overreach	"Fixing Regulatory Overreach"	
The Hill	6/13/16	Op-Ed	http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/economy- budget/283226-how- the-puerto-rico-rescue- makes-state-pensioners- the-big		"How the Puerto Rico rescue makes state pensioners the big winner"	
The Hill Online	6/13/16	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/treasurys-tax- regulations-will- dampen-domestic- investment/article/200 2945	•	"How the Puerto Rico rescue makes state pensioners the big winner"	
The Weekly Standard	6/6/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-to- change-bankruptcy- law/article/2002578	Bankruptcy	"How to Change Bankruptcy Law"	

Weekly Standard	6/6/16	On-ed		http://www.weeklystan	Bankruntcy laws	"How to Change	
Weekly Standard	0,0,10	op cu		dard.com/how-to- change-bankruptcy- law/article/2002578	Bankruptey laws	Bankruptcy Law"	
Regulation	6/4/16	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 6/4/regulation-v39n1- 9 3.pdf#page=8	Economics	"Are Cigarettes a Giffen Good for Poor, Expectant Woman?"	
Regulation	6/4/16	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 6/4/regulation-v39n1- 9_1.pdf#page=3	Transplant policy	"Could PAYGO End the Prohibition on Paying Organ Donors?"	
Regulation	6/4/16	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 6/4/regulation-v39n1- 10- updated_6.pdf#page=1 5	Safety Regulation	"Don't Stop Me Before I Injure Myself"	
Regulation	6/1/16	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 6/6/regulation-v39n2- 6_2.pdf#page=8		"Free Parking's High Cost on Transit"	
Regulation		Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 6/6/regulation-v39n2- 6 0.pdf#page=2	Paid Leave	"Would Expanded Family Leave Hurt Workers?"	
The Weekly Standard	5/30/16	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-gig-is- up/article/2002474	Economy	"The Gig Is Up"	

Weekly Standard	5/30/16	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan	U.S. economy	"The Gig Is Up"
			dard.com/the-gig-is- up/article/2002474		
RealClearMarket s	5/26/16	Article	http://www.realclearm arkets.com/articles/201 6/05/26/the gig econo my is great for the u s economy 102186.ht ml	Economy	"The 'Gig' Economy Is Great For the U.S. Economy"
The Weekly Standard	5/20/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/treasury- pretends-not-to-know- what-a-bailout- is/article/2002501	Department of Treasury	"Treasury Pretends Not to Know What a 'Bailout' Is"
Weekly Standard	5/20/16	Op-ed	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/treasury- pretends-not-to-know- what-a-bailout- is/article/2002501	Puerto Rico's debt crisis	"Treasury Pretends Not to Know What a 'Bailout' Is"
Tax Notes	5/9/16	Article	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/arti cles/151tn0963- brannon.pdf	Tax Reform	"The Ineluctable Logic of Adopting an IP Box Tax Regime"
The Hill	5/5/16	Op-Ed	http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/economy- budget/278804-what- we-do-in-puerto-rico- sets-a-precedent-like-it- or-not	Puerto Rico	"What we do in Puerto Rico sets a precedent, like it or not"
The Hill Online	5/5/16	Op-ed	http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/economy- budget/278804-what- we-do-in-puerto-rico- sets-a-precedent-like-it- or-not	Puerto Rico's debt problems	"What we do in Puerto Rico sets a precedent, like it or not"

RealClearMarket	5/2/16	Article	http://www.realclearm	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico	
s	3/2/10	AIIUUE	arkets.com/articles/201 6/05/02/puerto_rico_c ontagion_will_cost_tax payers_102149.html	i dei to Nico	Contagion Will Cost Taxpayers"	
RealClearMarket s	4/28/16	Article	http://www.realclearm arkets.com/articles/201 6/04/28/treasury and fed team up to creat e the next meltdown 102140.html		"Treasury and Fed Team Up to Create the Next Meltdown"	
TribTalk	4/26/16	Article	https://www.tribtalk.or g/2016/04/26/texas- strong-economic- growth-is-a-cause-and- effect-of-immigration/	Immigration	"Texas' strong economic growth is a cause — and effect — of immigration"	
Cato At Liberty	4/26/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/who-are-victims- volkswagen-scandal- not-their-customers	Volkswagon Scandal	"Who Are the Victims of the Volkswagen Scandal? Not Their Customers"	
The Weekly Standard	4/25/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/we-need-a- serious-approach-to- international-tax- reform/article/2002106	Tax Reform	"We Need a Serious Approach to International Tax Reform"	
Cato At Liberty	4/22/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/food-labeling- regulations-are-bad- health	Food Labels	"Food Labeling Regulations Are Bad for Your Health"	
Cato At Liberty	4/22/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/blog/lets-name-something-cool-after-prince-stop-naming-things-after-politicians-while-were-it	Naming Rights	"Let's Name Something Cool after Prince. And Stop Naming Things after Politicians While We're at It"	

# 

Peoria Journal Star  The Weekly Standard	4/22/16		/news who-w from-p peoria	www.pjstar.com/20160422/op-ed- yould-benefit- per-mile-fee- ns www.weeklystan om/luck-o-the-		"Op-Ed: Who would benefit from a per- mile fee? Peorians" "Luck o' the Turkish"	
Stanuaru				om/lack-o-trie- n/article/2002045			
The Weekly Standard	4/15/16	Article	dard.c sorkin in-the- great-	www.weeklystan om/andrew-ross- s-misplaced-faith- non-economist- men-of- rticle/2001993		"Andrew Ross Sorkin's Misplaced Faith in the Non- economist Great Men of FSOC"	
Cato At Liberty	4/14/16	Blog Post	blog/la inconv change legalit	//www.cato.org/ aws-are- renient-just- e-them-dubious- y-another-puerto- reform	Puerto Rico	"If the Laws are Inconvenient, Just Change Them: The Dubious Legality of Another Puerto Rican Reform"	
The Hill	4/14/16	Op-Ed	s/pund blog/e budge obama suprer	thehill.com/blog dits- conomy- t/276263-let- a-have-his- ne-court-justice- nange-for	Tax Reform	"Let Obama have his Supreme Court justice, in exchange for tax reform"	
The Weekly Standard	4/11/16	Article	<u>dard.c</u> takes-	www.weeklystan om/government- aim-at-fitness- ctors/article/2001	Labor	"Government Takes Aim at Fitness Instructors"	

The Weekly Standard	4/8/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the- proposed-puerto-rico- bailout-is-good-on- rhetoric-but-bad-in- reality/article/2001908	Puerto Rico	"The Proposed Puerto Rico Bailout is Good on Rhetoric But Bad in Reality"
Foundation for Economic Education	3/18/16	Article	https://fee.org/articles/ make-risky-loans-dont- charge-for-them/	Federal Regulation	"Feds' Crazy Plan: Make Risky Loans, Don't Charge for Them"
The Weekly Standard	3/17/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/tax-policy- not-luck-of-the-irish-is- responsible-for-irelands- economic- success/article/200160 4		"Tax Policy, Not Luck of the Irish, Is Responsible For Ireland's Economic Success"
Cato At Liberty	3/16/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/government- directed-lending-comes- america	Government Lending	"Government- Directed Lending Comes to America"
The Weekly Standard	3/14/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/higher-ed- higher- prices/article/2001409	Education	"Higher Ed, Higher Prices"
Cato At Liberty	3/10/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/blog/stop-encouraging-homeownership	Homeownership	"Stop Encouraging Homeownership"
Cato At Liberty	3/3/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/blog/administrations-puerto-rico-jujitsu-threatens-states-ability-borrow	State's Rights/Puerto Rico	"The Administration's Puerto Rico Jujitsu Threatens the States' Ability to Borrow"
The Weekly Standard	3/2/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/dusty- agonistes/article/20013 61	MLB	"Dusty Agonistes"

The Hill  The Weekly	2/24/16		http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/finance/270567- what-would-a-puerto- rican-bankruptcy-look- like		"What would a Puerto Rican bankruptcy look like?"  "Let Them Go	
Standard	2/22/10	Article	dard.com/let-them-go- bankrupt/article/20010 47	Student Loans	Bankrupt"	
Cato At Liberty	2/5/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/using- congressional-budget- rules-not-save-money	Congressional Budget	"Using Congressional Budget Rules To (Not) Save Money"	
The Weekly Standard	2/2/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/why-its-so- important-to-get- puerto-ricos-reform- right/article/2000873	Puerto Rico	"Why It's So Important To Get Puerto Rico's Reform Right"	
The Weekly Standard	2/1/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/retire-this- idea/article/2000698	State Debt	"Retire This Idea"	
The Weekly Standard	1/30/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-pro-bowl- should-at-least- resemble-an-actual- football- game/article/2000834		"The Pro Bowl Should At Least Resemble an Actual Football Game"	
The Weekly Standard	1/25/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/dont- abandon-all- hope/article/2000592	Tax Reform	"Don't Abandon All Hope"	
The Weekly Standard	1/19/16	Article	http://www.weeklystandard.com/oxfam-schmoxfam/article/2000650	Wealth Distribution	"Oxfam, Schmoxfam"	

# Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 114 of 160

The Weekly Standard	1/13/16	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/d.cbobos- sabotage-housing- construction-to-protect- their-free- parking/article/200055 5		"D.C. Bobos Sabotage Housing Construction to Protect Their Free Parking"	
Cato At Liberty	1/6/16	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/will-natural- monopoly-energy- distribution-come-end- heres-hoping	Energy Distribution	"Will the Natural Monopoly in Energy Distribution Come to an End? Here's Hoping"	
Cato At Liberty	12/18/15	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/blog/states-have-no-business-creating-theirown-retirement-accounts	State's Rights/Economy	"The States Have No Business Creating Their Own Retirement Accounts"	
The Weekly Standard	12/16/15	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/pulling-away- punch- bowls/article/2000251	Economy	"Pulling Away Punch Bowls"	
The Weekly Standard	12/9/15	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-unending- morass-of-housing- finance- reform/article/2000148		"The Unending Morass of Housing Finance Reform"	
Cato At Liberty	12/8/15	Blog Post	https://www.cato.org/ blog/inequality- delando-est	Inequality	Inequality Delenda Est	
The Weekly Standard	12/4/15	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-reform- next- time/article/2000078	Social Security	"The Reform Next Time"	

				h		n= · · ·	<u> </u>
Regulation	12/1/15	Book Review		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 5/12/regulation-v38n4- 9_0.pdf#page=3	Monetary Policy	"Can the Fed Safely Pop Bubbles?"	
Cato At Liberty	12/1/15	Blog Post		https://www.cato.org/ blog/food-labels-kill	Food Labels/FDA	"Food Labels Kill"	
Regulation	12/1/15	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 5/12/regulation-v38n4- 8 2.pdf#page=6		"What Regulatory 'Ossification'?"	
The Hill	11/30/15	Op-Ed		http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/finance/261454- us-should-respond-to- oecd-tax-project-with- an-innovation-box	Tax Reform	"US should respond to OECD tax project with an 'innovation box"	
The Weekly Standard	11/29/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-paris- trap/article/1070373	Environment	"The Paris Trap"	
The Weekly Standard	11/23/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/princeton- protestors-hand- college-fundraisers-a- golden- opportunity/article/106 8598	Education	"Princeton Protestors Hand College Fundraisers a Golden Opportunity"	
The Weekly Standard	11/20/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/liz-warren- moves-to-sabotage-tax- reform/article/1067206	Tax Reform	"Liz Warren Moves to Sabotage Tax Reform"	

11/12/15	Articlo		http://www.wookhystan	Fodoral Posonio	"Goldman's
11/12/15	Article		dard.com/goldmans-		Inexplicable Grip on the Fed"
11/9/15	Op-Ed		s/pundits- blog/finance/259510-a-		"A politically viable Puerto Rico reform plan"
10/27/15	Article	Jared Whitley	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/bill-walker- alters-the-deal-and- threatens-alaskas- prosperity-in-the- process/article/105411 5	Economy	"Bill Walker 'Alters the Deal,' and Threatens Alaska's Prosperity in the Process"
10/21/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/patently- ridiculous/article/1049 567	Patents	"Patently Ridiculous"
10/12/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-to- succeed-in-the- hinterland/article/1039 624	Economy	"How to Succeed in the Hinterland"
10/2/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-brief- exegesis-of-the-central- illinois-music- scene/article/1039774	Illinois	"A Brief Exegesis of the Central Illinois Music Scene"
9/28/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/saving- puerto-rico-from-the- federal- government/article/10 37977	Puerto Rico	"Saving Puerto Rico from the Federal Government"
	10/27/15 10/27/15 10/21/15	11/12/15 Article  11/9/15 Op-Ed  10/27/15 Article  10/21/15 Article  10/2/15 Article  9/28/15 Article	10/27/15 Article Jared Whitley  10/21/15 Article  10/12/15 Article  10/12/15 Article	dard.com/goldmans-inexplicable-grip-on-the-fed/article/1063073     11/9/15   Op-Ed   http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits-blog/finance/259510-a-politically-viable-puerto-rico-reform-plan     10/27/15   Article   Jared   http://www.weeklystan   dard.com/bill-walker-alters-the-deal-and-threatens-alaskas-prosperity-in-the-process/article/105411   5     10/21/15   Article   http://www.weeklystan   dard.com/patently-ridiculous/article/1049   567     10/12/15   Article   http://www.weeklystan   dard.com/how-to-succeed-in-the-hinterland/article/1039   624     10/2/15   Article   http://www.weeklystan   dard.com/a-brief-exegesis-of-the-central-illinois-music-scene/article/1039774     9/28/15   Article   http://www.weeklystan   dard.com/saving-puerto-rico-from-the-federal-government/article/10	dard.com/goldmans-   inexplicable_grip-on-the-   fed/article/1063073

The Hill	9/23/15	Op-Ed		http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/transportation/25 4601-how-investment- in-transportation- infrastructure-boosts	Transportation	"How investment in transportation infrastructure boosts productivity"	
The Weekly Standard	9/18/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/yellen- punts/article/1032817	Federal Reserve	"Yellen Punts"	
Bloomberg BNA	9/17/15	Article	Mike Gorman	https://www.bna.com/ us-business-loses- n17179936219/	Infrastructure	"U.S. Business Loses Big From Lack of Transportation Infrastructure Investment"	
The Weekly Standard	9/14/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/labors- wishful- thinking/article/102481 Z	Department of Labor	"Labor's Wishful Thinking"	
The Weekly Standard	9/14/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/no-more- denali- commissions/article/10 28741	Environment	"No More Denali Commissions"	
The Weekly Standard	9/10/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/in-amending- the-eb-5-program-first- do-no- harm/article/1028180	Immigration	"In Amending the EB- 5 Program, First Do No Harm"	
The Weekly Standard	9/9/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-food- truck-farce- continued/article/1027 768	Public Property	"The Food Truck Farce, Continued"	
The Weekly Standard	9/3/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/in-defense-of- the-cadillac- tax/article/1024566		"In Defense of the 'Cadillac Tax"	

# Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 118 of 160

The Weekly Standard	8/26/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/fixing-the- grid-and-improving- energy- policy/article/1019146	Energy Policy	"Fixing the Grid and Improving Energy Policy"
The Weekly Standard	8/25/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/in- washington-d.c parking-policy-dictates- housing- policy/article/1018280	Housing Policy	"In Washington, D.C., Parking Policy Dictates Housing Policy"
The Weekly Standard	8/24/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/stock- markets-have-the-china- syndrome/article/1017 705		"Stock Markets Have the China Syndrome"
The Weekly Standard	8/19/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/pathetic-spin- from-goldman- sachs/article/1014736		"Pathetic Spin from Goldman Sachs"
The Weekly Standard	8/17/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/even- economists-cant- invest/article/1006585	Economy	"Even Economists Can't Invest"
The Weekly Standard	8/13/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/kill-the- coins/article/1010743	Monetary Policy	"Kill the Coins"
City Journal	8/13/15	Article	Bryan Weaver	https://www.city- journal.org/html/parkin g-price-10469.html	Transportation	"Parking for a Price"

The LUM	0/40/4-	0.5.5.1		hatta : //sla : 1::11 : // : /	Dating	Manager	
The Hill	8/10/15	Op-Ed		http://thehill.com/blog	Ketirement	"Is retirement	
				s/pundits-		planning about to	
				blog/finance/250624-is-		become more	
				retirement-planning-		difficult?"	
				about-to-become-more-			
				difficult			
	- 1 1 -				_		
The Hill	6/30/15	Op-Ed		http://thehill.com/blog	Congress	"A problem Congress	
				s/pundits-		can't solve"	
				blog/uncategorized/24			
				6501-a-problem-			
				congress-cant-solve			
Peoria Journal	6/12/15	On-Ed		http://www.pjstar.com	Economy	"Op-Ed: Central	
Star	0/12/13	Op-Eu			Lectionity	Illinois needs Uber"	
Star				/article/20150612/OPI		illinois needs Ober	
				NION/150619732			
Regulation	6/1/15	Journal	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/	FDA	"The Menu Labeling	
		Article		sites/cato.org/files/seri		Morass"	
				als/files/policy-			
				report/2015/6/regulati			
				on-v38n2-10-3.pdf			
				<u> </u>			
The Hill	5/26/15	On Ed		http://thehill.com/blog	Tay Boform	"How Obama could	
The niii	5/20/15	Ор-Ей			rax Keloriii		
				s/pundits-		hijack tax reform"	
				blog/economy-			
				budget/243060-how-			
				obama-could-hijack-tax-			
				<u>reform</u>			
The Weekly	5/25/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan	Puerto Rico	"Fixing Puerto Rico"	
Standard	3,23,23	7 66.6		dard.com/fixing-puerto-			
Standard							
				rico/article/946678			
The Weekly	5/6/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan	Race	"Jamaal Strikes Blow	
Standard				dard.com/jamaal-		for Diversity in NPR	
				strikes-blow-for-		Fantasyland"	
				diversity-in-npr-			
				fantasyland/article/940			
				158			
				<del></del>			
			1			]	

5/4/15	Article		http://www.weeklystandard.com/india-needs-	iliula	"India Needs to
			to-enforce-its-trade- agreements/article/937 584		Enforce Its Trade Agreements"
4/29/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/housing- subsidies-a-play-in-one- act/article/934046	Housing Subsidies	"Housing Subsidies: A Play in One Act"
4/28/15	Article		https://www.aei.org/p ublication/the-case-for- an-innovation-box/	Economy	"The case for 'an innovation box'"
4/21/15	Op-Ed	Jared Whitley	http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits- blog/international/239 455-when-a-chinese- anti-corruption-drive-is- anything-but	China	"When a Chinese 'anti-corruption' drive is anything but"
4/16/15	Op-Ed		http://thehill.com/blog s/congress- blog/economy- budget/238963-can- there-be-a-role-for-the- government-in-the- advent-of	Crypto Currency	"Can there be a role for the government in the advent of crypto-currencies?"
4/15/15	Article		http://www.realclearm arkets.com/articles/201 5/04/15/jeff bezos ma y have found amazon s latest money pit 10 1622.html	Amazon	"Jeff Bezos May Have Found Amazon's Latest Money Pit"
4/10/15	Article		https://thefederalist.co m/2015/04/10/ivy- leagues-shame-kids-for- making-their-way-in- the-world/	Education	"Ivy Leagues Shame Kids For Making Their Way In The World"
	4/28/15 4/21/15 4/16/15	4/29/15 Article  4/28/15 Article  4/21/15 Op-Ed  4/16/15 Op-Ed  4/15/15 Article	4/28/15 Article  4/21/15 Op-Ed Jared Whitley  4/16/15 Op-Ed  4/15/15 Article	4/29/15 Article  4/28/15 Article  4/28/15 Article  4/21/15 Op-Ed  4/21/15 Op-Ed  4/16/15 Op-Ed  4/16/15 Article  4/16/15 Article  4/15/15 Article	4/29/15 Article  http://www.weeklystan dard.com/housing-subsidies-a-play-in-one-act/article/934046  4/28/15 Article  https://www.aei.org/publication/the-case-for-an-innovation-box/  4/21/15 Op-Ed  Jared Whitley  http://thehill.com/blog s/pundits-blog/international/239 455-when-a-chinese-anti-corruption-drive-is-anything-but  4/16/15 Op-Ed  http://thehill.com/blog s/congress-blog/congress-blog/congress-blog/economy-budget/238963-can-there-be-a-role-for-the-government-in-the-advent-of  http://www.realclearm arkets.com/articles/201 S/04/15/jeff bezos may have found amazon s-latest money pit 10 1622.html  4/10/15 Article  https://thefederalist.com/2015/04/10/ivv-leagues-shame-kids-for-making-their-way-in-based entrementation-action-making-their-way-in-

### Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 121 of 160

The March 1	2/22/4	A .1.* .1		hit. II	Ch.:	llus Chris	
The Weekly Standard	3/30/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-chinese- regulatory-authorities- impose-protectionist- trade- policies/article/903435	China	"How Chinese Regulatory Authorities Impose Protectionist Trade Policies"	
Peoria Journal Star	3/27/15	Op-Ed		http://www.pjstar.com /article/20150327/OPI NION/150329197	Food Trucks	"In the Spotlight: Peoria should auction food trucks to highest bidders"	
The Hill	3/19/15	Op-Ed		http://thehill.com/blog s/congress- blog/healthcare/23614 3-more-must-be-done- to-improve-access-to- biosimilar-drugs	Health	"More must be done to improve access to biosimilar drugs"	
The Weekly Standard	3/2/15	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/republicans- appoint-keith-hall-to- head- cbo/article/872401	СВО	"Republicans Appoint Keith Hall to Head CBO"	
Cato Institute	3/1/2015	Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 5/3/regulation-v38n1- 9.pdf	Smalltown USA	"A Liberal Heretic Contradicts Piketty"	
Regulation	3/1/15	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 5/3/regulation-v38n1- 8 0.pdf#page=2		"EPA's Analytical Jujitsu"	

CNBC	2/11/15	Article	https://www.cnbc.com /2015/02/11/puerto- ricos-economic-woes- are-only-short-term- commentary.html	Puerto Rico	"Puerto Rico's economic woes are only short-term"	
The Weekly Standard	2/4/15	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-food- truck- farce/article/837954	DC Subsidies	"The Food Truck Farce"	
The Weekly Standard	1/29/15	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/an-epic-fail- from-the-new-york- times/article/830793	Journalism	"An Epic Fail from the New York Times"	
The Weekly Standard	1/26/15	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/obamas- latest-giveaway ./article/823837	Federal Subsidies	"Obama's Latest Giveaway"	
The Weekly Standard	1/21/15	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/conservative s-should-buy-obamas- tax-increaseif-he-makes- it-bigger/article/824218		"Conservatives Should Buy Obama's Tax Increase—If He Makes It Bigger"	
The Weekly Standard	1/14/15	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/federal-regs- making-it-difficult-for- members-of-military-to- borrow- money/article/823738	Regulation	"Federal Regs Making it Difficult for Members of Military to Borrow Money"	
The Weekly Standard	1/9/15	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/get- biosimilars-to-the- market- place/article/823418	Health	"Get Biosimilars to the Market Place"	

American Enterprise Institute	1/6/15			https://www.aei.org/p ublication/congress- help-small-community- banks/	Dodd-Frank	"Congress should help small communities by amending the Dodd- Frank Act"	
The Weekly Standard	12/29/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-year-later- the-exchanges-still- stink/article/821880	Economy	"A Year Later, the Exchanges Still Stink"	
The Weekly Standard	12/24/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-white- houses-college-report- card-will-accomplish- nothing/article/822418	Education	"The White House's College Report Card Will Accomplish Nothing"	
Regulation	12/1/14	Book Review		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/12/regulation-v37n4- 10_2.pdf#page=11	Infrastructure	"Building Better Infrastructure"	
Regulation	12/1/14	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/12/regulation-v37n4- 9 0.pdf#page=2		"Explaining Delays in Regulatory Publication"	
The Weekly Standard	11/25/14	Article	Devorah Goldman	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/why-are- urban-hospitals-closing- everywhere-but- bayonne-medical- center-is-still- open/article/820161	Health	"Why Are Urban Hospitals Closing Everywhere, but Bayonne Medical Center Is Still Open?"	

The West-I	10/24/44	A metical a		http://www.completers	Donostor	"I I o w to Malia tha	
The Weekly Standard	10/21/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-to-make- the-inversion-problem- even- worse/article/816947		"How to Make the Inversion Problem Even Worse"	
Regulation	10/1/14	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/10/regulationv37n3- 8 2.pdf#page=6	Tax Reform	"The IRS's War on Locum Tenes"	
Regulation	10/1/14	Book Review		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/10/regulationv37n3- 9 3.pdf#page=13		"The Entitlement 'Crisitunity'"	
Regulation	10/1/14	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/10/regulationv37n3- 8 0.pdf#page=2		"The Highs and Lows in OIRA's Report to Congress"	
The Weekly Standard	9/30/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-legislative- sleight-of-hand-for- fannie-mae-and-freddie- mac/article/808389		"A Legislative Sleight of Hand for Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac"	
George W. Bush Institute	9/23/14	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/09/when-a- minimum-wage-is-not- a-minimum-wage.html	Minimum Wage	"When a Minimum Wage is Not a Minimum Wage"	

	611.		1 11	I= 1	lly and the second seco
American Enterprise Institute	9/17/14	Article	https://www.aei.org/p ublication/why-the- government-wont-let- colleges-reduce- tuition/	Education	"Why the Government Won't Let Colleges Reduce Tuition"
George W. Bush Institute	9/16/14	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/09/paying-for- paving-tax-driving-not- gas.html	Tax Reform	"Paying for paving: Tax driving, not gas"
George W. Bush Institute	9/15/14	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/09/how- britains-tax-reform- boosted-economic- growth.html	British Tax Reform	"How Britain's Tax Reform Boosted Economic Growth"
The Weekly Standard	9/8/14	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-peorian- makes-sense-of- turkey/article/804010	Turkey	"A Peorian Makes Sense of Turkey"
American Enterprise Institute	9/7/14	Article	https://www.aei.org/p ublication/the- minimum-wage-can- never-be-high-enough/	Minimum Wage	"The Minimum Wage Can Never Be High Enough"
The Weekly Standard	9/4/14	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the-costs-of- a-miscarriage-of- justice/article/804340	Legal	"The Costs of a Miscarriage of Justice"
The Weekly Standard	8/11/14	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/paying-for- paving/article/800450	Transportation	"Paying for Paving"
The Weekly Standard	7/25/14	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/detroit-hard- luck-city/article/797406		"Detroit Hard Luck City"

		П		T		T.	
The Weekly Standard	7/23/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the- administrations-cynical- fight-against-corporate- inversions/article/7972 91	Tax Reform	"The Administration's Cynical Fight Against Corporate Inversions"	
The Federalists	7/22/14	Article		https://thefederalist.co m/2014/07/22/no- corporate-tax- inversions-are-not-an- unpatriotic-economic- crisis/	Tax Reform	"No, Corporate Tax Inversions Are Not An Unpatriotic Economic Crisis"	
George W. Bush Institute	7/22/14	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/07/the-tax- inversion- manufactured- crisis.html	Tax Inversion	"The tax inversion manufactured crisis"	
Regulation	7/1/14	Journal Article	Logan Albright	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/7/regulation-v37n2- 7.pdf	Minimum Wage	"A Federal Minimum Wage and the States"	
Regulation	7/1/14	Book Review		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/7/regulation-v37n2- 11 3.pdf#Page=10		"Can Macroeconomics Be Saved - or Understood?"	
Regulation	7/1/14	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/7/regulation-v37n2- 10-edit.pdf#page=4		"The Obama Regulatory Rush:	
The Weekly Standard	6/30/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/student-loan- relief- now/article/795407	Education	"'Student Loan Relief Now'"	

George W. Bush Institute	6/23/14	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/06/more- economic-growth-is- possible-and-will-soon- become-a-higher- priority-for-our- government.html	Economy	"More Economic Growth is Possible and Will Soon Become a Higher Priority for Our Government"	
The Weekly Standard	6/16/14	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/paygo- begone/article/794411	Federal Budget	"PAYGO Begone"	
George W. Bush Institute	6/6/14	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/06/-tax-policy- the-texas-wayin- washington-dc.html	Tax Policy	"Tax Policy the Texas Wayin Washington, D.C."	
The Weekly Standard	6/3/14	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/tax-policy- the-texas-wayin- washington- d.c./article/794275	Tax Reform	"Tax Policy the Texas Way—in Washington, D.C."	
American Enterprise Institute	5/25/14	Article	https://www.aei.org/p ublication/new-flight- rules-are-a-heavy-load/	Transportation	"New Flight Rules Are a Heavy Load"	
The Hill	5/22/14	Op-Ed	http://thehill.com/blog s/congress- blog/economy- budget/206814-why- fannie-and-freddies- failed-stress-test- proves-nothing	Financial Crisis	"Why Fannie and Freddie's failed stress test proves nothing"	

George W. Bush Institute	4/28/14	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/04/is-the-time- ripe-for-a-revolution-in- transportation- funding.html	Funding	"Is the Time Ripe for a Revolution in Transportation Funding?"
George W. Bush Institute	4/28/14	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/04/rule-of-law- for-me-but-not-for- thee.html		"Rule of Law for me but not for Thee"
The Weekly Standard	4/28/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/rule-of-law- for-me-not-for- thee/article/787493	Property Laws	"Rule of Law For Me, Not For Thee"
R Street Institute	4/24/14	Policy Analysis	Zackary Hawley, Andrew Hanson	http://www.rstreet.org /policy- study/rethinking-tax- benefits-for-home- owners/	Tax Reform	"Rethinking tax benefits for home owners"
R Street Institute	4/22/14	Policy Analysis	Zackary Hawley, Andrew Hanson	http://www.rstreet.org /policy-study/homesick- how-housing-tax- breaks-benefit-the- wealthy-and-create- mcmansions/		"Homesick: How housing tax breaks benefit the wealthy and create McMansions"
Cato Institute	4/1/2014	Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/4/regulation-v37n1- 5.pdf	Income	"Income Inequality and the NBA"
National Affairs	4/1/2014	Journal Article		http://epublications.ma rquette.edu/econ_fac/ 520/	Tax Reform	"Rethinking Tax Benefits for Home Owners"

Regulation  George W. Bush		Journal Article Blog Post	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/4/v37n1- 11_1.pdf#page=6		"The Meaninglessness of the SEC Pay Disclosure Rule"  "Sisyphus and Tax	
Institute		S		.org/publications/articl es/2014/03/sisyphus- and-tax-reform.html		Reform"	
RealClearMarket s	3/23/14	Article		http://www.realclearm arkets.com/articles/201 4/05/23/economic san ctions on russia woul d be worse than futil e 101075.html	Russia	"Economic Sanctions On Russia Would Be Worse Than Futile"	
Cato Institute	3/18/14	Policy Analysis	Mark A. Calabria	https://www.cato.org/ publications/working- paper/paths-mortgage- finance-reform-their- budgetary-implications	Mortgage Finance Reform	"The Paths to Mortgage Finance Reform and Their Budgetary Implications"	
The Weekly Standard	3/17/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/dont-guarini- me-bro/article/784287	Tax Reform	"Don't Guarini Me, Bro!"	
The Weekly Standard	3/10/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/ive-saved- thousands-of-dollars- waiting-to-get-on- obamacare/article/784 372	Healthcare	"I've Saved Thousands of Dollars Waiting to Get on Obamacare"	
The Weekly Standard	2/7/14	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/ive-been- trying-since- novemberbut-i-still- cant-sign-up-for- obamacare/article/778 833	Healthcare	"I've Been Trying Since November—But I Still Can't Sign Up for Obamacare"	

# Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 130 of 160

George W. Bush Institute	1/30/14	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/01/innovation- and-productivity-go- hand-in-hand.html	Economy	"Innovation and Productivity Go Hand in Hand"	
The Weekly Standard	1/25/14	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/how-to-fix- the-pro- bowl/article/775376	NFL	"How to Fix the Pro Bowl"	
National Review	1/22/14	Article	http://www.nationalre view.com/corner/3692 01	Financial Crisis	"How the Obama Administration Stole Fannie and Freddie"	
George W. Bush Institute	1/17/14	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/01/praise-for- french-policy- reforms.html	French Policy	"Praise for French Policy Reforms"	
George W. Bush Institute	1/7/14	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2014/01/immigratio n-and-the-texas- boom.html	Immigration	"Immigration and the Texas Boom"	
Regulation	1/1/14	Book Review	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/1/regulation-v36n4- 11 5.pdf#page=13		"It's Lousy Being You (Unless You're Rich)"	
Regulation		Journal Article	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/1/regulation-v36n4- 5.pdf	Economics	"The Fruits of a Failed Dissertation: Ed Clarke 1939-2013"	

1		1	1	T	I	T	
Regulation	1/1/14	Book Review		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/1/regulation-v36n4- 11_0.pdf#page=2	Gridlock	"The Fruits of Gridlock"	
Regulation	1/1/14	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 4/1/regulation-v36n4- 10 3.pdf#page=5	Union policy	"White House Skirts the Law in Expanding Davis-Bacon"	
The Weekly Standard	12/26/13	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/after-a- month-of-trying-i-still- cant-sign-up-for- obamacare/article/772 303	Healthcare	"After a Month of Trying, I Still Can't Sign Up for Obamacare"	
George W. Bush Institute	12/26/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/12/the-tax- reform-chasm- widens.html	Tax Reform	"The Tax Reform Chasm Widens"	
George W. Bush Institute	12/23/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/12/environme ntal-solutions-by- fiat.html	Environment	"Environmental Solutions by Fiat"	
The Weekly Standard	12/23/13	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/subsidizing- rich-and- poor/article/770848	Government Subsidies	"Subsidizing Rich and Poor"	
George W. Bush Institute	12/12/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/12/tax-reform- break-up-edition.html	Tax Reform	"Tax Reform: Break- Up Edition"	
1		!	!			+	

1	441-11	-1 -	I		In., a I	1
George W. Bush Institute	11/21/13	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/11/homer- simpsons-bear-tax-dc- edition.html	Tax Reform	"Homer Simpson's Bear Tax: DC Edition"	
George W. Bush Institute	10/31/13	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/10/growth- wont-save- entitlements.html	Economy	"Growth Won't Save Entitlements"	
The Weekly Standard	10/14/13	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/europe-leads- the-way/article/759172		"Europe Leads the Way?"	
George W. Bush Institute	10/8/13	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/10/a-better- way-to-measure- growth.html	Economy	"A Better Way to Measure Growth"	
George W. Bush Institute	9/30/13	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/09/californias- perfect-tax-scam.html	Tax Reform	"California's Perfect Tax Scam"	
George W. Bush Institute	9/23/13	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/09/the-rich- are-different-so- what.html	Economy	"The Rich Are Different. So What?"	
Regulation	9/1/13	Journal Article	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/9/regv36n3-2n.pdf	Privitization	"Could Dan Snyder End Publicly Financed Stadiums?"	
Regulation	9/1/2013	Book Review	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/9/regv36n3- 9n_0.pdf#page=3	Economic History	"The Glory of Gridlock"	
		1	I	l .		

Dec. Lat.	0/4/2015		C B	hara Malata i d	Et a a a stat	IIII CONTRACTOR CONTRA	
Regulation	9/1/2013		Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/		"The Unknown Costs	
		Article		sites/cato.org/files/seri		of Dodd-Frank"	
				als/files/regulation/201	overreach		
				3/9/regv36n3-8n.pdf			
George W. Bush	8/17/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter	Education	"Who Should be	
Institute				.org/publications/articl		Teaching College?"	
				es/2013/08/who-			
				should-be-teaching-			
				college.html			
George W. Bush	8/13/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter	Tax Reform	"Making Policy the	
Institute				.org/publications/articl		Wrong Way"	
				es/2013/08/making-			
				policy-the-wrong-			
				way.html			
George W. Bush	8/1/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter	Tax Reform	"Baby Steps to Tax	
Institute				.org/publications/articl		Reform"	
				es/2013/08/baby-steps-			
				to-tax-reform.html			
				to tax resonantin			
George W. Bush	7/29/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter	Fconomy	"The Death of	
Institute	7/23/13	Diog i osc		.org/publications/articl	Lectionity	Growth Has Been	
mstitute				es/2013/07/the-death-		Greatly Exaggerated"	
				of-growth-has-been-		Greatly Exaggerated	
				greatly-			
				exaggerated.html			
				exaggerated.html			
Caaraa M. Duah	7/22/42	Dia - Dast		h.t//	China	IICt a main a tha	
George W. Bush	//23/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter	China	"Stopping the	
Institute				.org/publications/articl		Mandarins"	
				es/2013/07/stopping-			
				the-mandarins.html			
	-1:-1:	-1 -					
George W. Bush	7/19/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter	Tax Reform	"Tax Reform Would	
Institute				.org/publications/articl		Play Well in Peoria"	
				es/2013/07/tax-reform-			
				would-play-well-in-			
				peoria.html			

George W. Bush Institute  George W. Bush Institute		Blog Post Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/07/capitalism chocolate-chip- cookies.html  http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/06/the-case- for-a-carbon-tax.html		"Capitalism & Chocolate-Chip Cookies"  "The Case for a Carbon Tax"	
American Enterprise Institute	6/26/13	Article		https://www.aei.org/p ublication/warning- pollution/	Environment	"Warning Pollution"	
George W. Bush Institute	6/14/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/06/patent- wars-restrain- growth.html	Patents	"Patent Wars Restrain Growth"	
George W. Bush Institute	6/7/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/06/is-there-a- future-for-driverless- cars.html	Technology	"Is There a Future for Driverless Cars?"	
Regulation	6/1/13	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/6/regulation-v36n2- 6 1.pdf#page=3	Tax Reform	"Asking the Tax Code to Do Less"	
Regulation	6/1/13	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/6/regulation-v36n2- 6_0.pdf#page=2		"The Need for Retro- spective Review of Regulations"	

Regulation  The Weekly Standard	6/1/13 5/22/13	Review	https://object.cato.org/sites/cato.org/files/serials/files/regulation/2013/6/regulation-v36n2-73.pdf#page=12  http://www.weeklystandard.com/a-glimmer-of-hope-for-the-illinois-		"Two Hundred Way the Tax Code Stinks"  "A Glimmer of Hope for the Illinois GOP"
George W. Bush Institute	5/22/13	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/05/changing- how-we-pay-	Education	"Changing How We Pay Teachers"
Salon	5/17/13	Article	https://www.salon.com/2013/05/17/how_a_fight_with_rick_santorum_am_ade_an_irs_comm_issioner/	IRS	"How a fight with Rick Santorum made an IRS commissioner"
RealClearMarket s	5/14/13	Article	http://www.realclearen ergy.org/articles/2013/ 05/14/why you just may come to like a c arbon tax 107016.htm	Environment	"Why You Just May Come to Like a Carbon Tax"
George W. Bush Institute	5/13/13	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/05/taxes-hurt- competitiveness- abroad.html	Tax Reform	"Taxes Hurt Competitiveness Abroad"
R Street Institute	5/13/13	Op-Ed	http://www.rstreet.org /?media-mention=were- already-paying-a- carbon-tax-in-disaster- relief-2	Environment	"We're Already Paying a Carbon Tax in Disaster Relief"

5/1/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter	I Economy		
	3		org/publications/articl es/2013/05/saving-on- snacks-the-washington- way.html	Economy	"Saving on Snacks, the Washington Way"	
4/23/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/04/spending- without-stimulus.html	Economy	"Spending Without Stimulus"	
4/22/13	Op-Ed		http://www.rstreet.org /op-ed/its-time-to-ask- cyprus-for-a-real- concession/	Cyprus	"It's time to ask Cyprus for a real concession"	
4/22/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/04/time-for-a- carbon-tax.html	Environment/Ta x Reform	"Time for a Carbon Tax?"	
4/22/13	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/waiting-for- obama/article/716286	Tax Reform	"Waiting for Obama"	
4/19/13	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/not-worth- the-paper-its-printed- on/article/745835	ОМВ	"Not Worth the Paper It's Printed On"	
4/13/13	Op-Ed		http://www.rstreet.org /op-ed/waiting-for- obama/	Executive Branch	"Waiting for Obama"	
4/4/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/04/haircuts- for-the-wrong- heads.html	Banking	"Haircuts for the Wrong Heads"	
	4/22/13 4/22/13 4/22/13 4/19/13	4/23/13 Blog Post  4/22/13 Op-Ed  4/22/13 Article  4/19/13 Article  4/13/13 Op-Ed  4/4/13 Blog Post	4/22/13 Op-Ed  4/22/13 Blog Post  4/22/13 Article  4/19/13 Article	a   a   a   a   a   a   a   a   a   a	es/2013/05/saving-on- snacks-the-washington- way.html  4/23/13 Blog Post	es/2013/05/saving-on-snacks-the-washington-way.html

RealClearMarket	3/22/13	Article		http://www.realclearm	Cynrus	"It's Time To Ask
s	5/22/13	AI IICIE		arkets.com/articles/201 3/03/22/its time to as k cyprus for a real c oncession 100215.html		Cyprus For a Real Concession"
George W. Bush Institute	3/22/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/03/striking-a- deal-on-social- security.html	Social Security	"Striking a Deal on Social Security"
George W. Bush Institute	3/21/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/03/what-4- growth-would-mean- for-america.html	Economy	"What 4% Growth Would Mean For America"
Salon	3/18/13	Article		https://www.salon.com /2013/03/18/how repu blicans really view so cial security/		"How Republicans really view Social Security"
George W. Bush Institute	3/13/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/03/silver- linings-playbook.html	Economy	"Silver Linings Playbook"
Regulation	3/1/13	Book Review		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/3/v36n1- 13.pdf#page=1		"Grow Your Pie and Eat It Too"
Regulation		Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/3/v36n1- 14 1.pdf#page=3	Regulatory Reform	"No 'Midnight' After This Election"
Regulation	3/1/13	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/3/v36n1-6.pdf	Regulatory Reform	"Toward a New and Improved Regulatory Apparatus"

Г		I	ı	I	l	I	
George W. Bush Institute	2/27/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/sequester- in-search-of- leadership.html	Legislative Branch	"Sequester: In Search Of Leadership"	
George W. Bush Institute	2/13/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/canada- turns-the-tables-on-the- us.html		"Canada Turns the Tables on the U.S."	
George W. Bush Institute	2/13/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/once-again- theres-no-free- lunch.html	Lending	"Once Again, There's No Free Lunch"	
George W. Bush Institute	2/13/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/the-true- cost-of-the-fiscal-cliff- deal.html	Legislative Branch	"The True Cost of the Fiscal Cliff Deal"	
The Weekly Standard	2/11/13	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/why-we- might-get-tax- reform/article/699212	Tax Reform	"Why We Might Get Tax Reform"	
George W. Bush Institute	2/6/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/no-canary- in-the-coal-mine yet.html	Economy	"No Canary in the Coal Mine Yet"	
George W. Bush Institute	2/1/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/backing- away-from-the- cliff.html	Economy	"Backing Away from the Cliff"	
George W. Bush Institute	2/1/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/moving-the- growth-debate-beyond- taxes.html		"Moving the Growth Debate Beyond Taxes"	

George W. Bush Institute	2/1/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl	Pension	"Pension Shortfalls: A Bipartisan
				es/2013/02/pension- shortfalls-a-bipartisan- opportunity.html		Opportunity?"
George W. Bush Institute	2/1/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/public- pension-plans-face- insolvency.html	Pension	"Public Pension Plans Face Insolvency"
George W. Bush Institute	2/1/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/resisting- automatic-savings.html	Banking	"Resisting Automatic Savings"
George W. Bush Institute	2/1/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/tax-cuts- require-entitlement- reform.html	Tax Reform	"Tax Cuts Require Entitlement Reform"
George W. Bush Institute	2/1/13	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2013/02/why- keynesian-economics- died.html	Economy	"Why Keynesian Economics Died"
Regulation	1/1/13	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/1/v35n4- 8 1.pdf#page=4		"Examining the U.S. Regulatory Budget"
Regulation	1/1/13	Book Review		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/1/v35n4- 7_1.pdf#page=4	Tax Reform	"It It Time for the X- Tax?"

Dogulatic :	1/1/12	Dools		https://object.com/	Innoveti	"The Ditfelle of	-
Regulation	1/1/13	Book Review		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 3/1/v35n4- 7_0.pdf#page=2		"The Pitfalls of Reforming a Broken System"	
Regulation	11/1/12	Journal Article	Elizabeth Lowell	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 2/11/v35n3-9.pdf	Federal Stimulus	"Derailing High- Speed Rail"	
Regulation	11/1/12	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 2/11/v35n3- 9.pdf#page=3		"Small Business Regulation: A Case Study and Options for Reform"	
Regulation	10/1/12	Book Review		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 2/10/v31n2- inreview.pdf#page=1	Economics	"Can Someone Make a Rational Decision?"	
George W. Bush Institute	9/25/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/the-hidden- cost-of-unreliable- transportation.html		"The Hidden Cost of Unreliable Transportation"	
George W. Bush Institute	9/11/12	Blog Post	`	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/productivit y-growth-the-numbers- and-the-reality.html	Economy	"Productivity Growth: The Numbers and the Reality"	
George W. Bush Institute	8/31/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/growth- fuels-turkeys- promise.html	Turkey	"Growth Fuels Turkey's Promise"	

	0/:-/:-	D. 5 .	I	li // · ·		lier poul pour	
George W. Bush Institute	8/14/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/the-battle- over-the-regulatory- state.html	Regulation	"The Battle Over the Regulatory State"	
George W. Bush Institute	8/9/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/quarterbac ks-vigilantes-and- economic-growth.html	Economy	"Quarterbacks, Vigilantes, and Economic Growth"	
Regulation	8/1/12	Policy Report	Elizabeth Lowell	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/policy- report/2012/8/v35n2- 7.pdf#page=3		"Reforming the Export-Import Bank"	
George W. Bush Institute	8/1/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/the-wrong- reason-for-the-right- policy.html	Economy	"The Wrong Reason for the Right Policy"	
George W. Bush Institute	7/30/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/counting- on-living-longer.html	Age and Economy	"Counting on Living Longer"	
George W. Bush Institute	7/12/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/the- benefits-of-growth- slow-but- inexorable.html	Economy	"The Benefits of Growth: Slow but Inexorable"	
George W. Bush Institute	7/8/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/the-italian- job-improving- productivity-and- employment.html	Economy	"The Italian Job: Improving Productivity and Employment"	
				1			

	1.	I=	l	I=	I	
7/1/12	Journal Article	Elizabeth Lowell	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 2/7/v34n4-5.pdf	Flood Insurance	"The Flood Insurance Fix"	
6/29/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/in-defense- of-finance.html	Finance	"In Defense of Finance"	
6/21/12	Article				"The Costliest Regulation You've Never Heard Of"	
6/19/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/problems- with-productivityor- not.html	Economy	"Problems with Productivity or Not"	
6/15/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/a-tax-deal- that-is-no-bargain.html	Tax Reform	"A Tax Deal That Is No Bargain"	
6/8/12	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/another-bad- sign-productivity-falls- by9- percent/article/646800	Economy	"Another Bad Sign: Productivity Falls by .9 Percent"	
6/7/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/letting- innovators- innovate.html	Regulation	"Letting Innovators Innovate"	
5/31/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/luddites- lumps-of-labor-and-a- laundry-list-of- illogic.html	Economy	"Luddites, Lumps of Labor, and a Laundry List of Illogic"	
	6/29/12 6/21/12 6/19/12 6/8/12	7/1/12 Journal Article 6/29/12 Blog Post 6/21/12 Article 6/19/12 Blog Post 6/15/12 Blog Post 6/7/12 Blog Post	6/29/12 Blog Post 6/21/12 Article 6/19/12 Blog Post 6/15/12 Blog Post 6/8/12 Article	Article Lowell sites/cato.org/files/serials/files/regulation/201 2/7/v34n4-5.pdf  6/29/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/in-defense-of-finance.html  6/21/12 Article https://www.aei.org/publications/articles/2012/10/problems-with-productivityor-not.html  6/15/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/problems-with-productivityor-not.html  6/15/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/a-tax-deal-that-is-no-bargain.html  6/8/12 Article http://www.weeklystan.dard.com/another-bad-sign-productivity-falls-by9-percent/article/646800  6/7/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/lettings-innovators-innovates-html  5/31/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/luddites-lumps-of-labor-and-a-laundry-list-of-	Article Lowell sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 2/7/v34n4-5.pdf  6/29/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter corg/publications/articles/2012/10/in-defense-of-finance.html  6/21/12 Article https://www.aei.org/publication/the-costilest-regulation-youve-never-heard-of/  6/19/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter corg/publications/articles/2012/10/problems-with-productivity-or-not.html  6/15/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter corg/publications/articles/2012/10/a-tax-deal-that-is-no-bargain.html  6/8/12 Article http://www.weeklystan dard.com/another-bad-sign-productivity-falls-by-9-percent/article/646800  6/7/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter corg/publications/articles/2012/10/letting-innovators-inn	Article Lowell sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 2/7/v34n4-5.pdf  6/29/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter org/publications/articles/2012/10/in-defense-of-finance.html  6/21/12 Article https://www.aei.org/publication/he-costliest-regulation/youve-never-heard-of/  6/19/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/problems-with-productivity-or-not.html  6/15/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/a-tax-deal-that-is-no-bargain.html  6/8/12 Article http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/a-tax-deal-that-is-no-bargain.html  6/8/12 Article http://www.weeklvstandard.com/another-bad-sign-productivity-falls-by-9-percent/article/646800  6/7/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/letting-innovators-innovate.html  6/7/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/letting-innovators-innovate.html  6/7/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/letting-innovators-innovate.html  6/7/12 Blog Post http://www.bushcenter.org/publications/articles/2012/10/letting-innovators-innovate.html

George W. Bush Institute	5/24/12	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/real- investment-instead-of- short-term- stimulus.html	Investments	"Real Investment Instead of Short- Term Stimulus"
George W. Bush Institute	5/18/12	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/the- importance-of- productivity.html	Economy	"The Importance of Productivity"
George W. Bush Institute	5/10/12	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/short-run- productivity-measures- tell-us-little.html	Economy	"Short Run Productivity Measures Tell Us Little"
George W. Bush Institute	5/4/12	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/enjoying- every-sandwich-life- expectancy-and- growth.html	Age and Economy	"Enjoying Every Sandwich: Life Expectancy and Growth"
The Weekly Standard	4/30/12	Article	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/oecds- prescription-to-raise- taxes-is-the-wrong- medicine-for- u.s./article/642253	Tax Reform	"OECD's Prescription to Raise Taxes Is the Wrong Medicine for U.S."
George W. Bush Institute	4/27/12	Blog Post	http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/lessons- from-the-1-how-to-get- ahead-in-life.html	Economy	"Lessons from the 1%: How to Get Ahead in Life"

The Weekly	4/24/12	Article		http://www.weeklystan	Immigration	"Obama	
Standard				dard.com/obama- administration-stops- foreigners-from- clogging-teller- windows/article/64204		Administration Stops Foreigners from Clogging Teller Windows"	
				4			
American Enterprise Institute	4/18/12	Article		https://www.aei.org/p ublication/about-those- better-roads-in-china/	China	"About Those Better Roads in China"	
George W. Bush Institute	4/16/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/the-cost-of- increasing-tax-rates-on- capital-gains-and- dividends.html		"The Cost of Increasing Tax Rates On Capital Gains and Dividends"	
George W. Bush Institute	4/10/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/making- future-generations-foot- the-bill.html		"Making Future Generations Foot the Bill"	
The Weekly Standard	4/4/12	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/year-104-and- counting-a-cubs-fan- survival- strategy/article/635403		"Year 104 and Counting: A Cubs Fan Survival Strategy"	
Regulation	4/1/2012	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 2/4/v35n1- 7.pdf#page=2	- ,	"First-Year Grades on Obama Regulatory Reform"	
Regulation	4/1/12	Journal Article	Matt Thoman	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 2/4/v35n1-7.pdf		"Taxi Medallions Coming to a City Near You"	

National Review	3/29/12	Article		http://www.nationalre	Oil	"Domestic Oil
	-,,			view.com/corner/2947		Policies Do Impact Oil
				<u>68</u>		Prices"
The Weekly Standard	3/28/12	Article	Logan Albright	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/o- canada/article/634791	Canada	"O Canada!"
George W. Bush Institute	3/23/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/how- growth-benefits-us-all- the-1990s-vs-the- 2000s.html	Economy	"How Growth Benefits Us All — the 1990s vs. the 2000s"
The Weekly Standard	3/21/12	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/ryans-tax- plan-moves-the- ball/article/634323	Tax Reform	"Ryan's Tax Plan Moves the Ball"
George W. Bush Institute	3/15/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/should- peorians-care-about- corporate-tax-reform- yes.html	Tax Reform	"Should Peorians Care about Corporate Tax Reform? (Yes)"
George W. Bush Institute	3/9/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/chinas- retreat-from-state- directed- capitalism.html	China	"China's Retreat from State-Directed Capitalism"
George W. Bush Institute	3/1/12	Blog Post		http://www.bushcenter .org/publications/articl es/2012/10/material- progress-and-the-plight- of-the-poorhtml	·	"Material Progress and the Plight of the Poor"
The Weekly Standard	1/23/12	Article	Sam Batkins	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/obama- burdens-the- banks/article/616738	Banking	"Obama Burdens the Banks"
L		ļ	L	ļ	ļ	ļ

		1	I	I_	In S	
1/20/12	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/la-gloire-de- lconomie- franaise/article/617346	France	"A la Gloire de L'économie Française"	
12/26/11	Article	Eli Lehrer	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/mortgaging- our- future/article/613475	Economy	"Mortgaging Our Future"	
12/21/11	Article	Andrew Hanson, Zach Hawley	dard.com/who-benefits-		"Who Benefits from the Mortgage Interest Deduction?"	
12/13/11	Article	Matt Thoman	https://www.aei.org/p ublication/why- unemployment-is- worse-than-you-think/	Unemployment	"Why Unemployment Is Worse Than You Think"	
11/7/11	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-cure-for- the-housing- blues/article/604177	Housing	"A Cure for the Housing Blues"	
11/4/11	Article	Elizabeth Lowell	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/privatizing- the-liquor- market/article/607746	Privitization	"Privatizing the Liquor Market"	
10/31/11	Article		http://www.nationalre view.com/corner/2817 06	Washington, D.C.	"Halloween on the Hill"	
10/17/11	Article	Eli Lehrer	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/lets-start-all- over- again/article/595196	Tax Reform	"Let's Start All Over Again"	
10/17/11	Op-Ed	Eli Lehrer	http://thehill.com/opini on/op-ed/188045- zeroing-in-on- simplifying-the-tax- system	Tax Reform	"Zeroing in on simplifying the tax system"	
	12/26/11  12/21/11  12/13/11  11/7/11  10/31/11  10/17/11	1/20/12 Article  12/26/11 Article  12/21/11 Article  12/13/11 Article  11/4/11 Article  10/31/11 Article  10/17/11 Op-Ed	12/26/11 Article Eli Lehrer  12/21/11 Article Andrew Hanson, Zach Hawley  12/13/11 Article Matt Thoman  11/7/11 Article Elizabeth Lowell  10/31/11 Article Eli Lehrer	12/26/11 Article   Eli Lehrer   http://www.weeklystan dard.com/mortgaging-our-future/article/613475     12/21/11 Article   Andrew Hanson, Zach Hawley   from-the-mortgage-interest-deduction/article/6145   86     12/13/11 Article   Matt Thoman   https://www.aei.org/publication/why-unemployment-is-worse-than-you-think/   worse-than-you-think/     11/7/11 Article   Elizabeth   http://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-cure-for-the-housing-blues/article/604177     11/4/11 Article   Elizabeth   http://www.weeklystan dard.com/privatizing-the-liquor-market/article/607746     10/31/11 Article   Eli Lehrer   http://www.weeklystan dard.com/privatizing-the-liquor-market/article/507746     10/17/11 Op-Ed   Eli Lehrer   http://www.weeklystan dard.com/lets-start-all-over-again/article/595196	dard.com/la-gloire-de-   tonomie-   franaise/article/617346       12/26/11   Article   Eli Lehrer   http://www.weeklystan dard.com/mortgaging-   our-   future/article/613475       12/21/11   Article   Andrew Hanson, Zach Hawley   https://www.weeklystan dard.com/who-benefits-   from-the-mortgage-   interest-  deduction/article/6145   86       12/13/11   Article   Article   https://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-cure-for-   the-housing-  blues/article/604177       11/7/11   Article   Elizabeth   http://www.weeklystan dard.com/a-cure-for-   the-housing-  blues/article/604177       11/4/11   Article   Elizabeth   http://www.weeklystan dard.com/privatizing-   the-liquor-   market/article/607746       10/31/11   Article   Eli Lehrer   http://www.weeklystan dard.com/lets-start-all-   over-   again/article/595196       10/17/11   Op-Ed   Eli Lehrer   http://thehill.com/opini on/op-ed/188045-   zeroing-in-on-   simplifying-the-tax-	dard.com/la-gloire-de-    Iconomie     Iconomie     Iranaise/article/617346

		1	1	1	ı	
National Review	10/12/11	Article		http://www.nationalre view.com/corner/2799 12	Foreign Investment	"Increasing Foreign Investment, the Chicago Way"
American Action Forum	9/26/11	Article		https://www.american actionforum.org/insight /european-disunion/	Europe	"European Disunion"
American Enterprise Institute	9/22/11	Article	Matt Thoman	https://www.aei.org/p ublication/european- disunion-2/	Europe	"European Disunion"
The Weekly Standard	9/13/11	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/time-for-an- honest-accounting-of- our-disaster- budget/article/593142	Federal Budget	"Time for an Honest Accounting of Our Disaster Budget"
National Review	9/8/11	Article		http://www.nationalre view.com/corner/2766 89	Infrastructure	"Let's Have Infrastructure Investment, But the Right Kind"
National Review	9/6/11	Article		http://www.nationalre view.com/corner/2762 57	Economy	"Stimulus Still Creating Jobs?"
Regulation	9/1/11	Journal Article	Sam Batkins	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 1/9/regv34n3-2.pdf		"Obama, Ryan, and the Future of Regulatory Reform"
The Weekly Standard	8/15/11	Article	Benjamin Gitis	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/the- mortgage-interest- boondoggle/article/582 077	Mortgage	"The Mortgage Interest Boondoggle"
American Action Forum	8/6/11	Article		https://www.american actionforum.org/insight /the-downgrade-what- it-is-and-what-it-isnt/	Economy	"THE DOWNGRADE: WHAT IT IS AND WHAT IT ISN'T"
National Review	8/5/11	Article		http://www.nationalre view.com/corner/2738 59	Economy	"The Downgrade: What It Is And What It Isn't"

American Action	7/22/11	Article	Sam Batkins	https://www.american	Legislation	"Dodd-Frank Turns	
Forum	7,22,11	, a dele	Jam Backins	actionforum.org/insight /dodd-frank-turns-one/		One"	
American Action Forum	7/21/11	Article		https://www.american actionforum.org/insight /new-urbanism-isnt- going-to-save-the- economy-now-or- ever1/	Economy	"NEW URBANISM ISN'T GOING TO SAVE THE ECONOMY NOW OR EVER"	
American Action Forum	7/19/11	Article	Doug Holtz- Eakin, and Elizabeth Lowell	https://www.american actionforum.org/resear ch/how-reform-of-the- u-s-corporate-tax-code- can-create-short-and- long-term-ec/	Tax Reform	"HOW REFORM OF THE U.S. CORPORATE TAX CODE CAN CREATE SHORT- AND LONG-TERM ECONOMIC GROWTH"	
Regulation	7/1/2011	Book Review	Edward Glaeser	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 1/7/regv34n2-9.pdf	_	"Lure of the Big City"	Reviewed by Ike Brannon. Written by Edward Glaeser
Regulation	7/1/2011	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 1/7/regv34n2- 5.pdf#page=5	EPA	"Obfuscation at the EPA"	
American Action Forum	6/30/11	Article	Sam Batkins	https://www.american actionforum.org/resear ch/obfuscation-at-the- epa/	EPA	"Obfuscation At The EPA"	
American Action Forum	6/29/11	Book Review		https://www.american actionforum.org/insight /lure-of-the-big-city- reviewed-by-ike- brannon/	"Triumph of the City: How Our Greatest Invention Makes Us Richer, Smarter, Greener, Healthier, and Happier by Edward Glaeser 352 pages; Penguin Press, 2011"	"Lure Of The Big City"	

American  American  Enterprise	6/28/11		Willam Melick, Eric Andersen	actionforum.org/resear ch/employment-effects- of-reducing-capital- gains-tax-rates-in-ohio/	Tax Reform  Voter ID	"EMPLOYMENT EFFECTS OF REDUCING CAPITAL GAINS TAX RATES IN OHIO"  "The Upside of Voter ID Initiatives"	
Institute				voter-id-initiatives/		ID IIIIIIIIIII	
American Action Forum	6/14/11	Article		https://www.american actionforum.org/insight /a-different-route-to- redemption-for- anthony-weiner/	Anthony Weiner	"A DIFFERENT ROUTE TO REDEMPTION FOR ANTHONY WEINER"	
American Action Forum	5/17/11	Article		https://www.american actionforum.org/insight /blaming-the- speculators-and-other- fairy-tales/	Oil	"Blaming The Speculators And Other Fairy Tales"	
American Enterprise Institute	5/11/2011	Article		http://www.aei.org/pu blication/who-really- stands-to-win-in-the- union-fights/	Union	"Who Really Stands to Win in the Union Fights?"	
American Action Forum	5/1/2011	White Paper	Elizabeth Lowell	https://www.american actionforum.org/wp- content/uploads/sites/ default/files/Ex- lm%20Final%20Draft21 .pdf	Export-Import Bank	"Export-Import Bank: Obstacles and Options for Reform"	
The Weekly Standard	4/11/2011	Article	Sam Batkins	http://www.weeklystan dard.com/all-benefits- no- costs/article/556153	Federal Regulations	"All Benefits, No Costs"	
American Action Forum	4/1/2011	Article	Ken Solow	https://www.american actionforum.org/insight /the-disaster-playbook- for-investors/	Investing	"The Disaster Playbook For Investors"	

## Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 502-3 Filed on 11/06/20 in TXSD Page 150 of 160

The Weekly Standard	3/14/2011	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/what- happened-to-loebs- deli/article/552971	Economy	"What Happened to Loeb's Deli?"	
Regulation	6/4/2010	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/201 0/6/regv33n2-2.pdf	Snow Clearance	"When DC Freezes Over"	
The Weekly Standard	3/12/2010	Article		http://www.weeklystan dard.com/hop-aboard- the-nanny- train/article/422531	DC Metro	"Hop Aboard the Nanny Train"	
Cato Institute	1/1/2009	Policy Analysis	Chris Edwards	https://www.cato.org/ publications/tax-budget- bulletin/troubling- return-keynesianism	Keynesianism	"The Troubling Return of Keynesianism"	
Cato Journal	11/1/2008	Book Review	Richard H. Thaler and Cass R. Sunstein	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/cato- journal/2008/11/cj28n 3-12.pdf		"Nudge: Improving Decisions about Health, Wealth, and Happiness"	Reviewed by Ike Brannon. Written by Richard H. Thaler and Cass R. Sunstein
Regulation	6/1/2008	Book Review	Tim Harford	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/200 8/6/v31n2- inreview.pdf#page=8	Economics	"Yet Another Pop Econ Book"	Reviewed by Ike Brannon. Written by Tim Harford
Regulation	10/1/2007	Book Review	Amity Shlaes	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/200 7/10/v30n3- inreview.pdf#page=1		"FDR at Breakfast"	Reviewed by Ike Brannon. Written by Amity Shlaes

### 

Regulation	3/1/2006	Journal Article	Suzanne Stewart	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/200 6/3/v29n1- noted.pdf#page=4	Housing Bubble	"A Collapsing Housing Bubble?"	
Regulation	3/1/2006	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/200 6/3/v29n1-2.pdf	John Muth	"Remembering the Man Behind Rational Expectations"	
Regulation	12/1/2005	Book Review	Robert Hahn	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/200 5/12/v28n4- inreview.pdf#page=3	Economic Regulation	"Treating the Unserious Seriously"	Reviewed by Ike Brannon. Written by Robert Hahn
Regulation	12/1/2004	Journal Article		https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/200 4/12/v27n4-8.pdf	Life's Worth	"What Is a Life Worth?"	
Regulation	12/1/2002	Journal Article	Michael F. Gorman	https://object.cato.org/ sites/cato.org/files/seri als/files/regulation/200 2/12/v25n4-5.pdf	Economy	"How the Packers Lost Out"	

# Exhibit 22

#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS BROWNSVILLE DIVISION

STATE OF TEXAS, et al.,	
Plaintiffs, )	
v. )	Case No. 1:18-CV-68
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,	
Defendants,	
KARLA PEREZ, et al.,	
Defendant-Intervenors, ) and	
STATE OF NEW JERSEY,	
Proposed Defendant-Intervenor.	

### **DECLARATION OF MEG WIEHE AND MARCO GUZMAN**

We, Meg Wiehe and Marco Guzman, declare as follows:

1. We are tax policy experts employed by the Institute on Taxation and Economic Policy (ITEP). ITEP is a non-profit, non-partisan research organization that provides in-depth analyses on the effects of federal, state, and local tax policies. ITEP's mission is to ensure the nation has a fair and sustainable tax system that raises enough revenue to fund our common priorities, including education, health care, infrastructure, and public safety. ITEP researchers use a proprietary microsimulation tax model to produce analyses of current tax systems and proposed changes at the federal, state, and local level. That model uses a large sample of tax returns and other data to estimate the impact of tax systems and tax proposals on taxpayers at different income levels. This is the same type of tax model used by the U.S. Treasury Department, the Congressional

Joint Committee on Taxation, and the Congressional Budget Office, as well as by many state revenue departments. The ITEP model is updated several times a year to reflect current economic projections, incorporate the most recently available IRS Statistics of Income data, and to include changes enacted to state and federal tax law.

- 2. Meg Wiehe is the Deputy Executive Director of ITEP. She has worked with ITEP since 2010. She is a nationally recognized expert on state and local taxation, and she provides commentary on historical and current trends in state tax and budget policy. In particular, her analyses focus both on how tax and budget policies affect low- and moderate-income families and on how fiscal policies affect state and local governments' ability to fund basic public priorities, including education, infrastructure, and health care. She has conducted hundreds of revenue and distributional analyses of proposed tax changes in more than 40 states using ITEP's microsimulation tax model. She also is a lead author of ITEP's flagship report, *Who Pays? A Distributional Analysis of the Tax Systems in All Fifty States*. She holds a Master of Public Administration from the Maxwell School at Syracuse University and a Bachelor of Arts in Anthropology from the University of Virginia.
- 3. Marco Guzman has been a State Policy Analyst at ITEP since February 2020. He holds a Master of Public Policy from George Mason University and a Bachelor of Science in Human Communication from Arizona State University.
- 4. According to U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS), the agency that administers Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA), as of March 31, 2020, there were

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Davis, Carl, et al. *Who Pays? A Distributional Analysis of the Tax Systems in All 50 States, 6th ed.*, Institute on Taxation and Economic Policy, October 2018, *available at* www.whopays.org.

approximately 643,560 active DACA recipients.<sup>2</sup> The Migration Policy Institute (MPI), a non-profit, non-partisan think tank that analyzes the movement of people worldwide, estimates that an additional 682,440 individuals are eligible for DACA in 2020 but have not submitted DACA requests.<sup>3</sup>

- 5. We used the above USCIS and MPI estimates of the current population of DACA recipients and DACA-eligible individuals to estimate the annual aggregate state and local tax contributions of DACA recipients and DACA-eligible individuals.<sup>4</sup>
- 6. Undocumented immigrants eligible for or granted DACA pay state and local income, property, sales, and excise taxes. We estimate that the total DACA-recipient and DACA-eligible population contributes more than \$3 billion annually in state and local taxes. \$2.4 billion of that is from current DACA recipients. We used the following methodology to calculate the sales and excise, income, and property taxes of the DACA-recipient and DACA-eligible population.
- 7. A 2020 national survey of 1,157 DACA recipients found that 88.5 percent of respondents were employed. DACA recipients receive a temporary social security number, which allows them to file federal and state income taxes. They pay the same income taxes (in states with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, "Approximate Active DACA Recipients," *available at* https://www.uscis.gov/sites/default/files/document/data/Approximate%20Active%20DACA%20 Receipts%20-%20March%2031%2C%202020.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Migration Policy Institute provided these estimates to ITEP by request.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The DACA-eligible population refers here to the population eligible for DACA under the Department of Homeland Security memorandum entitled *Exercising Prosecutorial Discretion with Respect to Individuals Who Came to the United States as Children*, dated June 15, 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Tom Wong, *New DHS Policy Threatens to Undo Gains Made by DACA Recipients*, Center for American Progress (Oct. 5, 2020), *available at* https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/news/2020/10/05/491017/ new-dhs-policy-threatens-undo-gains-made-daca-recipients/.

income taxes) as other lawfully present individuals. In addition, they pay the same payroll taxes as other lawfully present individuals. Applying this employment rate to the March 2020 USCIS data regarding DACA recipients (cited in paragraph 4), we estimate that 569,436 DACA recipients are currently employed.

- 8. The national survey referenced in footnote 5 also found that prior to obtaining DACA only 45.3 percent of survey respondents were employed. Our analysis assumes an employment rate of 45.3 percent for the population of individuals who are eligible for DACA but who are not currently DACA recipients. Applying this employment rate to the estimated number of DACA-eligible immigrants who are not currently DACA recipients (based on the MPI data cited in paragraph 4), we estimate that 311,469 DACA-eligible immigrants are currently employed, separate and apart from the estimated 569,436 employed DACA recipients.
- 9. Immigrants' wages change depending on whether they are able to work legally. According to updated survey results from Tom Wong, Associate Professor of political science and Founding Director of the U.S. Immigration Policy Center at the University of California, San Diego, DACA-eligible workers earned an annual median wage of \$22,120 prior to receiving DACA. The survey respondents reported a new median annual wage of \$42,000 after they were granted DACA and were able to work legally.
- 10. Thus, we estimate that the median annual wage for working DACA recipients is \$42,000, and the median annual wage for the working DACA-eligible population is \$22,120.
- 11. Estimated effective tax rates (taxes as share of income) for sales, income, and property taxes paid by the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient population in each state were calculated as follows.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Center for American Progress, *supra* note 5.

- 12. ITEP's microsimulation tax model applies the state and local tax laws in each state (including sales, excise, income, and property tax laws) to a database of tax returns to generate estimates of the effective tax rates paid by taxpayers at various income levels under state and local tax law as it existed in 2018. In October of 2018, ITEP released the 6th edition of *Who Pays?*, which estimates the share of their income that taxpayers pay in state and local taxes, otherwise known as their effective tax rates. We use these data to estimate the state and local tax contributions of the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient populations in all 50 states.
- 13. We estimate that the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient populations contribute \$403.5 million in state and local income taxes annually. Our methodology is as follows.
- 14. DACA recipients are required to pay personal income taxes using a temporary social security number. Thus, this study assumes the 569,436 DACA-recipient workers are fully complying with their state and local personal income tax obligations.
- 15. Researchers have estimated that between 50 and 75 percent of undocumented immigrants currently pay personal income taxes.<sup>7</sup> This analysis conservatively assumes a 50 percent compliance rate for DACA-eligible immigrants who are not DACA recipients, and it assumes that there would be a 50 percent compliance rate for DACA recipients if DACA were rescinded and protections were lost. Effective personal income tax rates in each state were therefore applied to 50 percent of the estimated income for DACA-eligible residents who are not receiving DACA.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See, e.g., Wayne Cornelius & Jessica Lewis, Impacts of Border Enforcement on Mexican Migration: The View from Sending Communities (2007); Joel Feinleib & David Warner. *The Impact of Immigration on Social Security and the National Economy*, Social Security Advisory Board, Issue Brief No. 1, Dec. 2005.

- 16. We estimate that the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient populations contribute nearly \$918 million annually in state and local property taxes. DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient populations pay property taxes either directly as homeowners, or indirectly through higher rents as tenants. For renters, the ITEP model assumes that half of the cost of the property tax paid by rental property owners is passed through to renters, taking a conservative approach to the broad economic consensus that a portion of these taxes are passed through to renters in the form of higher rents.
- 17. We estimate that the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient populations contribute \$1.7 billion annually in state and local sales and excise taxes. Like anyone purchasing goods or services, the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient populations pay consumption taxes directly at the point of sale. This analysis assumes that DACA recipients and DACA-eligible individuals pay sales and excise taxes at similar rates to U.S. citizens and legal immigrants with similar incomes.
- 18. A useful way to compare taxes paid across income levels is the effective tax rate. This is the total of all taxes paid—income, property, and sales and excise—as a share of income. ITEP found the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient populations pay an average effective tax rate of 10 percent. ITEP's 2018 report, *Who Pays?*, found that the middle 20% of taxpayers pay on average an effective tax rate of 9.9 percent.<sup>8</sup> Thus, the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient populations pay state and local taxes at a similar rate to middle income taxpayers across the country.
- 19. We estimate that if DACA were rescinded, the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient populations would continue to contribute to state and local tax revenues, but at much

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Institute on Taxation and Economic Policy, *supra* note 1.

lower levels. If DACA recipients were to lose their DACA protections, we estimate a total annual loss of \$1.7 billion in state and local tax revenues. Our reasoning is as follows.

- 20. The DACA policy has the effect of increasing state and local tax contributions because the policy increases employment rates, average salaries, and compliance with state and local tax laws. Surveys of DACA recipients found that after being granted DACA, they were employed at higher rates and earned higher wages. This is likely because the work authorizations and deferral from deportation provided by DACA allow recipients to guard against wage theft by unscrupulous employers, secure more remunerative employment, and pursue advanced degrees. Thus, rescinding DACA would substantially reduce DACA recipients' tax contributions.
- 21. According to our analysis, every state tax revenue stream would be harmed by the loss of DACA protections. In New Jersey, 40,000 residents are eligible for or have been granted DACA, and we estimate that they are contributing \$79.1 million in state and local taxes, which represents an average effective tax rate of 9.4 percent. This includes \$1 million in state and local income tax, \$40 million in property tax, and \$38.1 million in sales and excise taxes. If DACA were rescinded, DACA recipients' contributions would decrease by \$35.5 million to \$45.6 million annually.
- 22. In Texas, 231,000 residents are eligible for or have been granted DACA, and we estimate that they are contributing \$517.6 million in state and local taxes, which represents an average effective tax rate of 10 percent. This includes \$145.6 million in property tax, and \$371.9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> ITEP used USCIS and MPI data and ITEP *Who Pays?* figures to calculate the estimates in paragraphs 21 and 22 for New Jersey and Texas. Our methodology for calculating these estimates mirrored that which we used to reach our national estimates cited above.

million in sales and excise taxes. If DACA were rescinded, DACA recipients' contributions would decrease by more than half to \$253.1 million annually.

23. For the foregoing reasons, according to our analysis and in our professional opinions, rescinding DACA would reduce the state and local tax contributions of the DACA-eligible and DACA-recipient population by almost half in New Jersey and Texas and by nearly \$1.7 billion annually nationwide. This would decrease state and local tax revenues and hurt state and local economies.

We declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of our knowledge.

Meg Wiehe

Marco Guzman